

## Identity(ies), Citizenship(s), and Migration: A Complex Relationship

Luiza Cortesão – Rosário Silva – Francisco Neves – Clara Vieira  
Paulo Freire Institute, University of Oporto – Portugal

### ABSTRACT

*This work aspires to contribute to a greater understanding of the complexity of the concepts: identity and citizenship. With this purpose, the circumstances of migrants' life that make people move to geographically distant locations, sometimes to very different cultural contexts of those where they initially lived in, subjecting them to violent socio-cultural processes of re-contextualization, were analysed. To what extent do these processes translate into acculturation, into changes in their identity? To what extent, when determined to seek out new ways of life, some fight for more or less close conditions to what can be considered citizenship? To what extent do the countries chosen, or that chance allowed them to choose as their destiny, provide them with the opportunity to assert themselves as citizens?*

*In this paper we will analyse the concepts of citizenship and identity, which will be updated and illustrated by many migrants' statements. As we shall see, these concepts allow for the reflection on social and cognitive justice.*

**Keywords:** *Migrants – Citizenship – Acculturation – Cognitive Justice*

### **Identità, cittadinanza(e) e migrazione: una relazione complessa**

*Questo lavoro intende contribuire a una maggiore comprensione della complessità dei concetti di identità e cittadinanza. A tale scopo si sono analizzate le circostanze della vita dei migranti che fanno sì che le persone si muovano in luoghi geograficamente distanti, a volte in contesti culturali molto diversi da quelli in cui inizialmente vivevano, sottoponendoli a violenti processi socio-culturali di ri-contestualizzazione. In che misura questi processi si traducono in acculturazione, in cambiamenti della loro identità? Quando siano determinati a cercare nuovi modi di vita, fino a che punto alcuni di loro lottano per ottenere condizioni più o meno prossime a ciò che può essere considerato cittadinanza? In che misura i paesi scelti, o quella opportunità che ha permesso loro di scegliere il proprio destino, offrono loro l'opportunità di affermarsi come cittadini? In questo articolo analizzeremo i concetti di cittadinanza e di identità, che verranno*

*aggiornati e illustrati attraverso dichiarazioni di molti migranti. Come si vedrà, questi concetti consentono la riflessione su una giustizia sociale e cognitiva.*

**Parole chiave:** *Migranti – Cittadinanza – Acculturazione – Giustizia cognitiva*

## Introduction

We are faced today with the intricate and uncertain times of late modernity. Due to the complexity of this context, there is an increasing need for critical reflection on the current meanings of concepts such as identity, citizenship, nationality and multiculturalism. Despite being aware of all this complexity, this work only aspires to contribute to a greater understanding of how identity and citizenship are experienced by migrants. To this end, we will provide illustrations, which derive from different field studies. The main contribution was obtained from an ethnography study that was developed with migrants in Guimarães, in preparing the “Guimarães 2012 European Capital of Culture”<sup>1</sup>. In addition to these illustrations and reflections, we will also use some data collected in the city of Porto as part of a migrant literacy project (Queiroz, 2010), as well as other interviews that were specifically conducted for the production of this text.

The statements collected throughout this work represent no more than a cluster of thoughts and occasional illustrations of what is happening in the world of those who migrate. No pretenses are made that the data presented constitutes a representative sample of what is happening at this level in the universes of those who stray from their land and their social and cultural roots.

### Why Portugal as the context of study?

This is the first issue to clarify. Due to its historical, political and economic circumstances, its size and geographical location, Portugal reveals itself to be a country with particularly suited characteristics to study migration and issues related to migrants.

Portugal has a historical tradition of “hopping” (“a salto”<sup>2</sup>). Portuguese people have experienced the departure of their own for centuries. This happened with the Crusades, the conquests and the “discoveries”. For many years, Portuguese people have migrated to South America, mainly to Brazil, to the colonies in Africa and Asia, to Canada, and to the United States of

America. More recently, in the last 50 and 60 years of the twentieth century, we often emigrated by “hopping”, especially to Europe, fleeing from hunger and the misery that was raging in a country ruled by a dictatorship. This anguish was accentuated by the Second World War. Later, with the beginning of the struggles for independence in the Portuguese colonies, many young Portuguese fled, also mainly to Europe, to prevent being mobilized for the wars that were fought there.

After the “Revolution of April” in 1974 in Portugal, which ended a dictatorship of almost 50 years, the “Portuguese Colonial Empire” also came to an end. Particularly since this time, new movements stirred in the opposite direction. Portuguese political refugees returned, as well as many people that were rooted in former colonies, as these were now independent countries where they felt they no longer had a place. Hounded by the difficult living conditions and also the wars that broke out in Mozambique, Angola and Guinea Bissau after independence, there was a strong migration flux of the inhabitants of these countries to Portugal.

In Portugal, however, living conditions were improving little by little. Portugal became particularly attractive, especially for citizens of former colonies. In the meantime having signed the Schengen Agreement, Portugal worked also like an open door for entry into Europe, especially for those who managed to acquire Portuguese nationality.

Later, there was the demise of the USSR and economic crises went on occurring in the late twentieth and early twenty-first century. It still was relatively easy to enter Portugal, in an Europe that was increasingly closed to immigrants. Yet another migration flux intensified, especially from Brazil, from Eastern Europe and even the Middle East. With a varying in intensity, emigration still continued, mainly to Europe, in a Portugal which plunged into the economic crisis, which is in fact currently felt and quite widespread.

With all this, Portugal presents itself today as a country which is simultaneously of both emigration and immigration. It is this diverse socio-cultural *patchwork* that places Portugal as a good setting to study issues experienced by migrants (Portuguese or not) as well as the characteristics that these experiences take.

### Who are the migrants who currently we live with in Portugal?

In Portugal, a very small country, we now live with migrants from many

parts of the world. For the reasons outlined above, we encounter those who came from farther or closer land and are looking to live (or survive) here.

We know from recent published data by the Foreigners and Borders Service (SEF), that by the end of 2010, roughly 445,262 foreigners lived in the national territory (SEF, 2011).

Foreign population who resides in Portugal: the ten most represented nationalities in 2010

	Country	Number	%
1	Brazil	119,363	26.81%
2	Ukraine	49,505	11.12%
3	Cape Verde	43,979	9.88%
4	Romania	36,830	8.27%
5	Angola	23,494	5.28%
6	Guinea-Bissau	19,817	4.45%
7	United Kingdom	17,196	3.86%
8	China	15,699	3.53%
9	Moldova	15,641	3.51%
10	São Tomé and Príncipe	10,495	2.36%

Source: Office for Foreigners and Borders (2011), Report on Immigration, Frontiers and Asylum – 2010.

This table illustrates quite well the diversity of the migration flux that shaped the panorama of immigration in Portugal, especially in the last three decades. In the top position, we find Brazilian citizens who now represent over one quarter of the foreign population resident in the country. Despite the current context of crisis that has contributed to a reduction of the migration flux, the growth tendency of this community remains. This is a phenomenon that occurs with greater intensity since the turn of the century (in the space of just a decade, between 2000 and 2010, the number of Brazilian citizens in our country has increased more than five times).

The countries of Eastern Europe, particularly Ukraine, but also Romania and Moldova, marked a reconfiguration of the immigration scene in Portugal at the beginning of the century. They are still well represented,

although this type of flux has come to suffer a decrease in recent years with the return of some of the citizens or the re-emigration to other EU countries. There is an exception with Romania, whose number of residents has been increasing substantially after the accession to the EU in 2007. They are the European Union Member State with the largest number of residents in the country, followed by the United Kingdom. Portuguese-speaking African countries continue to represent more than one fifth of the foreign population who reside in our country. Nearly half of this quota is composed of Cape Verde nationals. In terms of flows in Asia, it is China that stands out, having gained expression throughout the first decade of this century.

This growing diversity of geographical origins also reflects a growing diversification of the immigrants' profile. The fluxes of Eastern Europe are characterized by higher levels of education than the rest of the immigrant population. In parallel of labor migration, there is a migration of older people, coming from Northern Europe, especially United Kingdom, who choose Portugal to live the post-reform period (Pires, 2010: 48). In terms of labor we find communities that focus more on independent commercial activities (this is the case of Asian countries). Others find professional integration in the construction sector, in low-skilled services in the area of restaurants and hotels, but also in agriculture and industry (here we find immigrants from Africa, from Eastern Europe and from Brazil).

We also coexist with the Portuguese who emigrated in the 50s and 60s and have since returned, with Portuguese immigrants who return on holiday to "heal nostalgia" and to "spend Christmas with the family". In this group we find those who went through severe hardships to escape hunger. They were peasants, workers, many of them illiterate, who now often live with some wealth. We find those who are here now, but that once emigrated for political reasons and are often of more at ease social levels and usually with higher qualifications. More recently the country has gained an increasing expression for temporary emigration, a phenomenon which shows a greater movement between origin and destination.

#### Why choose migrants to study the concepts of identity and citizenship?

This is another question to clarify. There are people who, by their characteristics, can be identified as constituting especially favorable fields for the

study of certain phenomena. This is the case of the migrant population, for the study of identity and citizenship phenomena.

An example of this was also the case of what happened in previously developed projects, which intended to study educational problems<sup>3</sup>. In this situation, we had the same concern in choosing an appropriate field of work when we proceeded to the initial planning (cf. Cortesão, Stoer, 1996). It was the time to contribute to the analysis of problems between the requirements and educational offers of the traditional school institution and the socio-cultural diversity of populations that were present in schools in Portugal. We started from the hypothesis that part of the existing educational problems stemmed from the symbolic distance, sometimes almost impassable, which mediates between the cultures of minority groups, the knowledge that is valued and the curriculum requirements, officially and traditionally established in schools.

In this framework, we verify that Roma people are a group whose behavior is particularly appropriate for the analysis we intended to develop. It is actually a fairly closed group in itself. Within it there is usually no, great interest space, family or social pressure, in children attending school. With some difficulty the Roma children complete (or not) compulsory education. If this does happen in some cases, it is mostly because there are several legal mechanisms to exert some pressure in this direction, forcing them to go to class once in a while, an obligation they generally meet with lack of interest.

Hence what may happen is that either what the school offer in terms of educational activities can really interest those children (in which case they want to go to school), or they go to school in an irregular way, escaping the school institution: they miss classes, drop out, successively fail, do not learn. These are the circumstances that make the Roma children a group particularly suited and interesting for studies on the quality of education. Actually, the way children react is instantly revealing of whether or not school is working in the right direction, thus permitting the ones who critically analyse the process to refocus and rebuild the educational proposals. This was the result of the action research project referred above (cf. Cortesão & Stoer, 1996).

In a similar manner, migrants present themselves as a group with particularly favourable characteristics to the study of identity and citizenship. Of course, those who migrate are born throughout the world in diverse backgrounds and circumstances. In their contexts of origin, like all human

beings, they develop there, through socialization their own socio-cultural roots. Their own condition as migrants pushes them away, however, from their contexts of origin.

And why do people migrate? They migrate more frequently for socio-economic reasons. They also migrate due to restlessness, the desire to experience new places and/or new work situations. They migrate because they face problems of political, cultural and/or religious nature. Not satisfied with what their own country had to offer them, many migrants left in search of better living conditions. They left not resigned to the extreme poverty of the contexts in which they lived in. That is what they verbalize with great clarity:

Those, those verses that came on the television one of these days from António Aleixo, Manuel Alegre said something about it on the television, he said ... and at that time it was really true! "The bread left over from the rich/ This is what I have to say/ You could end the poor's hunger with it/ And still give some bread away." Do you know it? It says ... those who are considered poor are rich compared to forty years ago. It was the war, it was some people fleeing from here, to France, in hunger, in poverty, in political persecution ... (António, former political migrant in France).

The boss where we lived as a caretaker wanted me to make him a reservation of a vine that he had [...]. I said, OK, let's see. I did it for two years. ... It was a miserable year... in the month of March a layer of snow came ahead that burned everything. I said, "I'm screwed with my life!". After, there was also bad luck at home. We had a pig to raise, everything went under the ground. My mother in law gives me a female, it also dies. Then, after that, a lady lent me the money, to buy, I bought a piglet in the city. After, when I saw that it was not working, shows up the emigrating story (João Silva, 80 years old, former migrant in France, country where he "leaped" in 1962).

I worked in the business of footwear, except that the company closed ... and we talked and decided to give a direction to our lives because we had a house, we had asked for a loan and we thought it was time to give a new direction to our life and emigrate (José Carlos, 36 years old, former emigrant in Switzerland).

I left because I was without work for a year and a half, and had a son to support! His father helped, obviously he helped, just that ... my mother only got a bit, didn't get much, she's a civil servant in Brazil ... received little, we lived in a house that we were in, we are still paying for the house there in Brazil [...] So I went out so I could

help my mother out, so we could finish paying our house [...] and also to give a better life for my son (Maria, 28 years old, Brazilian migrant living in Portugal for a year and a half).

The restlessness, the desire to learn new things, to broaden horizons is, as an example, shared by Henrique and Cristina:

I was more on the basis of experience and of adventure and, like, OK, I already had a friend there [...] It was like, OK, between friends. I had a friend there, OK, two or three friends, after we talked, then the idea of emigrating, leaving home, getting to know and [...] it was going out, to see, to know [...] (Henrique, migrated to the UK at 22).

I worked in the ready-to-wear industry, I was a seamstress, but how can I explain this to you? I guess I wanted more ... wanted more for myself, I think it was just too little for me. Here there was no chance for us to widen. It was ready-to-wear industry or a factory, nothing more (Cristina, 41 years old, a former immigrant, lived 11 years in France).

The political conditions that led many to seek refuge in different countries have been reported in several reports: this is the case of José Mário:

[...] the main reason was a refusal to be a part of the Colonial War. Knowing that within days or weeks I'd be getting called to military service... and being, as I was, "burned" politically, as the phrase went at the time – I'd already been imprisoned by the PIDE [the state political police], etc. – I knew what was coming and I knew it would be much harder for me to desert after that than before.

[I escaped] as a tourist, using the last days on a passport that had already been used for leaving the country. [I left] without a document that was mandatory for young men at a military age which was called a military license. But I profited from the fact that on June 10<sup>th</sup> [a national holiday] the border police, which was also the PIDE, went easy on the crowd of Portuguese that came and went shopping from Porto and the North of the country to Vigo [a town near the border, in Spain].

[...] I went sort of in disguise, inside a car with a family, a grandmother, a newborn baby girl, some cousins and whatnot. I was one of the passengers in a car, on the back seat, with a baby girl on my lap... and the cousin who was driving quickly flashed the passports to the PIDE man on the border... Or maybe he just showed them the ID cards, because on that day there really was an amnesty on the border traffic. So the family went to Vigo to shop, and come lunchtime I was on a plane to Madrid, and from there I took the Sud Express train to Paris. The passport expired two days later (José Mário Branco, 65 years old, ex-political emigrant in France).

In the previous statements the reasons that encouraged people to migrate are clearly stated. So, they escape from danger, persecution, the poor living conditions, hunger, and extreme poverty sometimes. They move to more or less distant places where they think they will have better and more interesting living conditions, such as Jose Carlos, a former emigrant in Switzerland, said in a simple and direct manner: "We are all following the same thing, which is to have a better life [...]"

It turns out that often these places are quite unlike anything to which they are used to until then. Integrating better or worse, with more or less suffering, they try to find ways to address problems that led them to distance themselves from their roots. They seek work, they try to survive and/or live. This suffering is very explicitly expressed in the speech of many:

Because I lost a lot of weight when I went there... It is because the work was very hard and the food – not that I lacked anything! Because I didn't lack anything – just that I did not adapt very well to that kind of food (José Carlos, 36 years old, former migrant in Switzerland).

I found it very difficult [to adapt]. The biggest thing was the cold and missing the family, of course! (Fabiano, 29 years old, Brazilian immigrant in Portugal for six years).

JC: It was also hard because in those first four and a half months we did not sleep there in the hotel, we slept in the villa. It was better for her because she always left at six pm ...

C: But I had to walk down too ... half hour walk, with the cold, right? It was very cold!

JC: Sometimes I would get down on foot, others I found transport. [...] And sometimes I would finish at midnight, one o'clock, two o'clock in the morning and I had to walk down there... It is a very beautiful mountain, it is, but ...

C: It is very beautiful!

JC: Sometimes we look at the mountain and we think it's a painting, that it is not real. At night it looks just like a painting. I went down there, I looked and I: "What am I doing here?". And this was very hard.

C: Yes, it was very hard.

(José Carlos and Camila, former emigrants in Switzerland)

The only regret I have in Ukraine [is] my job. [...]. I've said I have a master degree in Mathematics, I had eleven years of school teaching. It's the only thing that makes me sad ... I've said, I live in ignorance, I am forbidden to think about my life, about

my parents ... well if life does not work, it does not work (Anna, Ukrainian, 40 years old, lives in Portugal since 2001, has always worked in unskilled jobs).

On one occasion, I said... we would go there [to the grocery store], I wanted sugar, dammit ... "How will we ask for sugar?" We wanted eggs ... The Italian, he would say: "You do as I did. When you want sugar, you do like this." [Mimics the gesture] And there she came [...] Zucker. "And eggs?" "Say, Eir, chi-chi-chi ri!" [Mimics the gesture of a hen to lay eggs] Look, and it was like this, at the beginning, that we sorted ourselves out [...] There was money and we didn't know how to ask. [...] We had great difficulty finding Portuguese food there. For example, the cod was difficult. For the cod, we had to walk, we had to make it come from Spain, by a Spaniard who lived far away and had a market. So then we would get in the car and went there to buy Spanish things, which are similar to the Portuguese. And then in weekends, all hungry, for a potato stew or a chicken rice or something like that. (Alberto, 85 years old, emigrated in Germany for 19 years).

I realized that people here are a bit closed. [...] People here do not communicate... they don't communicate, you know, face to face, they don't talk; It is more on the mobile phones, the internet ... I don't know if it's because Portugal is already more advanced than Cape Verde in terms of technology – maybe it is, it is a fact or not, I don't know – but I see that with it people don't talk much face to face. And in Cape Verde there is still a lot of it. It is also smaller, people run into each other more. [...] In the early days there, no, but about from a year ago, I was feeling homesick, really missed it! Here it only rained, man! ... I would get up, rain, rain, rain, ey ...! In Cape Verde you get up ... you do not even get up, man, and it is the sun that wakes you up (Milton, Cape Verde, 25 years old).

In the beginning when our community came here to work, they missed a lot of things. First: the language. Second: don't know the laws. Third: had no friends. Fourth: had no church, or the religious side, like ... like, for example, a Portuguese that emigrated [to] Canada or England, it's the same, it's the same (Sergei, Ukraine, lives in Portugal since 2002).

Perplexed by the customs, climate, language, food and work rate, people yearn for their family and their land. In any case, the circumstances of life do sometimes make them move to geographically distant locations, sometimes to very different cultural contexts of those where they initially lived in. Hence, they are subjected to violent socio-cultural processes of re-contextualization. To what extent do these processes translate into acculturation, into changes in their identity? To what extent, and how, does the socialization that they are submitted to at this already adult stage, articulate, merge,

overlap and/or collide with the cultural roots that initially structured their *habitus* (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1970)? To what extent, when determined to seek out new ways of life, do some fight for more or less close conditions to what can be considered citizenship? To what extent do the countries chosen, or that chance allowed them to choose as their destiny, provide them with the opportunity to assert themselves as citizens?

As stated above, the results of all these constraints experienced by migrants are that which makes them a particularly interesting group to study issues of identity and citizenship.

### Identity and Citizenship

In this article (as mentioned previously) we will only analyze the concepts of citizenship and identity, which will be updated and illustrated by many migrants' statements. As we shall see, these concepts allow for the reflection on social and cognitive justice.

We may start by mentioning that citizenship is a concept traditionally defined in relation to the membership to a community, with a particular legal and political framework. Therefore it implies the existence of rights, responsibilities, duties and benefits that this member may enjoy and/or demand in the context of that community.

Identity is a concept that is shaped within relational situations. Identity does not imply, as citizenship does, a legal-political basis. It implies the recognition of similarities and differences in oneself and in others.

What is proposed now is a reflection that contextualizes, upgrades and goes beyond these traditional definitions. It also offers an illustration that may contribute to the deepening of the concept, by clarifying the results from that same illustration.

### Identity

Stuart Hall argues that "the old institutions that for so long stabilized the social world, are in decline, giving rise to new identities and fragmenting the world until now unified" (Hall, 1992: 1). He distinguishes three different conceptions of identity: i) set from the subject of the Enlightenment, "based on the human person as an individual, fully centered, unified, endowed with capacity to act, conscience and reason, whose 'center' consisted of an inner core" [...] that "remained essentially the same" [...] "throughout



its existence” (ibid: 2); ii) the sociological subject that already “knew that this was not an autonomous inner core” [...] “but was formed in relations with other significant people” [...] that mediated the “culture of the world he inhabited” (ibid: 2); iii) he argues that, more recently, “the universe itself, through which we design our cultural identities became temporary, variable and problematic” (ibid: 2). Therefore, he states that the “fully unified, complete, safe and coherent identity is a fantasy” (ibid: 2).

We will now refer to this concept as it will be within late modernity, as something in which “we are confronted by a bewildering multiplicity of possible identities, with each one of which we can identify, at least temporarily” (ibid: 2). Still referring to Hall, “cultural identity is not something fixed, not a transcendental and universal essence” (Hall, 2006).

It is well known that identity is an ongoing process of structuring through the socialization that, very early, will be taking place in family and in the group of belonging. Admitting with Hall that identity is not a fixed essence, it is pertinent to question the effects on identity of the strongly impressing situations that happen along the pathways of life. By their nature, the life experiences of emigrants are dramatically diverse. These situations, through the meaning they assume, might mark their identity.

The relational character of identity, as well as the fact that it is something “temporary”, “variable”, with a “bewildering multiplicity of possible identities with each one of which we can identify, at least temporarily” mentioned by Hall, are well illustrated by a number of statements that were gathered.

Laryssa, 27 years old, Russian, for example, said:

When you live in a place for long, when [you] get used to [a] lot, as well ... these habits begin to stick, here, in your mind... and there you go there [home country] and you already are from another planet. And you stay there as a foreigner because you have already... if life is different, there you took [a] small world from here to there, of course you feel there a little like a foreigner. And so for me there are no more borders. I will survive [in] any place, I'm not afraid. So in this case, sometimes, I think we're better because we survive anywhere.

Leonor, a young Brazilian woman who works in higher education in the UK, having also studied in Germany, began by stating:

Of my identity I would immediately say I am Brazilian. But when I go back to Brazil, I do not feel Brazilian. It is as if the identity was always defined 'against'.

Later, on her written statement, she developed this issue further:

... the identity occurs in the relationship and in the difference. I'm not German, I'm not Brazilian, and I'm not English. [...] In conclusion I am a little bit of everything but nothing in full. [...] So, being and not being defines me as Leonor.

Camila, José Carlos and Carla Mariana report:

When I arrived in Portugal, when I came on vacation, I came here, I could not have a chat with my friends. I did not know what to talk about. [...] And it was already noticeable, when we came here on vacation our roots here were already... my colleagues and all, was just a little farther. [...] And we had no such complicity, we already had that separation (Camila, former emigrant in Switzerland).

I had the habits ... I was creating habits as theirs: we had no television in the kitchen, because at lunch or dinner they do not watch television a lot, and I did the same. These are habits that are created because a person then begins to live with these people and we follow... and I think it's a good example! (Mariana, 40 years old, former emigrant in Switzerland, where she lived for 10 years).

And I went there at about 19 years old and, of course, that's where I lived. It was there that I got used to, where I later married. I had my daughters, then, they were born there, made my life there! I got used to it there, love the Swiss mentality, although many people talk very badly about it, but I happen to love it. And that was it. Then there is that, we spent 20 years there (Carla, a former emigrant in Switzerland).

António, who fled to France for political reasons, explains well the relational dimension of identity, without, however, losing a strong connection to his country of origin. He particularly emphasizes the enrichment felt during the interaction with people from all over the world.

But there was one thing, without nationalism, without being ... or without wanting to use the word patriot, isn't it? All that... had a passion for my country and it has always existed within me.

There is another learning experience for me that is superior to all, that is the human contact. Have you imagined, talking to men from black Africa, former colonies of France, speaking with black people from the Caribbean regions, such as Martinique, Guadeloupe and Reunion, talking to individuals, for example, from Tunisia, Algeria, Morocco, talking with ... met two or three Turks, from Turkey. Talk to a Soviet, who was part of aviation and was arrested. Bombed and all, fell, was arrest-

ed. [...] Getting to know people of very varied regions of France, this is richness... of various Spanish regions... [...]

I was just passing there, you see? I was passing by, participating and everything...

[...] I consider France, for this sum of factors, my second home. I was always very, very well received, very welcomed.

It is very interesting to note in these statements as there are differently expressed forms of this “withdrawal” that seems to provoke re-contextualizations by changing the roots of identity. In the expression of identity that takes place in these testimonies, it can be seen that it varies, evidently, with the dominance of Portuguese, therefore, the fact that the population questioned is emigrant or immigrant. This also differs even if Portuguese is the mother tongue, with the more or less elaborate code people have. This often relates to the habit of reflecting and orally translating personal feelings. This ability is more common in social groups whose identity is structured as part of an erudite culture.

### **Citizenship**

As mentioned previously, citizenship is traditionally defined as a concept that is related to a given legal and political framework. This framework sets out and explains better or worse the rights, duties and responsibilities of those who belong to it, those who are members. It appears that in the complex historical, political and economic environment in which we find ourselves now, it was not only the previously mentioned concept of identity that has been affected. In fact, membership has been progressively more complex. For example, in Portugal one can be, at least, a Portuguese citizen but also a European citizen. Kostakopolou explains that “the new citizenship is related to a new social movement” and that currently each person is “a member of multiple communities structured at different levels, which overlap and interact strategically.” (Kostakopolou, 2001)

In his text “Human rights in post-modernity”, Boaventura de Sousa Santos alerts to a situation that is particularly interesting. He noted that, historically, there was an attempt to conquer first the 1st generation rights (civil and political rights) and later the 2nd generation (social and economic rights) and 3rd generation (cultural, post-materialist “annunciators of alternative life styles”). Referring to the current conditions, he states: “it is not possible to think about and struggle for human rights in a sequential man-

ner, first for the civil and political rights, then for the social and economic rights [...] We cannot wait for the consolidation of civil and politics rights and only after struggle for economic and social rights. We are forced to a historical short circuit, a simultaneous struggle against domination, exploitation and alienation, which confers a particular complexity to the strategy of human rights...” (Santos, 1989:10)

A changing process of identity and an idea of a shared, non-compartmentalized, open, citizenship seem sometimes to hybridize, creating something new, something that goes beyond the traditional concepts of citizenship or identity. This is most likely to happen in contexts which are extremely tense, emotional and charged with meaning. That is what José Mário’s statement seems to reveal.

[Until May ’68] the Portuguese political expatriates, at least those in the Paris area, were absolutely closed on themselves, almost absolutely closed on their shells. They lived with each other. Their conflicts were with each other, their affinities were with each other. There was no permeability to the French society around us. We had vague acquaintances from our jobs, but we didn’t have any French friends, not friends for real. May ’68, at least on my case, tore all those barriers apart [...] (José Mário Branco).

If we assume that citizenship is to be structured in a way that should lead to a growing emancipation, it will be interesting to try to identify, in the collected statements, which rights appear as priority for migrants, which are at least verbalized by them, and which are claimed for in contexts that are so different and at times so hostile, from those where they have their roots. Do they verbalize/prioritize the enjoyment of civil and political rights, social and economic rights or to cultural rights? Do they aspire to what is now called “diasporas citizenship” and to global citizenship? These are aspects that will be interesting to try to identify in the speeches of the interviewees.

In the interviews, the non-resignation does not always translate in the claim for rights. Here and there it was possible to identify not only more or less painful references to the enjoyment (or not) of citizenship rights but also to the “short circuit” of those referred by Sousa Santos.

Issues relating to political rights are referred to by Anna (Ukraine), for example: “I got Portuguese nationality [...] I got it, I have citizenship card, except I lost mine, I am not Ukrainian anymore”.



Eduarda, 32 years old, who came from Guinea-Bissau, in a discussion that took place in regards to the importance or lack of importance to vote in Portugal, laments: “I would like to ... but I can’t”.

The same says Nando, 28 years old, Angolan: “I do not vote, I am not Portuguese”.

In her turn Gabriela, 69 years old, Brazilian, explicitly denies her interest in participating in the Portuguese political life: “They are white ... they understand each other”.

However, Ricardina, 43 years old, Brazilian, says with obvious pride: “I just can’t vote for the presidency, but in local elections and all I can. I have all the rights that any Portuguese citizen has, by equality status” (Queiroz, 2010, p. HHH)

Laryssa, 27 years old, a Russian woman coming from Kazakhstan, and Milton, from Cape Verde, point out limitations felt by immigrants in access to social and economic rights which they consider fundamental:

Most [Eastern European immigrants] come here with education, even higher education, and giving opportunities for these people to try to enter to the area they come from. Because they do manage, as they did with nurses, doctors, some did. But there are few areas [in which] our immigrants can enter, where they are let in, OK. To try ... OK, I will not say politics, they will not let them enter politics, but in America, the United States, any, black politician ... they let in, [...] But at least letting in [...] And this does not mean they’ll steal jobs. Nobody steals, whoever wants to work, works. If, for example, a Portuguese and a Ukrainian enter [a job], they have equal training, they have the opportunity [to] show who is better. If the Portuguese is better, he is better, if the Ukrainian is better, he is better. But there was [would] no longer depend on ... there was [would] not be that discrimination: “You are Ukrainian, you’re done ...” or “you are Russian”. To give opportunity... (Laryssa).

We have to change it, we have to change it because it’s not fair, man! It is really not fair because I stop to think, to this day the Portuguese, the English, French, Americans, anyone goes to Cape Verde is received like a king, despite all that has happened before. People seem to have forgotten. People are received like kings, like a king! I came here; I am received worse than a dog? I did not understand, I ... my biggest difficulty was that. Why do I receive them well in my country and come here and they treat me worse than they treat a dog? [...] I come here no one cares about me and on top of that I’m victim of... a victim of racism, victim of prejudice, stereotypes, and [faced with] difficulties to get work, difficulties to get colleagues to do group work, teachers who look sideways at you ... immediately trying to cre-

ate characteristics about you, about your education that you had just because you lived in a country that supposedly is poorer than Portugal, you have no condition of education ... (Milton).

It is the same Milton who claims for extended cultural rights, in addition to social rights – in this case, the immigrants’ rights – when he presents the idea of creating an association in Guimarães, which would allow them for an active civic participation:

Man, I, my idea is one thing really... of course at the beginning it has to be something small, depending on the people willing to help. [...] It was to create a community, a network of immigrant communities. No matter the country ... even a hard core one. Because I think the social issue of immigrants is a very serious issue and few people, [...] the politicians, they do not speak of that. Nothing at all! And they are always on TV air time, wasting time, always talking about the same, they can’t even understand each other ... And the question of immigrants nobody talks! People ... almost nobody wants to know how migrant people live, how they are to integrating, do they have enough money to pay for the whole month ... Learn the feeling of these people, because the fact that they are not Portuguese does not mean they are not human beings. [...]

And this need is ... only if you are an immigrant can you realize this, to know even if there is the need to create this community. [...] Because we have an association of immigrants we will have access to much information that will be useful to them. Maybe we’d get more in touch with the embassies, the very country of origin, namely the time of the leaders’ visits, get people to contact and discuss issues – the problem of integration, labor rights, everything. In addition to the cultural wealth that would be created there because there would be people mingling from everywhere! And that is our goal to gather all these people towards achieving goals for themselves... for them, for the Portuguese society and the community itself.

The awareness of the right to global citizenship is also evident in the speeches of Maria, Ricardina and Milton:

And his son, all the children were playing, and his son just came up to my son and gave him a slap in the face. My son took it and returned. It is normal when children are fighting. And he came up to me and said: “Oh, you came to other people’s land to do stupid things”. I decided, I got to him and said, “Look, I’m sorry, but the land is not yours! All of us, the whole world is of the whole of us.” (Maria, 28 years old, Brazil).

Once, I had a person who abused a young Angolan girl and I defended her. “You

defend her because she is of the same race as you.” “No, I defend her because she is a human being and you do not have the right to do this to her, chase out the girl, she is not an animal. And even if she was an animal, an animal, you neither treat a beast like that.” (Ricardina, 42 years old, Brazil) (Queiroz, 2010).

But the thing is that my dreams are not restricted to one place. My dreams are always... me as a worthy human being; it is society, in the place where I am, having the best possible quality of life ... it is the country, the continent, it is the world... the human being in itself, all species. And see it all, the very nature, be better than today. So (laughs) it's a very comprehensive thing. (Milton, 25 years-old, Cape Verde, a student at the University of Minho).

### Final remarks

Arrived at this moment when we are reflexively faced with these cases of “withdrawal”, of suffering, but also of non-resignation to adverse conditions by migrants, it is compulsory to recognize that doubts and questions increased. “All of us, the whole world is of the whole of us”. This is the bold and naive utopia advocated by Maria, when people accused her son of “doing something stupid” in the “land of others”. Although she has suffered emotionally during her entire difficult life and on her own body, is she aware of how much the world today is not really of all of us? Is she conscious of the strength of the powers of who currently decides, who are the human beings that may or may not enjoy what the world offers?

Migrants are, as we know and we have just seen, subjected to violent processes of social and cultural re-contextualization. That is why trying to penetrate in changes of identity and in the difficulties to achieve citizenship for migrants opens the door to further reflect on problems with political and social (in)justice. Can there be social justice without a “cognitive justice” (Chan-Tiberghien, 2004) going against the threatening homogenizing epistemicide<sup>4</sup> (Santos, 2006, chapter 13<sup>th</sup>) desired and advocated by the dominant cultures?

These are the kind of questions that make it so interesting to reflect upon what happens to those who migrate in search of better living conditions.

For what concerns us Europeans, while dramatic inequalities between north/south, east/west continue to exist, while this old continent continues to be falsely conceived as an Eldorado, a place of wealth, we may close borders and try to build it into an “European fortress”; we can watch the

beaches and create refugee camps where they pile on the ones coming, yet migrations will continue. Contacts, crosses and hybridizations will persist.

In what direction do we walk? In a direction that will lead to successive epistemicide acculturations? Will it happen little by little a growing interbreeding, what we call “criolization” from cultures of the old continent? Will the two phenomena happen simultaneously? What then for the European identity?

We leave these questions for further reflection.

### References

- Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J. (1970). *La reproduction. Eléments pour une théorie du système d'enseignement*. Paris: Editions de Minuit.
- Chan-Tiberghien, J. (2004). Towards a ‘Global Educational Justice Research Paradigm: Cognitive Justice, Decolonizing Methodologies and Critical Pedagogy. *Globalization, Societies and Education*, 2(2), 191-213.
- Cortesão, L., Stoer, S., Casa-Nova, M. J., & Trindade, J. (2005). *Pontes para outras viagens. Escola e comunidade cigana: Representações recíprocas*. Porto: ACIME.
- Cortesão, L. & Pinto, F. (1995). *O povo cigano: Cidadãos na sombra – Processos explícitos e ocultos de exclusão*. Porto: Ed. Afrontamento.
- Cortesão, L. & Stoer, S. (1996). Projects, pathways, synergies in the field of inter/multicultural education: Final report. Porto: C.I.I.E.-F.P.C.E.U.P.
- Hall, S. (2001). *A identidade cultural na pós-modernidade*. Rio de Janeiro: DP&A Ed.
- Hall, S. (2006). Cultural Identity and Diaspora. In J. Evans & A. Manner (Eds.), *The rising diaspora* (pp. 233-249), Malden, MA: Blackwell.
- Kostakopoulou, T. (2001). *Citizenship, identity and immigration in the European Union – Between past and future*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Modood, T. (2007, 16 May 2007). Multi-culturalism, citizenship and national identity. [http://www.opendemocracy.net/faitheurope\\_islam/multiculturalism\\_4627.jsp](http://www.opendemocracy.net/faitheurope_islam/multiculturalism_4627.jsp), retrieved in 07.09.2011.
- Pires, R. P. (ed.) (2010). *Portugal: Atlas das migrações internacionais*. Lisboa: Tinta da China.
- Queiroz, A. (2010). *No cruzamento de múltiplas exclusões*. Porto: E.S.E Paula Frassinetti (masters thesis, mimeo).

Santos, B. S. (1989). Os direitos humanos na pós-modernidade. *Oficina do CES, 10*, Coimbra (policopiado).

Santos, B. S. (2006). *A Gramática do Tempo – Para uma Nova Cultura Política*. Porto: Ed. Afrontamento.

SEF/Departamento de Planeamento e Formação (Núcleo de Planeamento). Oeiras, [http://sefstat.sef.pt/Docs/Rifa\\_2010.pdf](http://sefstat.sef.pt/Docs/Rifa_2010.pdf), retrieved in 08.09.2011.

**Luiza Cortesão** is an Emeritus Professor of Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences, University of Porto. She is involved in national and international research, action-research, intervention and training projects, particularly in African countries that express in Portuguese, mainly in the areas that relates to the relationship of school with different cultures.

Contact: [luizacortesao@gmail.com](mailto:luizacortesao@gmail.com)

**Rosário Silva** holds a degree in Sociology by Faculty of Literature, University of Porto. She has worked in community projects, mostly with young people in disadvantaged areas and immigrants. She is a trainer in the area of immigration and intercultural issues. She currently works for Guimarães 2012 European Capital of Culture, as a research fellow at Instituto Paulo Freire de Portugal.

**Francisco Neves**, holds a master in Portuguese History of Art, by Faculty of Literature, University of Porto. He published papers about Portuguese medieval art and architecture. Currently, he works as a research fellow for Guimarães 2012 European Capital of the Culture, at Instituto Paulo Freire de Portugal.

**Clara Vieira**, holds a master in Psychology by Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences, University of Porto. She worked in Community Psychology projects. She worked as a research fellow for Guimarães 2012 European Capital of the Culture, at Instituto Paulo Freire de Portugal.