PLACE Branding Through Public Transport
Towards an integrative approach – case studies

ESTÉFANNY MENDONÇA MACÁRIO

Dissertação submetida para satisfação parcial dos requisitos do grau de
Mestre em Planeamento e Projecto Urbano

Assinado de forma digital por
ÁLVARO FERNANDO DE OLIVEIRA COSTA
Dados: 2020.10.28 10:41:18 Z

Orientador: Professor Doutor Álvaro Fernando de Oliveira Costa

SETEMBRO DE 2020
To my dearest mother, the source of all my strength.

“If so few female geniuses are found in history, it is because society denies them any means of expression.”
Simone de Beauvoir
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am forever grateful for all the love and support from my family, my life partner Paulo and friends, the ones that keep inspiring me to move beyond my capabilities to achieve my dreams and goals, and for their presence in my life I feel blessed and thankful.

During the development of this work my mother fought and recover from cancer, showing me the inner strength of our love and constant support, and I couldn’t be here presenting this work without her affection, and for that, I am especially thankful. I would also like to thank my father, my stepfather and siblings for believing and encouraging me in all my paths and choices.

I would like to thank especially the love, friendship and encouragement of my life partner Paulo, who not only believe but accepted to walk with me during all this process and the many more to come.

I would like to thank my professor and dissertation advisor Álvaro Costa for the constant efforts to understand my ideas and support me through the development of this work, and for all the knowledge shared in the process.

Appreciating my family heritage, I would like to all the powerful women in my family, that is a constant reminder that I can be more than the social construction allows us to be, and paved the way for me to reach where I am.
ABSTRACT

The reduced barriers to the flow of information, money, and people conceived the idea that places would lose relevance and power. However, through the incentive of competitiveness among areas attempting to build the environment for distinction, the opposite occurred, and territories are even more important than 20 years ago, positioning itself to attract inward investment, events, and creative people. Over this scenario, a new theory is developed from the corporate appropriations of the concept, the idea of place branding, which is the response to management and development of the international image and notoriety of these geographical sites.

Through global information, every place's natural reputation expands effortlessly nowadays, consequently place branding is the active management of this representation that is often associated with a vision, culture, and image as a toolkit to produce the final result to be delivered, although, the literature progressed far beyond these limited ideas with regards to the practice of place branding. Therefore, place branding acts as a strategic tool in shaping the environment, whether with flagship projects or important events, contributing to the shape and structure of the local identity.

From this understanding, this work seeks to fill the gap in the research that repeatedly scholars and practitioners disregard. The neglection of spatial complexities when attempting to embrace the concept from marketing tools in the operation for places reduces the scope and the applicability of branding elements. Therefore, integrating the place branding’s perspective through public transport symbols and service perceptions means tackling the theory with tangibility and acknowledging urban leadership. In order to address the challenges of the future within our cities, the relevance of this aspect with public transportation is recognizing that the digital era deemed central to develop and structure the cities of tomorrow, thus, an effort in discussing strategies to tackle the move towards less private cars and more soft forms of commute while addressing the image of what these cities aim to construct.

The case studies among the city of Sydney, Porto and Medellín is used as an instrument to understand the effects of the place branding, recognizing that every place holds the image in the collective perception, these three cities hold relevance regarding the dimension of the international positioning. Once Sydney is considered a global city, Medellín faces the challenges with a bad reputation. Hence, the analysis shows that the public transports brands benefit from connecting with the identity of the place and can even endorse the elements that shape the image of the city. Admittedly this addresses the amplitude of the debate with regards to the path towards the smart cities, for instance, confirming the need for an integrative approach between place branding and the elements that shape the planning system, such as the public transport.

KEYWORDS: place branding, public transport, city competitiveness, urban identity, place management.
RESUMO

A redução de barreiras para o fluxo de informação, dinheiro e pessoas produziu a ideia de que lugares perderiam relevância e poder a partir do movimento relativo a globalização e a atenuação das fronteiras. Entretanto, através do incentivo a competitividade entre sítios empenhando-se em fornecer o ambiente que favorecesse a distinção em detrimento de outros lugares, o contrário ocorreu, e lugares são mais expressivos que 20 anos atrás, mediante ao posicionamento no objetivo de atrair investimentos internos e externos, eventos e pessoas criativas, por exemplo. No desenvolver deste cenário, um novo fundamento foi elaborado a partir de apropriações de um conceito corporativo, a ideia de place branding, que representa uma resposta a promoção e gerenciamento da imagem e notoriedade internacional de lugares.

Mediante o caráter global de informações, toda reputação inerente aos sítios se extende e propaga-se sem qualquer empecilho, consequentemente o place branding se caracteriza pela gestão ativa dessas imagens, e é frequentemente associado a veiculação de logos e slogans de cidades como “visite x” ou “investe y”, apesar da literatura e da prática referente ao place branding ter evoluído além destas ideias limitadas com relação ao exercício do fundamento. Sendo assim, o place branding atua como ferramenta estratégica na formação e coordenação do ambiente urbano, seja através de projetos de atração internacional ou eventos, e contribui ativamente para a composição de identidades locais.

A partir deste entendimento, o presente trabalho busca preencher uma lacuna na investigação do tema, negligenciada por profissionais, sendo a desconsideração das complexidades espaciais quando empenhando-se em apropriar do conceito a partir das ferramentas tradicionais de marketing. Desta forma, integrar a perspectiva do place branding a simbologia e elementos identitários urbanos reconhece a centralidade do lugar no âmbito de refletir sobre o futuro das cidades. O serviço prestado pelo transporte público e as respectivas percepções representam uma maneira de enfrentar esta teoria com tangibilidade de elementos que se articulam com as complexidades de lugares. A relevância de lidar com o transporte público é explorada pelo contexto de uma era digital e o enfrentamento de desafios ambientais na estrutura das cidades pensando o futuro. Sendo assim, representa o esforço de discutir estratégias que direcionem a redução do uso do carro, enquanto considera a imagem da cidade que se deseja construir.

Os estudos de caso das cidades de Sydney, Porto e Medellín são usados como instrumento para compreender os efeitos do place branding, reconhecendo que toda cidade possui reputação inerente no imaginário coletivo. Essas cidades simbolizam a pertinência do posicionamento em diferentes dimensões, uma vez que Sydney é considerada uma cidade global e Medellín enfrenta os desafios do reconhecimento negativo. Em consequência, a análise revela que associações das marcas da cidade se beneficiam da conexão com as marcas dos transportes públicos, que potencializam sua notoriedade no imaginário coletivo ao associar-se com elementos identitários do local. Notadamente, esta abordagem amplia as discussões relativas à trajetória para uma cidade inteligente e conectada, confirmando a necessidade de atitudes integrantes do place branding a elementos tangíveis das complexidades espaciais, como usados nesta investigação, o transporte público.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: place branding, transportes públicos, competitividade urbana, identidade local, gestão de lugares.
INDEX

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .................................................................................................................. i
ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................................. iii
RESUMO ....................................................................................................................................... v

1. INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................................................... 1
1.1. THEME FRAMEWORK .............................................................................................................. 1
1.2. OBJECTIVES .......................................................................................................................... 3
1.3. METHODS .............................................................................................................................. 4
1.4. STRUCTURE OF WORK .......................................................................................................... 7

2. LITERATURE REVIEW .............................................................................................................. 9
2.1. PLACE BRANDING FRAMEWORK ......................................................................................... 9
2.2. PLACE PROMOTION, PLACE MARKETING AND PLACE BRANDING ................................. 12
2.3. CORPORATE BRANDING TO PLACE BRANDING .............................................................. 14
2.4. ENTREPRENEURIAL GOVERNANCE .................................................................................. 16

3. DRIVERS OF CHANGE ............................................................................................................ 19
3.1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................... 19
3.2. SOCIAL FRAME AND THE DRIVERS OF CHANGE .............................................................. 19
3.3. DIGITAL GOVERNANCE AND INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE ............................................... 22
3.4. DIGITAL TRANSPORTATION ............................................................................................. 26
3.5. ENVIRONMENT CONCERNS IN THE DIGITAL ERA .......................................................... 30

4. PUBLIC TRANSPORT FRAMEWORK ...................................................................................... 35
4.1. PROMOTING PUBLIC TRANSPORT ..................................................................................... 35
4.2. PUBLIC TRANSPORT THROUGH PLACEMAKING ............................................................ 37
4.3. PUBLIC TRANSPORT THROUGH TOURISM ACTIVITIES ................................................ 40
4.4. PUBLIC TRANSPORT THROUGH RESIDENTS ACTIVITIES .......................................... 42

5. CASE STUDIES - SYDNEY .................................................................................................... 47
5.1. SYDNEY FRAMEWORK ............................................................................................................. 47
5.2. SUSTAINABLE SYDNEY 2030 ................................................................................................. 48
5.3. PLACE BRANDING THROUGH PUBLIC TRANSPORT ANALYSIS ........................................... 49
  5.3.1. BRAND AS IMAGE AND REPUTATION ............................................................................. 49
  5.3.2. BRAND AS AN ASSET ....................................................................................................... 51
  5.3.3. BRAND AS COMMUNICATION SYSTEM ........................................................................... 51
  5.3.4. BRAND AS IDENTITY ....................................................................................................... 54
5.4. RESULTS .................................................................................................................................... 56

6. CASE STUDIES - PORTO ........................................................................................................... 59
  6.1. PORTO FRAMEWORK ............................................................................................................. 59
  6.2. PORTO MUNICIPAL AGENDA ................................................................................................. 60
  6.3. PLACE BRANDING THROUGH PUBLIC TRANSPORT ANALYSIS ........................................... 60
    6.3.1. BRAND AS IMAGE AND REPUTATION ............................................................................. 61
    6.3.2. BRAND AS AN ASSET ....................................................................................................... 63
    6.3.3. BRAND AS COMMUNICATION SYSTEM ........................................................................... 66
    6.3.4. BRAND AS IDENTITY ....................................................................................................... 67
  6.4. RESULTS .................................................................................................................................... 68

7. CASE STUDIES - MEDELLÍN ................................................................................................... 71
  7.1. MEDELLÍN FRAMEWORK ....................................................................................................... 71
  7.2. MEDELLÍN THE INNOVATIVE CITY ......................................................................................... 72
  7.3. PLACE BRANDING THROUGH PUBLIC TRANSPORT ANALYSIS ........................................... 73
    7.3.1. BRAND AS IMAGE AND REPUTATION ............................................................................. 73
    7.3.2. BRAND AS AN ASSET ....................................................................................................... 76
    7.3.3. BRAND AS COMMUNICATION SYSTEM ........................................................................... 78
    7.3.4. BRAND AS IDENTITY ....................................................................................................... 81
  7.4. RESULTS .................................................................................................................................... 82

8. DISCUSSION ................................................................................................................................. 85
  8.1. RE-VISITING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS ............................................................................. 85
  8.2. TOWARDS THE INTEGRATION AMONG PLACE BRANDING AND PUBLIC TRANSPORT ...... 87
  8.3. LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH ......................................................................................... 88
9. CONCLUSION .................................................................................................................. 91

9.1. SUGGESTION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH ............................................................... 92
FIGURES INDEX

FIGURE 1 – METHODOLOGY DESIGN. SOURCE: Yin (2013) ................................................................. 5
FIGURE 6 – CORE ROLES IN THE CURRENT (DETACHED) AND (INTEGRATED) MAAS VALUE CHAINS. SOURCE: Smith et al (2018) ........................................ 27
FIGURE 7 – LEVELS OF MAAS INTEGRATION. SOURCE: Lyons et al (2019) ........................................ 30
FIGURE 8 – GLOBAL IMPACTS ON GLOBAL BURDENS. SOURCE: BUSINESS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION (2017) .... 32
FIGURE 9 – INCREMENTAL VALUE OPPORTUNITIES IN 2030. SOURCE: BUSINESS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION (2017) ................................................................. 33
FIGURE 10 – ECONOMIC PATH TO PROMOTIONAL MEASURES. SOURCE: Banister (2001) ................................................................. 36
FIGURE 11 – FRAMEWORK OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION THROUGH THE LENS OF PLACEMENT. SOURCE: AUTHOR ................................................................. 40
FIGURE 13 – SUCCESS FACTORS FOR LEISURE AND TOURISM TRANSPORT. SOURCE: Gronau & Kagermeier (2007) ................................................................. 45
FIGURE 16 – CITY OF SYDNEY IMAGE REPRESENTATION. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 49
FIGURE 17 – TRANSPORT FOR NSW REPRESENTATION IMAGE. SOURCE: TRANSPORT FOR NSW ................................................................. 49
FIGURE 18 – OVERALL CUSTOMER SATISFACTION OVER TIME. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 50
FIGURE 19 – PLAN OF ACTIONS IN THE PLAN FOR GROWING SYDNEY. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 52
FIGURE 20 – PERFORMANCE INDICATOR IN THE PLAN OF ACTIONS. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 52
FIGURE 21 – WELLBEING INDICATORS OVER SATISFACTION. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 53
FIGURE 22 – WELLBEING INDICATOR OVER PARTICIPATION. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 53
FIGURE 23 – WELLBEING INDICATOR OVER ENGAGEMENT. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 54
FIGURE 24 – PROJECTS TO ENCOURAGE INCLUSIVENESS IN SUSTAINABLE SYDNEY 2030. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 55
FIGURE 25 – CULTURAL DIVERSITY PERCEPTION IN THE CITY. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 55
FIGURE 26 – INDICATOR OF PARTICIPATION IN CULTURAL ACTIVITIES. SOURCE: CITY OF SYDNEY ................................................................. 55
FIGURE 27 – NORTH REGION AND METROPOLITAN AREA OF PORTO. ............................................................................................................................. 59
FIGURE 28 – DIVISION OF MUNICIPALITIES IN THE METROPOLITAN AREA OF PORTO. ........................................................................................................................ 59
FIGURE 29 – LOGO OF THE CITY OF PORTO. SOURCE: CÂMARA MUNICIPAL DO PORTO ................................................................. 61
FIGURE 30 – IMAGE REPRESENTATION OF THE AMP. SOURCE: AMP ................................................................. 61
FIGURE 31 – LOGO DA STCP. SOURCE: GOOGLE IMAGES ................................................................................................................................. 62
FIGURE 32 – METRO DO PORTO LOGO. SOURCE: WIKIPEDIA COMMONS (2017) ................................................................. 62
FIGURE 33 – COMBOS DE PORTUGAL LOGO. SOURCE: WIKIPEDIA COMMONS (2019) ................................................................. 62
FIGURE 35 – MOVE-ME LOGO OF SMART APPLICATION. SOURCE: MOVE-ME.MOB ................................................................. 62
FIGURE 36 – MODE SHARE IN COMMUTES INSIDE METROPOLITAN AREA OF PORTO. SOURCE: AMP (2016) ................................................................. 63
FIGURE 37 – MODES SHARE IN PUBLIC TRANSPORT BY USE IN THE INTERN, INSIDE AND OUTSIDE FLOW. SOURCE: REOT ................................................................. 64
FIGURE 38 – MODE SHARES BY INNER, INSIDE AND OUTSIDE FLOW. SOURCE: REOT ................................................................. 64
FIGURE 42 – STRENGTH AND ADVANTAGES OF THE CITY OF PORTO. SOURCE: CÂMARA MUNICIPAL DO PORTO ................................................................. 67
FIGURE 43 – PERCEPTION OF THE QUALITY OF LIFE IN THE CITY OF PORTO. SOURCE: CÂMARA MUNICIPAL DO PORTO ................................................................. 68
**Figure 44** — Demographic rate of the city of Porto, the Metropolitan Area and the Continent. Source: INE 2011 ... 68

**Figure 45** — Medellín location in relation to the Valle del Aburrá and the Country. .............................................. 71

**Figure 46** — Alcaldía de Medellín city logo. Source: Alcaldía de Medellín ......... 73

**Figure 47** — Metro de Medellín logo. Source: Wikimedia Commons (2011) ............................................................ 74

**Figure 48** — Metroplús logo. Source: Wikimedia Commons (2019) ................................................................. 74

**Figure 49** — Example of the Metroplús buses provided by the Metro de Medellín. ........................................................ 74

**Figure 50** — Medellín investments in public safety. Source: Como Vamos Medellín (2019) ............................................ 75

**Figure 51** — Robbery levels in different modalities. Source: Como Vamos Medellín (2019) ............................................. 75

**Figure 52** — Medellín homicides annual level through 2013-2018. Source: Como Vamos Medellín (2019) ............... 75

**Figure 53** — Medellín transport mode shares in the municipalities. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019) ................. 76

**Figure 54** — Medellín percentage of people satisfied with the public space through 2009-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019) ................................................................. 76

**Figure 55** — Medellín public investment by sector through 2008-2011, 2012-2015, 2016-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019) ................................................................. 77

**Figure 56** — Medellín investment in the promotion of development, 2008-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019) ................................................................. 77

**Figure 57** — Priority topics for attention by municipal authorities 2006-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019) ................................................................. 78

**Figure 58** — Medellín public investment rates through 2008-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019) ............... 79

**Figure 59** — Public investment per capita in the cities of Colombia through 2013-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019) ................................................................. 79

**Figure 60** — Cultural projects of Metro de Medellín. Source: Metro de Medellín ............................................................. 80

**Figure 61** — Medellín satisfaction with the investments in public services, 2008-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos. ................................................................. 81

**Figure 62** — Medellín evaluation of the public entities. Source: Medellín Como Vamos. ................................................................. 81

**Figure 63** — The urban local identity of the city of Medellín. Source: Ghione (2014) ................................................................. 82
# Tables Index

**Table 1** – Methodological Indicators Approach. Source: Author ................................................................. 6
**Table 2** – Urban Governance Challenges to Scholars. Source: da Cruz et al (2019) ........................................ 23
**Table 3** – Urban Governance Challenges to Authorities. Source: da Cruz et al (2019) ................................. 24
**Table 4** – Integral Approach in the MaaS Platforms. Source: Hollands (2015) ................................................. 28
**Table 5** – Sydney Dimensions Analysis. Source: Author ................................................................................... 57
**Table 6** – Sydney Perception Analysis. Source: Author .................................................................................... 57
**Table 7** – Structure of Public Entities in Place Branding and Public Transport. Source: Author .................. 64
**Table 8** – Porto Dimensions Analysis. Source: Author .................................................................................... 70
**Table 9** – Porto Perception Analysis. Source: Author ...................................................................................... 70
**Table 10** – Medellín Dimensions Analysis. Source: Author ............................................................................. 83
**Table 11** – Medellín Perception Analysis. Source: Author ................................................................................ 83
INTRODUCTION

1.1 THEME FRAMEWORK

The perception of place branding is traced to a recent scenario and show rapidly increase over the last 20 years (Lucarelli, 2011). Whereas the conceptual framework regards the shift from the corporate and services brand, the place branding appropriation from corporations represents a global trend with the efforts to attract people, inward investments and business to a determined area. Being important to state the consensus that places have been using the promotion to these purposes long before, therefore, the terminology and practical approaches concern the theoretical transfers and require a broad scope to understanding this as a phenomenon (Kavaratzis, 2009).

Accordingly, the place branding recently debate is essentially related to the city’s image (Hospers, 2006; Gilboa et al, 2015), the promotion (Boisen, 2018), and the policies that ensure the use and dissemination through the city’s institutions and organizations. (Kavaratzis, 2004). Therefore, is inevitable to mention the work from Lynch (1988) that paved the ground to the research on the aspects that shape the way we perceive and grasp the city’s image and form. Nowadays, the topic approaches the city image through the intangible aspects, while the globalized world every city is an option, the place branding proposes to create the intangible distinctiveness in a place reputation (Anholt, 2007).

Addressing these intangibilities induced the need for assimilating the marketing approaches into urban management, and therefore creating a blurred line in a multidisciplinary misconception between the corporate and the governance in public services level (Kavaratzis, 2008). The context in which these changes occurred and settled into urban governance forms the base that this work aims to comprehend, once the marketing mix and the corporate approach changed the management in our cities, (Boisen, 2007; T. Hall & Hubbard, 1996; Harvey, 1989) and to thoroughly appropriate and explore the urban complexities in the discussion, represent bringing this debate with regards to elements that connects with the spatial planning systems that structure the knowledge and practice of the field (Oliveira, 2016; Kavaratzis, Ashworth & Warnaby, 2015).

Therefore, the relevance of this topic lies in the multidisciplinary and theoretical connections into different fields, leading to the development of scientific journals dedicated to build and structure the debate around place branding, namely, Place Branding and Public Diplomacy in 2004, and Journal of Place Management and Development in 2008 (Lucarelli, 2011). For this reason, is mandatory that the debate contemplates the spatial planning complexities and responses to the measures taken towards the place branding (Oliveira, 2016).
While shifting the approach from the management and corporation towards the spatial extent can bring a pack of experience knowledge with it, from the observations and analytic reviews of the current situation, one can deliver relevant tools for thinking the future of our cities. Therefore, this dissertation aims is to contribute to comprehend the place branding phenomenon through positive outcomes in our cities nowadays. Once is true that our cities are being more immersed in the market dynamics, increasing the urban governance is being conflicted into management practices, therefore is imperative to draft the distinction of place branding in the urban practice for authorities. Accordingly, regarding policies to develop place branding efforts can produce and expand the social injustices and ultimately, gentrification in cities (Lucarelli, 2018).

For a further look in how this issue is related to a market segment, according to the global and regional numbers of tourism in 2018, only Europe received 516 billion USD (UNWTO, 2019), from numbers like these that cities have to become more and more competitive to attract the right amount of visitors and inward investments. But this issue has led to several discussions from the role of public governance in whether the cities have been devoting balanced attention and efforts between creating the environment to attract visitors or fulfilling the life requirements of residents. And the critical difference from corporate branding to the place branding lies in the decision making and the organization of power in cities structure regarding the complex socio-political construction that considers and represents the spatial and temporal dimensions with multilevel interactions (Lucarelli, 2018).

The theoretical transfer for this framework establishes that concerning place promotion, place marketing, and place branding is the source of spreading attempts to understand the differences and nuances of these concepts. Once the marketing literature focuses more on the empirical experience, it is complex to bring this into urban practice formerly because commentators struggle to the path of practice and theoretical conception. (Lucarelli & Berg, 2011; Boisen et al, 2018) So when it comes to places, the literature attempts to break down the distinction concerning place promotion, marketing, and branding for places, mainly due to the implementation differences and the structural source of goals and effects from the conceptual boundaries (Knox and Bickerton, 2003). The strong debates on characterizing the differences between these concepts have shown little effects on refining the urban practice, despite the efforts for local authorities to create and reinforce their promotion departments (Northover, 2010).

Through the disregard of place branding implications in spatial planning, the identity structure can overlook relevant aspects that shape and directly interfere the daily life whereas creating stigmas through place narratives. The control of the place narratives should focus on bottom-up and top-down approaches that empower the ‘sense of being’ from a place. Therefore, this works also appropriate from the idea of capacity building from Healey (1998), in which the author describes five concepts that represent the shifts towards new forms of institutional building: integrative place-making; collaboration in policymaking; inclusive stakeholder involvement; use of 'local' knowledge; and building 'relational' resources. Arguing that this approach is about creating integrative forces to promote long-term changes in the quality of life, by enabling the flexible and dynamic forces that surround the places.

Acknowledging the importance of place branding in nowadays urban governance, this work attempts to grasp the structure and the path that enables the branding of a city and the construction of a city’s identity. One concept that contributes with this purpose is the concept of co-branding which consists in the interaction among brands, regardless of being in a strategic or organisational method, it represents the benefits from association with different brands to activate the engagement with one of the involved brands (Lucarelli, 2018). Therefore, this concept provides a framework towards sustainable contributions in the debate of place branding, whereas using the public transport as a public sub-brand that articulates in the structure of the place branding.
Since considerable scholars draw attention to the role that public transport and accessibility plays in the construction of the urban identity (Gilboa, Jaffe, Vianelli, Pastore, and Herstein, 2015; Merrilees, Miller, and Herington, 2009; Merrilees, Miller, Shao, and Herington, 2014; Northover, 2010), whether from the perspective of the residents or the non-residents, the general understanding is that public transport and infrastructure interplay in several ways with the creation of a successful approach towards improving the life of residents and visitors. Promoting inward investments and creating the environment to long-term changes to overcome the social disruptions from the mobility compromise.

From this perspective, being public transport a tangible widely recognized aspect in the urban identity (Merrilees et al., 2014), and inside the traditional urban planning system, whereas developing the research around place branding, grasping through the collaboration of the city and its public transport system represents the purpose of this dissertation contribution. A look into the public transport as a brand, or co-brand in the place branding, to overcome the criticism towards the spatial neglection in the recent debate surrounding place branding.

The efforts of this work settle from the base of place branding literature, which is more and more allocated in academic journals about tourism, business, and management. Representing the gap this works aims to reduce, while cities are the centre stage in any social research and debate, regarding the density its concentrate, more than a natural trend, it is favourable, that other social sciences address this issue. Meanwhile, additional work connecting the place branding with the issues that surround the urban planning seeks to help the new urban governance attempts to successfully apply it (Paganoni, 2012; Oliveira, 2016).

Hence, the literature review fulfils the attempt to a holistic comprehension over the topic. Considering the context that enables the urban practice to shift towards this strategy position, appropriating from the efforts in understanding the entrepreneurial governance, effects of globalization in our society that often represents a new look into old problems. When imagining the future of our cities, is inevitable to consider the digital services emergence and the dependence on the social behaviour to shape more sustainable path, therefore address this gap between the place branding and the spatial implications became an increasingly urgent matter.

1.2. Objectives

Changes in our society represent a multidimensional and interactive sphere, composed of families, institutions, and political parties that take place in the urban scenario that surround us. Accordingly, the adjustments follow the intensive reading of the changes that constantly arrange our cities. This view comes from the social ecologist approach to understanding human behaviour and suits the purpose of this essay for analysing the experience on place branding mutually mirroring public transport brands (Schensul, 2008).

Followed by the literature review on the topic of place branding, the main question approaches a relation that has little attention when discussing this issue, considering whenever scholars address the public transport in the structuring of the city brand, the focus is on the weight that this aspect has in the stakeholder perception (Gilboa et al., 2015). Hence, the conclusions meet the practitioners in a very acutely way, missing the contribution to grasp the complexity of developing and managing the collective imagery memory of so many stakeholders that a city can bring together when branding itself.

The potential social conflict of the entrepreneurial city and the community empowerment is a topic of great importance, due to the connection with questions broader and wider like the sense of placement and belonging, also the treatment and experience that foreigners and tourists sharing the stage with locals
have on a specific place. The recent scrutiny developed under this main idea of increasing mobility and decreasing borders brought more attention to this, and the connection with political affairs is direct and increasingly less subtle.

Understanding the rising of global markets, and the consequently competitiveness of cities nowadays, within the topic on how to attend the debate of destination attraction and the importance of citizen’s participation, this dissertation enters in this field of knowledge to reflect upon the following questions:

- How the city/place branding is translated into spatial planning?
- What is the level of collaboration between city brands and public transport brands?
- How to segment the theory of place branding in a tangible method?

The interest in the literature of the place branding came prior to the attempt of explore the connection between the concept and the public transport. Therefore, it was through observing a literature gap that the objects were framed, making the contributions both primary and abstract, since it combines traditional literatures for the investigation, such as the public transport framework. In this sense, the major intention of the questions and the whole research represents the expansion of the debate that surrounds the place branding concept. From the recent concept definition and its development into the scientific journals dedicated to this study, the term is often reshaped into new perspectives and narratives.

Though the endeavour of connecting the literature of the place branding into a significant element that shape the urban dynamics, such as public transport, this work offers more in the reflection of what place branding can represent when regarding the narratives that already exists by the citizens. Once the place branding is regarded purely in the business and marketing forms it neglects a power tools in the structuring of these implemented narratives, the power of contributing to the belonging in a certain place.

1.3. METHODS

The guideline that supports these questions involves a literature review as an attempt to fully understand the context that arises the managerial approach to city branding. Defining a method to outline research, depends in large part in looking into the questions. According to Yin (2018, p. 33) ‘‘The more that your questions seek to explain some contemporary circumstance (e.g., “how” or “why” some social phenomenon works), the more that case study research will be relevant. Case studies also are relevant the more that your questions require an extensive and “in-depth” description of some social phenomenon.’’ Therefore, following this exploratory condition with regards to the case study, the analysis points to this methodology as a way of the best frame the research questions into broad and contributively conclusions.

Since a case study is recommended when there is a need to investigate a contemporary phenomenon, and regarding the boundaries between the phenomenon and its context are not constant or clearly defined, this methodology seems to address the questions above (Yin, 2018). A case study approach stills require an in-depth draft of the choices and the elements that will guide the analysis. Examining the questions that outline the objectives of this work, the choice of the multiple case study is more relatable and opportune to outline more compelling results. Once the issues envelop a broad analysis and urban case studies are intrinsically connected with its environment, to draw broader and robust discussions with the investigation of a single case can be precipitate and lead to misconceptions. (Herriott and Firestone, 1983 apud Yin, 2018)
The author Yin (2018) guide for conducting a case study research and methodology was an important literature path in constructing and developing a model to address the main questions that this work proposes the response. Thus in the general model Figure 1, show the methodological approach that best leads the conduct of multiple case study research, and in this section, the “Define and Design” will be further discussed and adapt to stress the needs of these specific issues proposed here.

**Develop theory:** Regarding the scope of a dissertation reach in terms of theory development, this stage attends the proposition for investigation rather than a theory development itself, once the theory comes from a literature appropriation that surrounds the issues of city branding. Therefore, this proposition is the interrelation between city branding and public transport when attending the creation of the city’s identity and image.

**Select cases:** The process of selecting case studies with a multiple case approach drifts from designing the sampling which refers to criteria in choosing the cities to be analysed. The criteria in Figure 1 concerns the third column with the dotted line, connecting again with the proposition, in this case, and mostly to always revisit the main issues that the case studies need to address. To achieve a robust outcome from this analysis, aiming to perform a realist and context related connection between the questions surrounding the city branding and public transport, the choice in selecting the cases settle by acknowledging the different steps towards city branding integration. Creating the cause of examining a city in a developed stage of branding, a city in the starting stages, and one that can consider in the process of integration.

Regarding the criteria of stages which city is placed, the ranking of city branding process has become an increasingly popular approach, with ranking such as Anholt’s GfK Roper City Brands Index, The Saffron European City Brand Barometer, City Brand Value Index (CBVI) by “Euro brand”, Innovation Cities Top 100 City Rankings by the Global Innovation Agency and more recently the Bloom Consulting Digital Cities Index.

Ranking the cities can give an insight into the world view of the different cities from the attractiveness and competitive perspectives (Boisen *et al*., 2018; Jessop, 2018), one of the main reasons that brand associations are developed into places. And considering these rankings and the level of information that can be extracted, the cities will follow the analysis of Sydney, portrayed in the Saffon Barometer as a
city that will challenge the current generation of Top 10 cities, and occupies the 4th position inside the Bloom Consulting Digital Cities Index. Applying these criteria for the development of city brand, the second city is Porto and the underdevelopment city brand with great potential in bringing meaningful outcomes is the city of Medellín.

The methodologies of these ranking are merely economic, using the cross-data of ranking such as the World Bank and quality of living (Saffron, 2019) was used as a mirror of how these cities are being observed and levelled in terms of attractiveness, and then quick research was performed to understand the level of information from official channels the investigation could add. So, a clear limitation was the language, once cities of china were not considered even appearing in every rank as a strong brand image, along with other cities. The factor of picking cities from different continents play a background role in assuming these could increase the robustness of the outcomes.

**Design data collection and protocol:** Consider a data collection for different cities and with different planning organizations, requires a look for an indicator to benchmark the data. In this work, the focus will be to investigate the role of public transport in the process of co-creating the city brand. Therefore, the work of Hereznia and Anders-Morawska (2015) brings important light over the issue of concrete indicators to evaluate the city branding efforts, hence the adaptation for this assessment will follow as shown in Table 1. Converting the indicators show the efforts of analysing the different cities context into the same criteria, to achieve the most comparable outcomes.

The compilation of the indicators was based on the uniformity of gathering the information, and the concrete aspects regarding the governance intention and production of the brand and its integration to public transportation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theoretical Approach</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Source of Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brand as image and reputation (Keller, 1993; Anholt, 2005)</td>
<td>associations and levels of loyalty, awareness and personality</td>
<td>Establishment of an organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as an asset (Sinclar, 2004)</td>
<td>The budgetary and financial value, Financial Value and distinctiveness</td>
<td>Data provided by the organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as a communication system (Kavaratzis, 2004)</td>
<td>Impact of the marketing campaign, Promotion awareness</td>
<td>Official Reports/organization channels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as Identity (Baxter, 2013)</td>
<td>Social and Cultural associations, Social and culture conformity</td>
<td>Report papers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To understand the theoretical approach, it is important to scrutinize the topics that guide the case studies analysis. Therefore, the idea supported in the brand as image and reputation regards the uniformity of efforts to integrate the image delivery to the residents and end-users. Appropriation of this theoretical framework will be explored in the literature review, but this indicator will point the analysis to explore the associations of the numerous brands under the place management authority. Investigating the reputation established, that concerns the outside image of the place brand (Anholt, 2005); additionally, investigating the brand favourability, strength a uniqueness, from the inside perspective (Keller, 1993). Giving the framework to address more than the image designed for the brand, but the service and the satisfaction as well. To assess the brand image and the reputation, the establishment of an organization is relevant to understand the level of disassociation and independence of the place brand strategies, however, since the case studies need some flexibility in the source of information, this data can be sourced by the different brands inside the scope of public transport.

The topic that understands brand as an asset focusses the analysis on the financial value associated with the brand and the financial value applies in the management of the place brand. The work of Sinclair (2004) provides an important methodology to analyse the national brands, stated that “brands are long-lived assets and that they will generate earnings for many years into the future.” Therefore, this methodological framework provided the tools to outlook and comply with the overall evaluation. The work tackles the evaluation of a national brand and therefore, creates a barrier to all the topics of analysis. Nevertheless, contributes to the conceptual idea of gathering different evaluation tools, like the economic brand rankings mentioned above.

Tackling the idea of brand as a communication system is based on the theoretical framework from Kavaratzis (2004). Where the city image is understood as the image communication system, and organized in the primary communication, comprising the infrastructure and the physical improvements of city’s actions and strategies, while the secondary communication regards the intentional information efforts to promote the desired awareness, closely connected to the traditional marketing practices. Formerly, tertiary communication refers to all the marketing not controlled by the agencies, and the spread of the user’s response. The idea of promotion and urban marketing will be address in the literature review, but the premise that the city’s image is the approach in the communication measures supports the analysis of these forms of communication through the development and evaluation of place branding strategy, that in this work is added the public transport interplaying with the expansion of the city image through communication.

Brand as identity refers to the connection of existing identities within a place, and the acknowledge goes until the representative of these identities in the decision making, and the shape of their communities. Therefore, for this analysis, the social and cultural engagement will be assessed to understand the level of participation that exists under the city management, appropriating partly of the methodological framework provided by Baxter, Kerr, and Clarke (2013). In this conceptual framework, the authors acknowledge that the existing identity of a place is not always competitive, and being so, is not comprehensively appropriated in the place brand identity set. For this reason, this analysis goes into investigating if the identities comprise conform to the place brand strategy once this issue can trickle down into mixing the shared sense of place among the citizens. When the authors deal with the assessment of multiple identities that not always are competitive, the strategy of implementation necessary to address a more holistic approach along with the citizens and all the stakeholders involved.
1.4 Structure of Work

The work is structured on the introduction as the first chapter, a literature review over the topic of place branding in the second chapter thirdly is focused on the drivers of change in the social constructions that lead the relevance in addressing public transport in this dissertation. While chapter four display the framework that grasps public transport in the perspective that shows integration with the definition or conflicts in the place branding literature, while the fourth chapter The chapters five to seven is focused on the case studies of the city of Sydney, Porto, and Medellín, respectively, followed by the discussion of the data and the analysis in chapter eight. Chapter nine is focused on the conclusion of the work.

The chapter after the introduction is firstly focused on explaining the attempts in defining and outline the terminology through the different perspectives field of study. After this revision, the approach goes towards display the debate that occurs based on the terminologies that are not yet fully defined, like the place promotion, place marketing, and the latter, place branding once the scope of this terminology is seen by different methodologies of definition. Through the third part in the literature review, this works attempts in the present where the literature stands with regards to the shift from corporate branding to place branding, while the last topic tackles the entrepreneurial governance which comes from this merge in the urban governance of the corporate leadership.

The third chapter ties the social construction changes that justify this work dealing with these two topics: place branding and public transportation. Therefore, the first part is dedicated to scrutinizing the social frames that consider these new perspectives of the dissertation, which is based on the digital transformation led by the social structures and shaped by it, in feedbacking. The third topic engages with the digital governance and the institutional change; the fourth topic approaches the digital transportation, dealing in the scenario that public transportation is placed; the fifth topic focus in the discussion that this change is considered, that is the environmental concerns in the digital transformations.

Chapter four attempts in outline the framework of public transport in the place branding literature, firstly with the process of promoting the public transport, followed by the role of public transport in the literature of placemaking, and the final topics engage with the public transport through different perspectives, the first deals with the tourism activities, and the latter deals with the resident's perspectives in the role of contributing with the community.

Chapters five to seven have the same structure once it launches the case studies, based on the methodology approached in the introduction. Therefore, the first topic goes into the city framework, whereas geographical location and the characteristics that will contribute to the outlook of the analysis. The second topic is dedicated to present the major agenda that guide the planning tools in the city, and the third topic engages with the place branding through public transport analysis, moving for the topics tackled in the methodology described above. Finally, the fourth topic deals with the results of the data gathered and organized in a table that outlines the levels of integration in the case studies.

The chapter that follows the case, is dedicated to the discussion of the results and the revisit of the question that guided the work, the scope in discussing the integration through the topics of place branding and public transport, and the limitations of the research. And finally, chapter nine is the conclusion and the suggestion for future research with questions raised through the development of this dissertation that could not be comprised in here.
LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 PLACE BRANDING FRAMEWORK

Place branding is the attempt to create distinctiveness among countries, cities, and to a lesser extent region, the increasing need for these elements that differentiate places is traced and associate with the decrease of borders imposed on the flow of people, capital, and companies. Therefore, the literature refers to a competitive agenda for places to attract creative people (Florida, 2005); events that shape the global attention (Boisen, 2007; Boyle & Hughes, 1994) and business (Anholt, 2007). Investigating the attempt for the distinctiveness and competitive-driven positioning is marked as diffuse literature, that lack in consensus and a cohesive building of a conceptual framework, that can be attributed to the sources of conceptual tools and empirical explanations (Lucarelli & Berg, 2011).

Associations with the competitiveness between cities and the scale of public governance focusing on strategic places to invest, since global cities like London, New York, and Paris have been branding their image, and seeing their strategic favoured and powerful positioning, it became a trend effort to do so in other places. The work of Lucarelli & Berg (2011), attempts in developing the state of the art of place branding research, acknowledging that even with the large number of studies comprised between 1988 and 2009, there is still a lack of consensus regarding the terminology, varying in place marketing, place branding, city branding, city marketing, destination branding, urban branding, and promotion. This imposes a barrier in developing the common definition and outlining of the practice, creating the need to identify what is branding and what is not in the scope of practical applications.

The concept of branding is imported from the marketing literature, but in the context of city governance, it has been applied since 1970, with the rise of “entrepreneurial city (Boyle & Hughes, 1994; T. Hall & Hubbard, 1996; Jessop, 2018; Kavaratzis, 2004). The shift was understood as a natural path towards a more business-driven place, with the increasing scarcity of funds from public governance. But what was seen at the beginning of this transferability from marketing to public management was city promotion, associated with little control over the marketing literature and the mix with urban policies (Kavaratzis, 2009). Therefore, the construction of place branding as a conceptual framework is a process of understanding the best approaches to achieve the initial goal. These approaches range in the field of tourism, strategic planning, marketing management, and urban governance (Lucarelli & Berg, 2011).

Thus, nowadays the exchange between the marketing practices and the public policies is more mature than 40 years ago, and it grasps that city branding is more complex than creating a slogan and logos for a city. The exchange of findings started by trying to understand if city branding could be compared with corporate branding and how the associations would play out to become an important tool for city
management. The public relations are intrinsically connected with the branding planning process, meaning that it can act as the management of the image, regarding the government to people relationship, and the vocabulary played brings power or weakness to the associations. Therefore, in a globalized world, the places with strong and powerful brands find competitive positioning acting as an enabler for them, and the contrary is also true (Anholt, 2007).

However, the growing use of this tool created considerable uncertainty over the practices and framework of which it should be adopted. Despite the different definitions and applicability, the main target for the place branding, no matter the methods and the conceptual framework, is the creation of value, and one important literature that emerges and can enrich the discussion and the employment of this diffuse and foggy literature is the concept of placemaking. Placemaking considers the production and measures undertaken to develop and maintenance of the perceptions and images constructed with regards to places (Kovács and Musterd, 2013).

Despite the globalization idea that places would lose importance the radical would be the decrease of borders, create the dialectical response, where the more globalized and stronger the mobility of money and people are, the more important is the need to connect to places spatially. Therefore, the increasing demand for connectivity is associated with the branding of products, services, and places, emerging the need for transparency and accountability of the organizations and public authorities, has expanded the importance of positioning in the social context (Knox and Bickerton, 2003). Understanding the complexity of branding as a process drive to a comprehensive framework to enable a concept that supports the strategic tool for public policies regarding urban planning.

The promotional side of the place branding seeks to attract a single target, whereas the resident’s populations are often not this target, relates to the placentas aspect of the community involved and shed light to the discussion of the public engagement regarding the strategic planning of the place branding, once the resident’s acts as the hosts to all the people, investors, and companies that place branding aims at attracting. This is an aspect more mature and developed of the place branding strategies, where it is conceptualized and grasped in the top-down or bottom-up approaches.

Despite the few attempts to define place branding, Anholt (2007) argues that every place on the earth has a reputation already established, and the branding comes as a process for managing this image towards the current goals. The marketing literature shows the power of the reputation with the use of the label “made in...” and “made by...” referring to the Germany engineering, the Swedish design among others, and this referring to the natural reputation. When the author addresses the branding process, he argues as a means of managing this reputation within a competitive environment.

Accordingly, the author addresses the place branding through an image management approach, and he attempts to define into the city brand index hexagon, where he explores six elements that contribute to the branding of cities, these are the presence; the place; the potential; the pulse; the people; and the prerequisites. Compounding what he will develop as a brand index, a quantitative effort to position the cities according to these elements ranked through insiders and outsiders provided the analysis and following of what impact and change the rank of the cities, and he discovers that promotional efforts had little or no change in the ranking, leading to conclude that the place branding is more responsive to the urban environment, policies and personal perceptions collectively. As he stated in “the money is usually better spent on genuine improvements to the place which will also have a more powerful, more credible and longer-lasting effect on its reputation. Places, in the end, are not products on sale to a consumer, and traditional product marketing is usually completely unsuited to the task” (Anholt, 2007, p.66).
Place branding for Kavaratzis (2004) is the means for achieving competitiveness to attract inward investment and tourism, additionally reach the community development through the activation of the engagement of the residents with their city’s image, creating the social forces that will enable the social inclusion. Arguing that, urban planners are increasingly focusing on ‘branding personality’, ‘flagship projects’, and ‘events branding’ to achieve the goals towards the final target of place branding. And he grasps that place branding needs to focus on the city’s residents’ perceptive image once the goal is to improve their quality of life.

The literature for place branding, display shift from almost exclusive concerns towards the tourism sector, and although was never the only approach to the concept, has led to misunderstandings over the effects of the place branding in the spatial planning. And lacks to connect to urban planners, namely for translating the marketing tools to promote cities, and to consider the resident’s need, that for once, will be the hosts to these attractions. This deliberately creates the stage for conflict in place branding literature (Oliveira, 2016).

Hence, the core concept of place branding expands to different areas and fields of knowledge, requiring an objective and comprehensive outline of the development proposed. Therefore, for this work, the literature framework that better suits are proposed by grasping the place branding as an instrument of strategic planning, as a response to the traditional planning failing to address the challenges of the differentiated, dynamic, and plural environment. The author describes place branding as this instrument used to “foster economic restructuring, social inclusion and cohesion, political engagement and participation, place identification, and the general well-being of citizens.” (Oliveira, 2016, p.51).

Furthermore, Oliveira (2016) grasp that spatial planning is a strong tool for the challenges that are spatially distributed within the cities, and while place branding could not replace the spatial planning, it should be a complementary element that will cope with the challenges that cities face nowadays. Whereas framed as a spatial planning tool, the place branding can provide the flexibility that planners require to assess the plurality of problems. The urban tissue is increasingly unequal, unbalanced, and therefore needs an adjustable response, and place branding can perform as a strong tool for mentioned reasons.

Therefore, with the progress of the discussion, the expansion into other fields, Knox and Bickerton (2003) argues that over the last 30 years, the concept of brand has been appropriated in a multidisciplinary field, becoming a strategic agenda for the support and management of value creation. In this sense seems relevant to draft on value creation to address the spatial disparities with the strategic place branding. Despite intensive efforts in creating the conceptual framework for place branding, the literature misses in the co-relation of the place as a geographical scale, as a territoriality concept, from which scholars appropriate in the abstract meaning of place, but misses (intentionally or not) to address the spatial configurations and cause/effect of the place as spatial unity (Oliveira, 2016; Kavaratzis & Ashworth, 2010).

Regarding the branches that originate from the literature on place branding, Kavaratzis and Ashworth (2010) offer a categorization that can be seen like the refinement in terms of practice and the discussion among scholars. The authors describe the place of origin branding, which is closely related to the translation of the marketing literature imprinted in place management; the nation branding describes as the idea of governments advisors realizing the positive outcomes in pursuing the foreign affairs in the perspective of place branding; destination branding, which was already mentioned by other authors, as an argument that places are consumed by its visitors, therefore need to have the image and identity managed; the culture branding, that refers to the analysis of impacts from the global events in the social and economic activity of a place, and therefore pursue this as a strategic tool in place management; and
lastly the integrated place branding, referring to focus on the guide and integration in different areas of the place management, proposing an approach that integrates a lot of the categories mentioned above.

Accordingly, through the literature review of the conceptual structures from place branding, the one that best addresses the aims of this work is appropriated from Oliveira (2016) and Kavaratzis and Ashworth (2010), stressing the place in place branding as a spatial unity that needs tools and management considering the spatial and geographical scales, that cannot disregard the community and social implications of the practice and theoretical discussion. This merge of conceptual structure goes parallel with the work of Oliveira (2016) that develops the understanding towards the place branding as a strategic tool in the spatial planning, contributing to this work in its essence.

2.2 PLACE PROMOTION, PLACE MARKETING, AND PLACE BRANDING

Approaching concepts from marketing literature comes with some struggles to apply the shift towards urban practice. The literature tries to differentiate in many ways to position the urban practices into these terms, with this regard, this work underlines the grounds in which these are appropriated. Despite the consensus on the lack of a defined conceptual framework on the topic, it can be found an intensive effort in outlining de conceptual structures of place promotion, place marketing, and place branding (Lucarelli & Berg, 2011).

Authors (Anholt, 2005; Hall and Hubbard, 1996; Ind and Holm, 2013; Kavaratzis, 2004; Kavaratzis, 2009) are all in conformity with the fact that promoting cities is no way a new trend or phenomenon, understanding that this direction was enhanced after the adjustments in governance after the world wars. In this way, the literature review will take a deeper analysis of how and why this governance change affected the approach in urban policies, once efforts to use available instruments and the focus of active agencies in promoting this manner have evolved, and a set of changes both in the marketing and in planning literature, cooperate with the refinement of the idea of advertising cities (Kavaratzis and Ashworth, 2010).

Regarding the change in governance, Hall and Hubbard (1996) called this movement, towards a more market-driven planning process, of entrepreneurial cities. The authors use this term to describe a fundamental difference in urban politics, whereas policies of the income distribution were replaced by actions for growth and strengthen the line between corporate entrepreneurialism and the urban governance, aiming for capital attraction. Adding this term to a bigger conceptual context of neoliberalism policies, show the scenario in which cities and competitive urban governance needed to be addressed. To frame the scope of this work, the neoliberal policy is understood as “(...)one that is promoted by neoliberal regimes and implies a shift from government to (partly) private strategies, or a conversion from publicly planned solutions to competitive and market-oriented ones, or at least the serving of business companies and their favoured customer groups.” (Sager, 2011, p. 148).

In the context of places been promoted long before, a way to put these similar concepts into a theoretical framework involves going through the improvement of tools used to implement them. Although the confusion and mislead of ideas occur often, the academics apply great effort to distinguish the theory of these three ideas with clear definitions. Some authors categorize a refinement advancement of the conceptual groundwork (Kavaratzis & Ashworth, 2010), while others distinguish from the different methodologies used in the practice (Boisen et al., 2018), and an additional frame for these terms is chronological, showing that after 2000 the term branding started to emerge parallel with the developments into the field of corporate branding (Lucarelli & Berg, 2011).
Starting with the definition proposes of **place promotion**, that focuses on bringing attention to a certain place to increase the demand to a certain target group of people, this definition needs an extensive consideration because according to Boisen *et al.* (2018) this is what most cities and companies are doing, even if stating they reinforce place marketing, or place branding. The confusion here is acknowledged, and because the marketing practices usually do not mind mixing the concepts.

The definition of place promotion comes first in all the attempts to distinguish these terms, this due to the reason for many scholars seeing and putting the place promotion as a tool in the practice of place marketing, and the place branding. Since in the act of promotion is used the creation of identities such as a logo, slogan, font, and style to signature a promotion of a place; Therefore, place promotion is disconnected to the urban policies and urban design in so many ways, bringing only the pretty and advertise elements a city already has to offer, with the desire this will reach the target audience and increase what they attempt to achieve, whereas investment, citizens or visitors (Boisen *et al.*, 2018).

Furthermore, when categorizing the evolution of the place branding attempts to define the concept is clear that in terms of sophistication in techniques, the place promotion, is on the most basic actions towards the practice, whereas the empirical research determines the effects of slogans and logos that often are untrustworthy of the reality faced in place (Kavaratzis & Ashworth, 2008). With little evidence of these impacts at the time, the place promotion is now served as the base of the research to recognize the differences and latter, a clearer definition of place branding.

Secondly, the term **place marketing** can be framed as a broader extent concerning urban governance, the confusion occurs because in marketing a place you have to use the promotion as one tool, but again, in a much broader and further extent of that (Boisen *et al.*, 2018). While in the literature, authors (Boisen, 2018; Kavaratzis, 2004; Ind and Holm, 2003) agree with the position of place marketing involving more than promotion and also an effort to connect different stakeholders to create the strategy that better address the city’s image, and not only what can be promoted in that.

City image can have a blurred definition, and for matters of context it’s important for this work to underline what better defines, according to Bailly (1994) ‘like geography, urban marketing is based on representations; this enables us to tackle not the city itself but its meaning in a symbolic and ideological context’. What is a clear understanding after the literature review that will follow this dissertation, is that whereas place promotion takes a passive development in terms of urban governance, the place marketing adopts a more active role in changing the image of the city for its citizens and stakeholders involved.

Ultimately, there is the **place branding** comprehension. Where the lines get more and more confused for a bridge between practitioners and scholars because of the term imported from the marketing literature as an intangible designation. The literature suggests the framework for city branding incorporated by corporate brand because both share multidisciplinary roots, also address multiple groups of stakeholders, have a high level of intangibility and need to focus on social responsibility (Kavaratzis, 2004).

For a clear and introductory structure of place branding, it’s simple to see as a means to achieve both attention from target groups, aiming to attract inward investment or tourism, but at the same level creating the bounds to community participatory in these decisions and how the policies should be addressed. At first, authorities took an interest in the tools of the marketing practice, the question was raised on the social conflicts on undertaking the citizen’s voice on the issues that were directly relating to them. For this reason, the approach was shifted for a more holistic and complex view on the way to tackle the purpose of authorities and the community. (Kavaratzis, 2004).
Although appropriated by the market literature, the complexities that rely on branding places makes the application more multidimensional and necessarily holistic. Tackling places with the tools of branding necessarily needs to consider the multiple elements that represent the supply side of a city, such as services and infrastructure, merge with the segmented nature of the demand side, for instance, the inhabitants, the tourists, and the private parties. Comprehend these stakeholders in the development of brand strategies is a task that generates much scrutiny from the parties involved (Pareja-Eastaway, Chapain, and Mugnano, 2013).

The concept of place branding is being constantly reframed, once it represents a close connection to the notion of place, and how it is shaped. While the marketing literature provides very little tools for managing the political act that represents a choice towards a brand strategy, the citizens keep organizing their form to create awareness of ‘sense of place’. Considering the passive construction of a place, that city branding use as a facilitator, there is a symbolic perception element that can be divided between the insiders and the outsiders. Whilst the insiders construct the ‘sense of place’ through the daily experiences in the city, the outsiders form abstract and generalist conceptions based on experiences, and this combination of awareness is relevant to support the branding strategy (Kovács and Musterd, 2013).

2.3 CORPORATE BRANDING TO PLACE BRANDING

Over time, the act of creating a brand has evolved as companies and corporations are composed of a multiplicity of shareholders, and this itself makes the management of the brand a complex and diverse task. Since the idea of corporate brand outset in the tradition of product brand, that is considered the actions towards differentiation and preference among costumers, when applied to corporations’ brands are marked in its strategic tools and agenda for the same purpose (Knox and Bickerton, 2003).

Nicholas Ind (1997) defines corporate by its cohesion and the belief of people joining for a common goal. Words such as “value”, “identity” and “image” are common in drafting the definitions of corporate branding. For these characterization reasons, seems important to clarify what the literature review when addressing the matters of, first branding and further, the transferability from corporate branding into place branding. Despite the close relation explored among place branding and corporate branding, it is not clear the similarities between places and corporates (Kavaratzis, 2010).

The linkage of corporates concern over their brand reputation has its early days converging to the neoliberal social economy, characterized by the globalization of production and increased mobility of capital (Hall et al, 1996). Passing through this moment, the corporations started to adopt a more holistic attitude towards the market and the consumers eventually. Furthermore, the adaptations required from the brands and corporations were to embrace the organization’s attributes (Knox and Bickerton, 2003) such as values, missions, and beliefs into a communication attitude of sharing with all the parties involved (Kavaratzis, 2009).

Hence, the corporation brand started to have more and more to offer, but also more to serve in terms of accountability and transparency and the reason may be because, in recent years, corporate brands became huge asset holders, with the possibility to duplicate their value if a strong corporate brand it’s applied. Highlighting the value that is added naturally to any product that a corporate brand launch, mainly in terms of liability, given by the historical and the corporate culture (Hatch & Schultz, 2001). The authors point out a toolkit for creating a strong corporate brand and define in three key aspects: vision, culture, and image. In which the vision is preserved through the managers, the culture through the employees, and the image over the public view and coverage of what the corporate means. These aspects could be distinctive elements from the corporate branding progress.
Thus, to compile the ground base of the corporate brand is fundamental to navigate through this intention of taking a holistic approach regarding the image, the values, and the communication, as a strategic tool in distinguishing from the sea of corporate brands. Scholars often differ when commenting about the central characteristics of a corporate brand, namely because there is a consensus gap between the theoretical view and the practitioners. But the major connection to this aspect brought to urban governance is the way that corporations started to grow in importance and realizing the significance and impact of politics in power, took advantage to undermine or push measures to their advantage, and with the concerns of the increased competitiveness environment.

Relevant for comprehension over the association with the place branding is the neoliberal governance, which embodies the same circumstances and responded similarly. Neoliberal governance and its policies represented a shift from the welfare state support to a more private and market-oriented one, justified by the inability to capital contribution from the state (Sager, 2011). The state of inter-urban competitiveness is less abstract to perceive under the economic institutions that broadly shape and draw the direction of urban policies such as World Trade Organization (WTO), Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), among other powerful agencies (Boisen, 2007). This connection refers to the speculative use of these agencies to promote confidence for investors, and to create uniformity within the countries to secure a network of safe investments. Eventually, this uniformity created the first step into competitiveness, mainly within large cities, and later with mid-size cities as well.

Place branding is seen as a sophisticated tool for the global arrangements of mobile capital, and urban competitiveness. But important to point out that competitiveness at the national level is sometimes not understood as an actual issue, but more of a regional development understanding. (Boisen, 2007) When a city is seen as a passive agent, just absorbing the arrangements that happen on the outside, a lot has been taken out of context, a city is a territorial space where these political and economic decisions and actions take place, so is nothing more than logic, following this thought, to understand the city as an active agent, and therefore the governance that eventually comes with its actors and decision-makers (Harvey, 1989). When Harvey (1989, p.5) underline urbanization as “a spatially grounded social process in which a wide range of different actors with quite different objectives and agendas interact through a particular configuration of interlocking spatial practices” it’s under the perspective of the city as an active agent through these process, and flipping the understanding that a place branding follows the framework of corporate branding, as suggested by some authors (Karatzis, 2004; 2009; Ind and Holm, 2013; Anholt, 2005; Knox and Bickerton, 2003), and establish the place branding as the earliest movement for the formation of the corporate branding.

Consequently, this duality of narrative creates space for the interpretation that, in reality, the movement of corporate/place branding has a more holistic arrangement and that both retro feedbacks each other, in a scheme where both needs to play a vital role paving the way for improvements. Formerly, the connection with a strong corporate brand market and governance that relies on private capital, merge with the attitudes from public departments to adopt the strategies from their partners in business, where the constant framework feedback takes place, and that will be discussed in the next subchapter.

While some commentators diverge in the terms to define the place branding, and even if it is proper the term marketing or branding, Boisen (2007) offers the different framework in which each author uses to underline the aspects that comprise the place branding, whether in terms of creation or development (Figure 2). Accordingly, there is a consensus of theoretical approach among the authors, despite the different methods of categorizing, the difference refers to the shift from the marketing literature, or whether its place marketing or branding, among the most outdated contributions, demonstrating the sophistication of the implementation process of the place branding measures.
2.4 ENTREPRENEURIAL GOVERNANCE

Understanding entrepreneurial governance means to see the scenario that created the conditions to the emergence of place branding, with the refinement of tools and practices from a multidimensional field. But important to highlight that this attempt is not to untangle exhaustively the topic of entrepreneurial governance, but instead, to create an understanding of how this new urban politics works to apply in the investigation and analysis of the system in the case study in the later chapter.

After the deindustrialization of the western economies, and with the rise of the market moving towards service and not the product anymore, debates arise to grasp about the new forms of governance within the cities. These new forms and changes were understood as the public sector operating like the private sector, with profit-driven decision making, promotion, and risk-taking (Hall and Hubbard, 1996). Some authors call the movement as entrepreneurial governance (Harvey, 1989).

Through the post-war restructuring, the local governments became powerful elements and the significance of urban governance started to point to a major and more complex coalition of forces, reassuring its interests into the mobilization and the local placemaking. Although it seems a digression, this management transformation brings the roots of the allocation of the city branding from the corporative approaches into urban governance (Harvey, 1989).

The disruptive shift from the industrialized and product-based economy to a more corporate and service-based, lead to a gap within the working class that obstruct the provision of the welfare state (Jessop, 2012). Hence the increasing influence of the corporates and services in the market, and the decay of the ability of wealth distribution from the governments generate a clear and fluid path to the state dependence of the market money flow. And accordingly, the entrepreneurial forms of governance distinguish the policy for income distribution to a policy of income growth as a form of mutual align the interest of both the free market and urban governance (Hall and Hubbard, 1996).

Often scholars understand the path towards entrepreneurialism as a linear and coherent one (Harvey, 1998; Hall and Hubbard 1989; Boyle and Hughes, 1994; Hospers, 2006; Boisen, 2007). The postwar is a strong mark of new forms of urban governance and added to the post-industrial era, all lead to decay
of state power as formerly known, shifting the goals from governments that used to seek and operate the redistribution of wealth, to a direction of wealth growth (Hall and Hubbard, 1996).

Accordingly, the growth coalitions rise in the social economy realm, and this is seen as the major contributor to push the start in the city competitiveness in the supranational scale, following the leading role of cities in the global economy. Growth coalition can be understood as associations of different countries, such as OECD, NAFTA, and even more plural than that, the European Union. These associations advocate in favour of the measures and take great contributions from local administration and authorities (Hospers, 2006).

Offering a different perception to that linear path, Jessop (2018) articulates this connection of historical factors as a chosen narrative, not discussing the intentions to this selective narrative, he proposes just a look from the narrative construction and strategies for forming a uniformity in movements that are far more organic and far more plural than a linear and cohesive path.

In this sense the postwar economic and political regime has failed and, if cities and regions are to escape the consequences of this failure, it is essential to modify economic strategies, economic institutions, modes of governance, and the form of state. These must be redesigned to prioritize ‘wealth creation’ in the face of international, inter-regional, and intra-regional competition since this is the prior condition of continued social redistribution and welfare. (Jessop, 2018, p. 36)

Therefore, this inverts the process and puts the connection and selective of these historical events as the main cause of entrepreneurial governance. And the presence of a single narrative in presenting entrepreneurialism often hides the plurality of changes in the form of governance within our cities. The connection of events is cohesive and gives a temporal and political framework, while limits the recognition of the different efforts to cope with a different social-economic dynamic, regarding the postwar.

Regardless of the simplification of a broader phenomenon, the important recognition that entrepreneurialism gives at this framework, is the rise of cities as a unity of power and governance. Due to the mobile capital and deregulated markets, the cities and regions are being enforced as a unity of policy agenda even by the national government, recognizing the sovereignty of regional development, and empowering these forms of governance.

The shift that occurs from the postwar environment is drifted away from the dualism of state and market, and far more plural that private-public partnerships (Jessop, 2012) and give the space from a third party to be involved bringing more complexity and thickness to this comprehension that is cities and the regional development, as can be seen in the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF), created since 1975 by the European Commission to support this increasingly direction from governance. (European Comission, 2020)

Accordingly, Hospers (2006) stresses the importance of the focus in regional development with the Oresund region, connecting Denmark with Sweden. The lack of regional focus policies creates an obstruction when referring to the accessibility of the place branding strategies, mainly because thickens the borders of the placemaking in inhabitants of the community, missing the sense of belonging as the Oresund citizens, being divided in an irritational feeling of Danish connected to Sweden’s.

Through the work promoted by Hospers (2006) and Anholt (2007) is possible to expand the scope of the place branding linked with the entrepreneurial governance, extended to regions and nations, the opportunities among the scholars and the practitioners are covered in the different scales. The regional ties to the entrepreneurial governance represent active management to deliver and collect investments
in closer relation among decision-makers and end-users of the civic realm. Therefore, the Regional Development Fund is a response to this political attitude. The main conclusion to draw in this section is a brief understanding of the entrepreneurial debate and why it is important when referring to place branding.
3

DRIVERS OF CHANGE

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Once the second chapter is dedicated to a literature review on the place branding topic, this chapter outlines the drivers that justify the integration of place branding in the urban governance and planning system. Urbanization is recognized to be the major transformative trend of the century, regarding the concentration of problems and adding the solution for housing, infrastructure, basic services, education, decent jobs, safety, and natural resources, contributes to grasping new and more sustainable ways to tackle these issues (UN, 2017).

Therefore, to inquiry and justify the need for a more strategic approach to place branding, some elements understood as drivers of change in our cities and society nowadays will be discussed in this chapter. Furthermore, forwarding these changes increase the understandings of ways the cities are affected by their surroundings. The considerable environment bordered here is the changes that not only affect the way people engage with space but also the way it surroundings response, whereas political, social, institutional commits in return.

Thus, the changes scrutinized represents the social attributes that build the relationships taking place in the urban areas, to comprehend the nature of these changes and hereafter work forward. Additionally, the digital changes play a critical role in the architecture of the human-space relations, therefore is mandatory to acknowledge these changes and understanding it whereas a path to progress, such as the digital evolutions in the public transport, likewise the digital governance structured by the social aspects. The last transformation discussed is the environmental constraints that tailor all the prospects, once regards the resources that are the base of human life.

Through the definition and scrutiny of the discussion, this chapter aims at proposing a reflection in the debate of the city’s image and the place branding, conclusively showing a justification to this view. By disclosing the perception of combining the place branding to public transport is just an attempt to explore a recent and abstract debate, this chapter offers the reasons this connection can be justified through the profile of the society nowadays.

3.2 SOCIAL FRAME AND THE DRIVERS OF CHANGE

Through the attempt to grasp the behavioural patterns that shape society, scholars dedicated efforts in tracing the scenario of past generations to understand the leading events and the impacts of these
moments in the development of a collective behavioural reaction. And despite not the only tool in providing a social forecast, these studies of generations are present in considerable fields benefiting from these frameworks for better accurate predictions.

As stated in the previous chapter, the social capital concept (Florida, 2005) consists of the exploration based on people being in the core of urban and economic growth. Therefore understanding what drives the collective patterns became a considerable concern, consequently progressive intentions of mapping and monitoring human behaviour, performed by institutions dedicated to design and survey the mentality of people, aims to respond to this increasing demand (Dimock, 2019).

Reinforcing that generational structure is in no way a holistic approach towards outlining the collective behaviour, as critics arguments that sharp definitions into the people demeanour is far from an agreement strategy (Williams, Page, Petrosky, and Hernandez, 2010). Yet, provides a strong tool in looking for the concentration side that the cities will hold soon, supports, and defines the basis of more people-oriented programs, in targeting to build the social capital.

Sharing collectively world events like the world wars, and the beginning of corporatisation in the economy forges the environment for conduct responses to coping with these effects as a unity. Therefore, the efforts went on understanding what is the major shared response into the generations that display directions useful for the effectiveness of forecasting. The generations are generally differentiated as depression generation, born from 1930 through 1945; the baby boomers, born between 1946-1964; generation X, with births between 1965-1977; generation Y, commonly known as “millennials” for being the first generation to face the new millennium, born during 1977-1994; and finally the generation Z, born after 1994 and without a definition of the former years (Williams et al., 2010).

The date definition is a topic of debate, regarding the methods of framing each generation, whether for events shared or the year gap that differentiate them (Barr, 2019). Despite the critics, the structure of generations, to analyse and understand the different world views and perceptions, provides a more assertive look into the data delimited by age, and thus these interactions of the conceptual structure together, considering the collective analysis, can show the different perceptions of the world that will co-habited the urban environment (Dimock, 2019).

The work performed by Williams et al (2010) shows that from the generation X, multiculturalism started to act as the norm, and the people from this generation displays a great value for the visual perceptions, whether for the effort put into the dressing, and going to the response to the brand visual attributes. Accordingly, this trend increased in the generation Y, seeing as more image-driven, and again from the generation X, the technology conformity is another increasing norm, having the digital trend and the image perceptions, a strong asset for our today’s society. Yet, a deceased trend seeing in the younger generations is the materialism, once the consumption is attributed to the climate crisis environment.

In 2015, the millennials or generation Y surpass as the most expressive generation of the voting-age population within the U.S. and Bloomberg dedicated thorough exercise to grasps what are the world view in this generation perspectives. What was discovered was that in general, the millennials represent a consciousness that put the social values, like social justice and the role of governments in providing these rights (Kessler, 2015). And reinforces the study from Williams et al. (2010) through data suggesting a generation that is more concerned with the environmental degradation, and ways to tackle these effects.

Recognising the millennials in the strategic planning framework has helped many institutions forecasts of the near future decisions, and therefore an intense characterization, mainly focused on millennials is relevant in understanding the latest drivers of change. The period this generation grew up is marked with
the rise of divorce inside families, the AIDS crisis, and the drug abuse. Still what shaped this generation is the internet connectivity, with the emergence of services like Google and eBay, creating the awareness of a global world which the boundaries are more flexible and transparent (Williams et al., 2010).

Therefore, with the possibilities of broad education millennials are expected to represent the highest educated generation, and this is associated with their ability to respond actively within the climate crisis measures. They are innovative and represent a strong favour for entrepreneurialism once they lived through the crisis of 2008 and needed to respond to the depletion of the job offer. Figure 3 shows the significance of unemployment and job offer in U.S. Additionally, they are pessimist with the politic leaders and the process of decision making believing that governments should increase the role and control over the social justice, as shown in Figure 4 (Williams et al., 2010; Kessler, 2015).

From the viewpoint of the urban and transportation, millennials are more inclined than the previous generations to live in cities throughout their lives and considering car ownership this generation is breaking the social norm of buying cars as a necessity. The millennials world view is extremely concentrated towards the urban sustainable environment, once data shows the preference for a walkable neighbourhood, and the characteristics mentioned above. And despite the judgement of the highly criticized structure of generations data analysis, these findings represent a relevant shift towards the change in the increasingly dense urban environment of our cities (Grisby et al., 2018).

Through developing the right structure of analysis can provide a more robust tool for the drafts to undertake the policies. These demographic changes reflect the social shifts in pursuance to cope with economic and political events. Therefore, comprise the social and economic scenario and prospects for improvements. Another point worth addressing is the effect of the people’s concentration on the spatial scale, which often can lead to a more socially cohesive outlook, justifying the generations analysis approach and turning into the efficiency of the measures to be taken, once the target group can be comprehensive and accurate.
3.3 Digital governance and institutional change

Cities and territories are embedded in the modern problems, such as climate change, immigration, and the changing flow of the world economy, attracting the attention of multiple actors to promote the advancements in - what they believe - the best scenario for a change. Responsively, cities represent laboratories for testing different actions towards problem-solving or even forecasting in avoidance of the prospect issues (da Cruz, Rode, and McQuarrie, 2019).

Scholars attribute these transformations in the rationale of the new urban governance (da Cruz et al., 2019; Dunleavy, Margetts, Bastow, and Tinkler, 2006), the institutional change (Healey, 1998), neo-liberal urban planning (Sager, 2011), entrepreneurial city (Hall and Hubbard, 1996; Harvey, 1989), New Public Management. (Dunleavy et al, 2006) Although some with dated production, these efforts remain fundamental in our progression understanding of the shifts that occur and how to relate them with the present time. Worth mention that these commentators attempt to remain around the planning system conception.

Thus, among the debate, there is considerable agreement in these shifts proximity to the deindustrialization and the change in the welfare system post-war (Harvey, 1989; Jessop, 2018; Healey, 1998). Since these historical frameworks will not be discussed, the relevance for this work relies on taking notice of the aspects that intrinsically changes the dynamics in the urban system. Only by an appropriation of the multidisciplinary that tackles cities, the planning system is enabled to absorb and properly perform the management of our urban environment.

The investigation conducted by Harvey draws an important ground in recognizing that these new meanings regarding urban governance, refer to the role of urbanization under capitalism. Further, he presents the dialectical that concerns this implication. “This implies that though urban processes under capitalism are shaped by the logic of capital circulation and accumulation, they in turn, shape the conditions and circumstances of capital accumulation at later points in time and space” (Harvey, 1989, p.3).

Therefore, cities increasingly become the major component of capital growth and change in nature, the management approach. Once the fundamental role of redistribution of welfare became driven by the free market, and welfare growth the urban administration is required to operate under markets motives to promote financial and social balance (Hall and Hubbard, 1996). And as stated before, these are the changes that have been occurring ever since, with the difference of the incidence of phenomena within the city concentrative aspect, for instance, that constructs increased space to institutionalize the flow of change.

These background contexts are relevant when grasping public transport in a condition where the service provider doesn’t contribute in accountability to immerse into the urban context of the city, creating and enlarging the bridge between the sense of belonging and the, so important, service adherence. Nowadays, tackling mass transportation means considering the environment and sustainability impact that urban governance and the city’s built environment constantly burden. When transitioning from the “managerialism to entrepreneurialism”, governance shifted their active role in public administration to an enabling role, opening paths towards deregulation, the planning process flexibility, and the increased involvement of the private sector, and a decreased effort in ensuring socio-economic equity (da Cruz et al., 2019).

Accordingly, the blurred borders of the capital flow, also enable the management of public services provisions to be made with capital interests outside the national scale, and the public transport sector is the one that urges for integration to align the private goals to the public aspect of accountability.
Nevertheless, the integration within the public transport sector is not an easy task, but necessary in favour of disclaiming the stakeholders and secondly, their role and responsibility in the results. Increased demand for policies and governance integration illustrates the need to address the negative outcomes from the sectorial policies of previous decades, particularly in the field of urban transport (OECD, 2001a).

Targeting integration in urban policies relates to the involvement of different levels of stakeholders, including public participation in the process of cross-sectoral policymaking, at the same time enabling the build of social institutional capacity. Rode (2019) defines some integrations framework, where he addresses the governance structures, integration instruments, and enabling conditions. Which will further, be valuables tools for assessing the case studies while identifying the aspects of integration within public transportation and the city branding efforts.

Whenever the analysis of the current strategies undertakes urban governance, a conceptual consistency outlines the approach to revert the aspects that were once encouraged by public administrators with the scope of entrepreneurialism (da Cruz et al., 2019; Pierre, 2019). Scholars see the “enabling role” of the state harmful for the collective aims of the society since it provides an incentive for a selective group for them to provide the collective incentives for the general public, in a clear move to a passive administration (Dunleavy et al., 2006; Jessop, 2018; Pierre, 2019; Tavares, 2018). Conversely, now the movement towards an integration of the systems, where once was adapt to disintegration, shapes the most recent debate to enforce further steps into urban governance.

For instance, take the research of da Cruz et al (2019) reviewing the themes under analysis in the scope of governance, it shows the majority of works that tackles the representative aspects into the public life, see in Table 2, the work aims at providing an insight about the gap between the vision through the urban managers and scholars, as shown in Table 3, with the biggest urban governance challenge.

Table 2 – Urban Governance challenges to scholars. Source: da Cruz et al (2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ranking</th>
<th>Urban governance challenge category</th>
<th>Number of publications, n (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Citizen participation (individual citizens) in decision making</td>
<td>147 (30)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Current institutional shortcomings (not fit for purpose, obsolete)</td>
<td>80 (20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Government capability (general)</td>
<td>73 (18)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Civil society organization engagement with decision making</td>
<td>62 (15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Working across government tiers (vertical coordination)</td>
<td>60 (15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Jurisdictional boundaries</td>
<td>59 (14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Private sector involvement in governance</td>
<td>56 (14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Institutional fragmentation</td>
<td>54 (13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Governance restructuring/reform</td>
<td>48 (12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Public budget constraints</td>
<td>48 (12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Political engagement with electorate</td>
<td>45 (11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Cooperative/partnership governance</td>
<td>45 (11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Government’s access to skills and knowledge</td>
<td>45 (11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Adapting governance structures to changing circumstances</td>
<td>44 (11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Private sector delivery of public services</td>
<td>43 (11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Government efficiency</td>
<td>42 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Implementation of policy</td>
<td>42 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Government management capability</td>
<td>41 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Information/skills deficit for engagement with citizens</td>
<td>40 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Government’s strategic management/visibility</td>
<td>39 (10)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For this work, what da Cruz et al. (2019) display as contrasting, is showing the incapability of the entrepreneurialism and the private sector to meet the demands on both ends. Whereas as urban managers the city still requires the capacity of generating capital, one major reason for the interplay within the public and private sector (e.g. building incentives for companies to generate jobs, and therefore raise the number of taxpayers and contributors), however, the disregard of the citizen participation into the decision making can generate social conflicts in the near future. And in the arena of representation in the state scale, that goes beyond public participation and often enters the field of prejudice representations of a target neighbourhood, such as the cases of stigmatizing and hardly reversed narratives (Helmore, 2017).

The incentivization mechanism is solid and troublesome to be reversed once the merge between the private and public sectors was established by a disaggregation from the traditional planning tools and mechanisms, hence the public governance comprehensively relies on external budget instruments. As Dunleavy et al. (2006, p. 7) stated “public sector managers often have had little choice but to continue looking for new forms of incentivization mechanisms to supplement their dwindling apparatus of control”

Ultimately, after tackling the needs for integration of agenda in the spatial system, comes the further steps that seem to have increasingly become part of the urban management, that is the evolutions brought through IT, with regards to city branding and public governance. The progress in this field shined possibilities not only in the incorporation by the public administrators, but the way to improve the decision-making process and the citizen engagement through the digitalization of the proceedings, where the channels of communication and ways of interacting have changed.

According to Dunleavy et al. (2006), the impacts of IT transformations in the late 1990s do not represent a great impact on governance. Notwithstanding, the digital era governance represents a whole complexity of new problems and new possibilities to tackle the former ones. An important representation

Table 3 – Urban Governance challenges to authorities. Source: da Cruz et al (2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ranking</th>
<th>Urban governance challenge category</th>
<th>Number of cities, n (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Insufficient public budgets</td>
<td>28 (50)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Politicization of local issues</td>
<td>21 (38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Interdependence of policy issues</td>
<td>21 (38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Inflexible bureaucracies/rigid rules</td>
<td>20 (36)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Lack of municipal autonomy</td>
<td>17 (30)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Overlapping responsibilities</td>
<td>17 (30)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Working across different tiers of government</td>
<td>17 (30)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Access to useful information</td>
<td>16 (29)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Lack of respect for laws and regulations</td>
<td>15 (27)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Lack of capacity to enforce laws and regulations</td>
<td>15 (27)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Lack of skills in local government</td>
<td>14 (25)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Uncertainty of funding</td>
<td>14 (25)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Risks of corruption</td>
<td>13 (23)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Limited scope of responsibilities</td>
<td>13 (23)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Coordination of different sectors/departments</td>
<td>13 (23)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Limited access of citizens to policymaking</td>
<td>11 (20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Lack of interest of citizens on local issues</td>
<td>11 (20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Lack of trust in local government</td>
<td>10 (18)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Lack of political stability</td>
<td>8 (14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Underrepresentation of vulnerable groups</td>
<td>6 (11)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Data from LSE Cities, UN-Habitat, and UCLG (2016).
from how these transformations happen in the structure of the system is shown in Figure 5 with the effects of the adjustment in the society and therefore, the approach from urban managers.

The Figure 5 illustrates that as the consumer’s and corporate’s change to adapt to new technologies, so the government has different channels of demand and need to address to these innovations, by the parallel action. Notice that the core of the analysis is in the civil society and the public agencies, and even so is impossible to address the transformations in the business sector, justifying the reflection of the blurred line that still exists within this division. Dunleavy et al. (2006, p.480) state that to recognize the changes in governance through the digitalization of services on the way it is operationalized “(…)Instead of electronic channels being seen as supplementary to conventional administrative and business processes, they become genuinely transformative, moving toward a situation where the agency “becomes its Web site,” as a senior official in the Australian Tax Office described this process to us.”

![The Centrality of Information Technology (IT) Changes in Contemporary Public Management Change](image)

Nonetheless, the digital era governance is not a consensus and not even an agreement in its capacity to confront the problems. The work of da Cruz et al. (2019) outlines it as technocracy. But there’s a strong recognition of the new forms of engaging with the issues mentioned above through the digital devices and mechanism, and there’s even a collective aim in targeting the means that entrepreneurialism and the “enabling role” of public sector damage the democracy of our cities and the legitimacy of citizens through the absence of participation (UN, 2017).

Therefore, the digital era is not the answer to all the societal problems but is a means to approach responsively to them. And the central role of Information Technology, place the digital age at the centre of urban governance, opening the paths towards new forms of power and tools for management, once “cities are often testing beds for innovative, risky, or controversial approaches to social or environmental problems. Being leaner—and less able to tap into traditional sources of public revenue—local governments are frequently keen to experiment with new ways of governing, planning, generating income (or reducing spending), and managing public assets and services.” (da Cruz et al., 2019, p.13).

Nevertheless, the incentive on marketing and promotion measures keeps under blurred lines in these apprehensions, formerly because of the immediate actions legitimated by the Information Technology (Paganoni, 2012). And here, the attempt is to grasp on what drives the assertion that supports the integration of city brand efforts into public governance. The first reason is that the construction of knowledge and the practice capacity is relying on city entrepreneurs, from the strategic and business
areas of expertise that often can generate conflicting interests with the placemaking idea, meaning a great part of residents are left under representative in the efforts of creating an image for the city.

### 3.4. Digital Transportation

Regarding the digital era, and the scope of public transportation, the critical trend that planners foresee shortly is the holistic development of Mobility as a Service (MaaS). By acknowledging this process, represents grasping the elements that will shape the city’s surroundings as a means of taking a proactive attitude towards the construction of a city’s image. Therefore, this attempts to encompassing the debates that concern this innovation while adds to the factor of the little attention being given to the position that branding elements will perform in the built environments of our cities.

Recognize that traditional modes of public-private partnerships in the public transportation sector no longer respond positively, neither meet the demands for social welfare, are the reasons the planning system seems so focused on innovation. In 2014 the thesis of Heikkilä shed the light on the sector of Mobility as a service, whereas the trend was occurring in many other sectors, it was with the conceptual framework of the ITS (Intelligent Transport Systems) and the behavioural reading of the Helsinki society that this new concept started to attract the planner's attention (Heikkilä, 2014; Smith, Sochor, and Karlsson, 2018).

Definitions for the Mobility as a Service seems broad and speculative on the sense that depended on different context and the purpose of the question (Smith et al., 2018). More than lack of consensus is the broad attempt in integration the conceptual framework of MaaS within the practice, that seems to be more blurred, and melting through the definitions and separations of transport choice we once knew. Therefore, the definition can be grasped as a mobility interface that delivers compact and distributes transportation choices tailored to each need through a service provider (Jittrapirom et al., 2017). As a mobility self-service solution to face societal changes such as urbanization, congestion and environmental issues to enable the integration of different modes of transport and digital services (Surakka, Härri, Hahtela, Horila, and Michl, 2018). Additionally defined as integrative modal transport into seamless, tailored offering services to connect the mobility customer need (Smith et al., 2018). Or even a simpler and comprehensively approach of service via mobile applications to offer different transport means, public and private as an easy-to-use system for the end-customer (Rantasila, 2015).

The definition of the MaaS proposed here is not an exhaustive attempt to remove all conceptual barriers, but it is relevant to mark that intrinsically depends on the context in which the stakeholders are involved, making the definition important when outlining the limits of each actor reach, accountability and capability. And the purpose of relating the MaaS with the city branding framework stands a means of understanding the level of integration with the city efforts to reach the challenges mentioned in the previous section 3.1.

Attempting to conceptualize the MaaS system, Heikkilä (2014) compare the deregulation in provision and distribution with other sectors, such as telecommunications, energy market, railroad, and airline. And with regards to the business model, these sectors can draft a lot of knowledge in conducting and institutionalizing the innovations within public transport. What remains in the field that this works address, is how the city will cope with an increasingly develop mechanism that makes obvious and noticeable that private unities are running the image of the city.

Although the debate around the feasibility of the model is not intensely treated in this work, rather than understanding its effects on the brand integration level, there is still ongoing research and discussion around the best way to implement this innovative system. Whether to draw the best business plan or
reach the best outcome for all parts involved. But the consideration taken here is the impact on the level of unfavourable effects for the public transport usage, and for the integration within the city image branding (Hensher, 2017). Once clear that the image delivered is a minimal concern of the implementation process, this neglect contributes to accelerating a problem stated respecting the difficulty in citizens to relate with the environment. Therefore, the feeling of being underrepresented in a scenario of different actors actively trying to promote the best-known way to commute through your city. Hence, the implementation process and the choice of stakeholders need to take the built environment’s effect into account.

Nevertheless, the endeavour of drawing the best scenario possible structured an elucidative division between the possible stakeholders that could be participating through the decision making. The simpler separation, divide actors between public and private, bringing the strengths and weakness of each player contribution, formerly the ability of the public sector to produce innovative systems is tied to the bureaucracy that forbids the sector to follow the fast pace adaptation that innovation requires, and secondly, there is the private sector that comprises the needs to deregulation to participate in such societal good service, conflicting with the profit-driven core value of the actors. Figure 6 relates with the distribution from the Swedish context to bring light the problems in dividing such blurred lines, as the private and the public in the service delivery (Smith et al., 2018).

Figure 6 – Core roles in the current (detached) and (integrated) MaaS value chains. Source: Smith et al (2018)

This study is relevant because illustrates the possibilities in taking each choice regarding public accountability, and the private delivery of service. Once the concept of MaaS started with a Finland attempts (Heikkilä, 2014), the development of these service within the northern European countries is more advanced, and although they share a specific context in common, is still useful to other countries to draw conclusions taken this into account. The project of Finland to be the first Mobility as a Service city-wide brings together 23 partners and aims at providing a tailored for each socio-demographic user, on the open market business model and brand cooperation. This purpose led to launch the operation of Kutsuplus, an on-demand bus service to connect the requirement of low-density areas (Kamargianni, Li, and Matyas, 2016). And four years later, the project was shut down, with a lot of its goals fulfilled, but the public sector failed to deliver the financial sustainability, justifying that the choices were costing a great amount of taxpayers money (Sulopuisto, 2016).

Despite the clear, deprive of action from the public sector is an important remark that this says more about the choices of Finland than the MaaS abilities to achieve a sustainable requirement. But addressing the main purpose of MaaS within this scope represents that despite these private actors can joint up with the authority governance, there is a known case of market-driven approach towards improving mobility, that already has caused controversy over the inadequacy of these companies accountable. The disruption in systems caused by these companies has created a conflicting stage for even similar business model. Uber is a well-known American based company, and are now presented in 71 countries, and more than
900 cities (Uber, 2020). And in this case, is important to delineate the definition scope of MaaS, once when convenient these companies claim to be technology providers that cannot be accounted to their effects, and often favourable uses the transportation modal swift to address it sustainable efforts.

Among the scholars there is a strong agreement that MaaS needs to be public transport centric, cause otherwise will disrupt the competitive balance between individual transportation, with ride-sharing and car-sharing services, once conceives the car ride even more appealing only switching from car ownership to car ridership (Hensher, 2017; 2018). In this sense, is critical that the providers build the space for a healthy and environmental aware alteration since the first mile and last mile by a modal change can enhance the collective transportation usage. As shown in Table 4, the holistic approach to include all modal shares within the scope of the integration provider, not only make the platform more appealing as creating a good observational data collection, when the user is given all the choices available. As shown in Table extracted from the work of Kamargianni et al (2016).

This brings the reflection of public transport being represented through different agents, stakeholders, and actors in the service delivered. Once the comparison between the telecommunications and energy market is feasible, is also true that these services are more invisible in our daily life, even the railroad and the airlines are far more shielded from the urban arena than the public transport. So, is also a case to take the consideration over the aspects that the city of the future will have and how this impacts our wellbeing. Considering that is true that the public sector is no longer able to provide the level of services the cities need, is also true that the private sector has conflicting interests and the open market for the service integration with public transport can mean the promotional measures regarding the choice of users, in what Hollands (2015) calls the corporate smart city.

Table 4 – Integral approach in the MaaS platforms. Source: Hollands (2015)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scheme</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Integration Type*</th>
<th>Modes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STIB-Cambio</td>
<td>Brussels, Belgium</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>car-sharing, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oixxit</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi + flight, coach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moovel</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switchh</td>
<td>Hamburg, Germany</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi + ferry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hannovermobel</td>
<td>Hannover, Germany</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMM/A</td>
<td>Montpellier, France</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility Mixx</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NS-Business Card</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radius Total Mobility</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smile**</td>
<td>Vienna, Austria</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>bike-sharing, car-sharing, car rental, rail, urban public transport, taxi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Once the main discussion over the MaaS is draft, the purpose is to imagine the city with the different operators, with a great chance of being international operators or even providers, in a competitive open market, where they need to compete for the costumer's attention and desire. Envision this city can be close to the scenario of a dystopic movie for the most sceptical, and close to futuristic house appliances commercials for the more trustworthy. But whereas this city is still something that we can imagine, is crucial to reach the debate of the new ways that a city, as an institutional scale of people sharing common
habs and often historical past, can contribute more proactively to create healthy and fair conditions of
growth, of innovation and capital revenue.

As mentioned in the previous chapter, and the previous topic of this chapter, the “enable governance”
intermittently let opportunities of capital growth and concentration in the corporative sector, whereas
could be taking the front seat in shaping our societal cities, confronting the political systems that they
often rely upon. Problems that are also enhanced by the public transport provisions and land use
planning, such as urban poverty and segregation, inequality and social polarisation, in dimensions of
cultural and political will not see better days only by adopting and implementing technological solutions
within our cities (Hollands, 2015).

Nonetheless, as the scope of uniformisation is being widely discussed, the integration within the built
environment of the providers are being left out, but elements such as the user perception of the service,
and also the impact of the city advertise system is crucial to the development in the long term of the
MaaS. And this decision should play a key role in defining the scope and approach of regulations and
deregulations for the evolution of this mobility trend. Defining the importance of market deregulation
to create an attractive setting for private actors to enter (Surakka et al., 2018); the central role of public
transport for the sustainable outcome the trend proposes to achieve (Hensher, 2017) and the
consideration of the corporative surrounding and effects for the image of the city and also for the process
of incentive liveable and inclusive cities (Holland, 2015).

Although little evidence on the role of the massive promotion of the mobility services in our cities,
mainly due to the little and evolving number of companies, it must be a scenario to consider in advance
whereas the regulations are still being discussed. A reform in the way we perceive public and private
role must be taken in practice for the definition of policies that incentive companies to invest and the
public authorities to have the measures to supervise the fair articulation and service equity.

The information is in the core of digitalization and innovation of services, being this asset from the data
collection or from the message for the announcement of a new service, that often means a proposed
change in behaviour. And the user perspective not being central to the discussion represents a
technological determinist, on other hand, whereas the user perspective is mandatory to tackle the goal
of a reached change in behaviour, whether on the usage of the car or the adoption of the required
platform. In this regard, Lyons et al. (2019) offer a paramount contribution to the cognitive elements
that surround the adoption of MaaS, as shown in Figure 7.
With that in mind, we take the reflection to an emerging debate that tries to plan the implementation of different services, added the branding of these services targeting the social and cultural aspects of urban commuter that will soon reach the life of the consumers. Previous research focusing on the implementation barriers of the integration’s platforms discover that brand plays an important element in the desire to change behaviour and choose a target platform (Davies, 2012). Applying that into several services providers can help to imagine the city under all the incentives and propagandas to attract the population decision towards the desired service, making the case for an integrated and semi-regulated brand approach on this service.

Therefore, this emphasizes a trend within the MaaS, after displaying the discussions and issues that revolve around the process that will take on the front seat of this innovative system in cities, is important to perceive the arena of promotion and competitiveness that will concern the customers daily life, and once again, the evolution of the social market is the branding in different level for different stakeholders (Hatch et al., 2001). This makes the case for seeing the city branding as a bubble that holds and support sub-brands from their spectrum, once a company expands to one country, the efforts to promote their service is to understand its environment and brand it.

3.5. ENVIRONMENT CONCERNS IN THE DIGITAL ERA

Undertake the environmental green emissions has been an exercise since the Rio Earth Summit, in 1992. Ever since there is a strong agreement of the common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities to reverse the climate impacts in the post-industrialization era, and although this agreement signed by more than 100 governments, the issues over the climate emissions have seemed more complex and multidimensional than expected (UN, 2020).

Therefore, the actions and impacts of the urbanisation are being discovered periodically with the research of methods and indicator to the habits and behaviours enhanced in the urban agglomerations that undermine the climate change resolutions. The digital scope allowed further investigation under the possible scenarios for investments and priorities. Yet, the consensus over the climate change investments brought a break in the traditional decision-making process, considering the uncertainties that each choice and scenario can predict. While the climate change is territorially incident, and a global effort, the unity
omission towards proactive actions put the agents under uncertainties that weren’t faced before (Kalra et al., 2014).

Consider the uncertainty with the future of the climate change affects investments in infrastructure deemed the bases of the traditional economic growth, and to reduce the uncertainties and develop smart and efficient choices, the researchers are focusing in developing indicators and methodologies to quantify the sustainable development. How much of the political choices are addressing climate change, and how is the country response rate, are among the efforts to promote efficient decision making, since the scarcity of resources is path-dependent on choices made globally. Therefore, ICT is creating a new niche in the environmental agenda, with the share of innovations and the emergence of a new business model (Kalra et al., 2014).

A business model that supports research and innovation to produce services or products aiming at reducing the waste and focus on the environment is considered a green business model. The development of this form of business is part of the Green Growth Agenda, which targets the detachment of the economic growth from environmental degradation (Beltramello, Haie-Fayle, & Pilat, 2013). According to the paper report, the transition for this business can occur through incremental innovation, in improving existing production methods; through the disruptive innovation, that creates a shift from the traditional ways of producing and consuming; and radical innovation which involves a much deeper change in the product-service systems.

Acknowledge these transformations in the urban surroundings and being regularly responsive to them creates resilience to the immediate challenges that the organization's been addressing. A study from 2010 discussed the effects of the denial in the general population with regards to climate impacts, and the findings show that, despite apparent efforts for misinformation campaigns, people did care about the environmental future of the planet. While considering respective responses and the attempts to push the population to the opposite side came from big industries, such as the coal, petroleum, and automobiles sector (Norgaard, 2010). Accordingly, this provides an appealing basis to understand the power of the digital ICT nowadays, because the social media acts as a tool that goes both ways, once promote the engagement in a clear and spread form, but also favour the travel of misinformation.

Grasp the role of the environmental policies and planning nowadays, represents an extensive effort, and this attempt is based on the role of this switch on the urban environment whereas social change, representing the engagement of people in consuming and promoting awareness towards the environmental agenda goal. And this alone is an important national tool considering the competitive global economy as mentioned in the previous chapter. The attractiveness of a place today is intrinsically connected to the leadership role in these challenges, endorsed by all the multilateral organisations such as OECD, World Bank and United Nations.

Once the major transformative trends of the 21st century will be the urbanisation (UN, 2017), the challenge lies in creative and proactive ways of addressing economic growth and reverse environmental degradation. An attempt in this direction is pursued by the Business and Sustainable Development Commission report (2017) focusing on the green business development as a new model to promote the economic and strategic growth, with the enhancement of sustainable development goals from United Nations. The report points the urgency to move from the fossil fuels dependency and attempt to quantify the amount of the global share GDP that can be compromised if the business model continues to focus on the traditional modes of development (see Figure 8).
The report is based on the disruptive aspect of the sustainable impacts and the acknowledgement of taking the proactive role, allowing for better approaches in dealing with the innovations. Moreover, the sustainability will impact the business the same way that digital technologies disrupt every business sector, and from that, the leaders can grasp benchmarks to forecast that not preparing for this scenario can and will make business obsolete. Like stated “The majority of businesses successfully targeting sustainable market opportunities today are built on digital technologies (…). And digital industry groups and policymakers are collaborating already to see how and where digital technologies can speed progress towards the Global Goals and to develop enabling policy.” (BSDC, 2017, p.24).

Through these affirmative actions towards promoting the awareness, the international organisations and institutions aims at shifting the business mentality, focused on the traditional methods that can no longer co-exist in a world that face urgent environmental challenges. Therefore, environmental concerns are increasingly shaping the social economy model. And these concerns go beyond blaming the past actions or the unproductive dialectic of private/public role in the front. As stated in the first paragraph, the focus is on the common but differentiated goals in promoting sustainable adjustments. Following this, the private role can generate the market coupled with an advantage in taking the front in the face of the challenges, and the public sector, with the increased accountability to deliver the green agenda outcome within our cities. As shown in Figure 9, the incremental value to sectors of the economy that are marked as being shared through public and private partnerships.
The incremental value added to the mobility systems is due to the urgency of the switch of fossil fuels base. Therefore, through the evolution of the drivers of change in our societal values, this comes as an arrangement need to confront the traditional values that keep sabotaging the growth in different dimensions. The digital transformations conceive the tools and instruments to measure, monitor and, produce what is necessary to deviate from the long-established ways of business.

With regards to a holistic approach towards the environment, the companies are increasingly assimilating the guidelines of the green business. The literature in proximity with the discussion of green business is the brand value and brand equity concepts, first, it respects to the value added to the brand in financial terms and market share, and the second referring to the distinguishable and differentiated value in the costumer's perception of the brand. Thus, the conception of place brand equity comprises a relevant structure to analyse the strategic effects of green business development for places (Florek, 2015).

Fundamentally, the green business plays a central role in the economic progress confirmedly more than a trend rather an evolution of the models that shape urban aggregations. Therefore, the consolidation as a driver of changes, gives the place branding a more strategic and holistic aspect inside the spatial complexities, justifying the necessary appropriation of the debate and discussions in the urban planners’ considerations.

---

**Figure 9** – Incremental value opportunities in 2030. Source: Business and Sustainable Development Commission (2017)

The incremental value added to the mobility systems is due to the urgency of the switch of fossil fuels base. Therefore, through the evolution of the drivers of change in our societal values, this comes as an arrangement need to confront the traditional values that keep sabotaging the growth in different dimensions. The digital transformations conceive the tools and instruments to measure, monitor and, produce what is necessary to deviate from the long-established ways of business.

With regards to a holistic approach towards the environment, the companies are increasingly assimilating the guidelines of the green business. The literature in proximity with the discussion of green business is the brand value and brand equity concepts, first, it respects to the value added to the brand in financial terms and market share, and the second referring to the distinguishable and differentiated value in the costumer's perception of the brand. Thus, the conception of place brand equity comprises a relevant structure to analyse the strategic effects of green business development for places (Florek, 2015).

Fundamentally, the green business plays a central role in the economic progress confirmedly more than a trend rather an evolution of the models that shape urban aggregations. Therefore, the consolidation as a driver of changes, gives the place branding a more strategic and holistic aspect inside the spatial complexities, justifying the necessary appropriation of the debate and discussions in the urban planners’ considerations.
4

PUBLIC TRANSPORT FRAMEWORK

4.1. PROMOTING PUBLIC TRANSPORT

The public transport framework adopted in this dissertation is related to the city brand, the promotional measures, and attitudes towards incentive this mode of transportation. Attempts to answering the question of how to translate the city branding in the city policies and the promotional efforts to increase the usage of public transport is a means to understand what are the messages behind the design decisions of the action plan.

As stated in the literature review, there is a constant appropriation from the urban managers of the corporation’s language and structure, and within the transportation is no different, as the users are often seen as the consumers of a product or a service, and the approach that is being widely used is the market mix as public policies, to address these costumers and their choices, managing the demand to match with what it can provide, involving a certain context (Ibeas, Dell’Olio, and Montequín, 2011; Moran and Jones, 1975; Taniguchi, Fuji, Azami, and Ishida, 2014).

Correspondingly to this increased merge, there is an interesting line to be draft and concerns with the conception of seeing the users of the public transport as costumers. Certainly, the awareness of the market for this purpose is important, and show to be beneficial from certain points of view, and the relation of public transport investment and economic growth is not questioned here, but the response in the policies to accommodate the changes is where lies the need for revision. Since the entrepreneurial day's policies with this regard tend to encourage the deregulation, privatisation, and the internationalisation through the liberal trade, what is a characteristic of this trend and occurred not only in the transportation sector (Banister and Berechman, 2001).

Increasing with regards to promotional measures in the urban arena, and the distress of the entrepreneurialism effects to urban justice, is the idea of the social marketing, that is defined by the systemically use of the traditional market techniques to target and address a voluntary change in behaviour that is identified as harmful for the society. The benefit for public health is the major goal in social marketing, with examples ranging from the campaigns to stop tobacco use, to prevent childhood obesity, along with others. The term was first used 25 years ago, with the idea of connecting market principles to improve social causes and behaviours (Kotler and Lee, 2008).

Additionally, Kotler and Lee (2008) defines what separates the traditional marketing from the social marketing, and one of the difference relies on purpose, once the first sell goods, products and services,
the second sells the desired behaviour, and undoubtedly works for the divergent concept of clients, that distinction is the major and most important concerning public transportation promotional measures.

The definition and development of social marketing show the effort to integrate the requirements for more public accountability. As our cities become more urbanized and concentrate diversified groups, the social market became the face of a private solution to a public outcome, and there is when the definitions and roles of public and private accountability evolve into foggy boundaries, as were discussed in chapter 3.

Immediately discussing the promotional role with the scope of public transport, there is concise evidence of the impacts approaching the investment in informational measures, but public transport related to the economic growth can never be seen excluded from factors such as the externalities, that in this case can be the level of agglomeration, and the labour market (Banister et al, 2001) or the citizen participation in the decisions (Ibeas et al, 2001). And going even further, the work of Banister (2001) proposes the conditions to associate be the best scenario in consideration to a transportation promotional investment, as shown in Figure 10.

And the evidence in favour of promoting a changing behaviour identify the means to do so and can be categorized between soft as informational and associations with the behaviour desired, from its opposite hard measures that means a more active intervention from the governance, for instance with taxation and regulations deemed more robust. The approach from the soft measures has a strong competitive side within the car automotive parties. Cars are strongly advertised, and that creates the scenario for the counter-advertise (OECD, 2002). The development of soft measures opens a broad range of research regarding this effect on the consumer’s side. One effort goes to understanding the most effective method whereas in framing the negatives or framing the positive outcomes for the desired behaviour.

Moreover, the method is often assessed in persuasive communication, once it offers a voluntary behavioural change, can be displayed in the cognitive emphasis and the motivational emphasis, whereas
the first focus on the attributes being shown in the hierarchical level of importance, reasonably, and the second focus on explaining the importance of that suggestion (Taniguchi et al, 2014).

Therefore, the promotional measures are the combination of sales, advertise, public relations, and the control of corporate image (Moran et al, 1975). And after explaining the attributes that comprise the promotion of public transport and the connection with the social market in the path towards addressing the citizen support, the associations shows that once the lack of participation can damage and undermine the public transport investments, formerly one of the causes of pushing the users away from the systems. Although the process of building and developing decisions can be far less complicated without the participation of the citizens, represents more chances to fail, because the outcomes rely on public engagement with the particular measure, therefore being a strategic value to have attendance when developing new strategies and policies regarding the public transportation (Ibeas et al, 2011).

The effects of people not being considered, with regards to public transport policies, can widely seem in the form of protest of fares increases, that in Latin America represents a threat to every program released to the public. In these situations, the demonstrations started with the fares escalate and are lead to protests of all kinds of under-representation issues, take the 2019 Chile protests by example, initiated by the tariffs raise and six days after people were carrying signs for improvements in public health, pensions, and inequalities (Garnham, Alonso, 2019). Despite being widely recognized in Latin America, it also happens in different places around the world.

Therefore, there is a clear need to redesign and rethink the end-user scope of Public-Private Partnerships (PPP). And the major outlook for the PPP is the provision of infrastructure, in a scenario of market crisis and failure, the administration condition to provide these services were into constantly constrains. The design of the PPP is the target of several investigations, once it represents creative responses to the contextual problems each country face. Having the contractual forms of build–operate–transfer, build–own–operate–transfer, build–own–operate, design–finance–build–operate, build–transfer–operate, and build–lease–operate, as an example (Roumboutsos, 2015).

Accordingly, the source of the sensible place that PPP puts the public governance, is the development of the scenario that requires the PPP to happen, because these partnerships are only possible, when the Public parties primarily goal is to reduce the market risk for the Private parties to participate in such long-term provisions, whether by state commitment through the regulatory process of the creation of a competitive market (Makovšek, 2019a). The frame of references used in this discussion is based on the level of a renegotiated rate that comes from the contracts, that is the main reason that the private parties transfer the price for the taxpayer (Makovšek, 2019b), establishing the surroundings where the citizens often feel mislead by contracts and projects involving PPP, and this accountability is the source of the eruption of protests mentioned above. But the topic of the PPP is broad and by no attempt is going to be exhaustively addressed here, therefore its relevance for this discussion is to focus on the role of PPP in the public participation and the need for the accountability nowadays.

Together with the discussion presented above, this structure of promotional measures comprises the (1) soften boundaries in the scope of the public and the private, with the public assets being managed from private parties, and their impact decisions being taken into the governance account. (2) The problems with seeing the user as a consumer, and not holistic treating the public transport companies with the branding process through social marketing. (3) The need to reform the scope of the end-users PPP once it is failing to address the sense of creating a public asset towards a belonging state from the citizens.
4.2. PUBLIC TRANSPORT THROUGH PLACEMAKING

To begin with, the base ground of placemaking is necessary to look backwards to understand the process, and why it is so linked with the place branding and afterwards, in a smaller scale, the public transportation. Over the primary years of globalisation, that was a consensus belief that place and territory were dead (Florida, 2005), and for years this was the trademark of the boundaries broken by the innovations of that time, once in reality the perception of the place was, in contrast, becoming stronger. Reasonably, it is important to look at the construction process of placemaking before linking it to public transport as an instrument.

The rising importance of ‘place’ was the competition system that the lack of boundaries created, leading to the focus on developing what scholars call of clustering policies, that is often the build of incentives to start and generate the capital growth. And a great contribution to this conception came from Florida (2005) once he argues for the human capital growth, to shift from policies focus on firms, he believes that instead, policies and governments should be focusing on targeting people and that companies will follow and cluster eventually. Additionally, the conditions that made a place prominent to flourish contributes to this attraction power, the 3T’s represents these settings such as talent, technology and tolerance, and the trending movement is that targeted people were seeking weaker community ties, once through globalised and the flow of people, some communities that have stronger ties tended to excluded newer people, and ultimately the human capital growth.

Therefore, embarked on Florida’s creative class, policymakers started to believe they could create the attractive spaces, and a flourished community followed by the 3T’s, nevertheless, the outcomes for these strong incentives generated extremely gentrified hence exclusive spaces. Mainly due to the human capital in the core of economic growth, the business that is by nature profit-driven started to take advantage and use this element as justified of high-prices, often disaggregated of the local context. Correspondingly, scholars started to deviate from this understanding of human capital growth, admitting that it was part of a neo-liberal agenda naively aiming to activate the trickle-down effect, and creating jobs for an elite class to promote jobs at the bottom (Musterd, Kovács, 2013).

And this assumption lead to the perception that places could be created, developed, and led to flourishing with the effort alone of policymakers. And to understand why this is more complex, unlike when the human capital growth was a unanimity, the understanding of ‘sense of place’ is important once it provides the source of complexity of developing placemaking. The idea of ‘sense of place’ and placemaking is close together, it relates to the emotional bonds that one has for the surroundings and environment of a specific region or locality. Furthermore, is connected to the authentic individuality of a place, generating the feelings of belonging and placement for the ones that share the same feelings and values. As stated by Kovács and Musterd (2013a p.99) “Sense of place describes the individuality of place, its distinct character, and it also suggests a particular feel that makes the place stand out among other places”.

And since the definition of belonging is such subjective and intrinsic for each individual, the development of the placemaking followed by the ideas such as Florida (2005), believed that economics would follow the people, not the otherwise. Conversely, the policies that translated this reading of the current environment, grow into an elitist concept of developing flagship projects targeting the people out of the cities to live there, in favour of the people who were living there, with the engender of conflicts and tension between residents and foreigners, and with the already established sense of place that once thrived a relation between the location and their people (Walker, 2019).

These measures of incentive to attract a target population is categorized by soft measures, and in several places through Europe, policymakers are aware of the contradictions and tensions created by these
incentives in favour of one kind of people, and therefore the rethink of the strategy is necessary for the understanding balance of attracting innovation and take care of the people included in the environment long before. The approaches that are reversely categorized as ‘hard’ measures, direct to an active role in reverse the human-space tensions provoked within the outsiders and insiders. When observed in the practical scope, means to shift the attention from flagship projects and high-profile incentives to the public spaces that contribute to the development and improvement of the ordinary life, and assets that are common and were long overlooked in the process of entrepreneurialism governance (Lawton et al., 2013).

Moreover, this scope of policy reorientation towards a community-based approach leads the space for the creative placemaking, which is known and romanticise with the significance of place, affection, and public and cultural memory. Achieves a sensible activity to activate communities with strong ties to be acceptive with the innovative aspect that opening can bring (Barns, 2019). Therefore, the decision in terms of a new business can often lead to an opportunistic engagement with the place, whenever the place is thriving, and that relies on the relevance for the development of the placemaking activation through the elements such as public transportation, to create new ties and engage differently with the communities a person is involved.

The theory of network is so broad and flexible, that is linked with the design process of public transportation, and to the personal networks that enable through the understanding of a shared service. The personal network is developed by Kovacs and Musterd (2013b) as an important asset of the creation of the social capital, the notion of the strong and weak ties through a community is closely related with the personal network, once the more personal networks a population can rely on, the more developed the social capital through the strong ties among them. In the work of Florida (2005) he denies the strong ties inside a community as an asset, and understand it more like a barrier to space innovation and economic growth, and he does that using the economic clusters as an example of the innovative system. However, recent studies show that the problem relies on the personal network and not only in the strong ties-closed community, once the territory offers different personal networks for a person to connect, is when the strong ties converge into an open community to innovative and technological improvements from the placemaking.

In this regard, the extension of the placemaking addressed in this work is the recognition of public transport as an unpolitical stage, critical for the delivery of improvements that target the creative, technological and innovations capacities of a territory. The transportation networks proposed in the placemaking of the ‘creativity class’ makes a clear case of the political choice, using the taxpayer’s money to invest in foreigners amenities, like touristic revitalisation and the public transportation that only connects to that. Hence, the conflict is clear in this situation. Thus, the justification of using and developing public transport as a tool and mechanism of engagement among long term liveability and recent as well. Highlighting that the approach taken is from the point of policies and the planning process, because there is a broad literature tackling the placemaking through the urban design perspective, categorizing the physical and built environment comprehensively.

Figure 11 explains the framework underlining that placemaking often structures with regards of the improvements of the built environment, like sidewalks, park and amenities of the like (Lew, 2017); likewise structure the efforts of the land use planning process, converting uses in regulation or incentive manners. Nonetheless, the placemaking framework used here regards the economic, cultural and community development, framing these topics as the main elements that support and structure the placemaking in urban governance. Furthermore, the appropriation of the concepts of personal network and the social capital (Kovacs and Musterd, 2013b) indicates public transport as the bridge in connecting this discussion inside this framework.
From the literature review conflicts from the place, branding relies on the governance taking the role of directing efforts in promoting something that is often not the reality for many citizens. As stated in the previous topic, for the holistic promotion, it is required that the product or the service matched the qualities advertised. And as grasped by the knowledge accounted by this work, the conflict of the place branding is ignoring the placemaking effect that contributes to the most intrinsic and intimate relations a person acquires within the personal networks of family, friends and religious communities overlapped. Recognizing the power of the public transport in shaping a sustainable path inside our cities, is no longer questionable, however, the scope of defining and analysing placemaking policies still is built and committed to Northern countries in central Europe and North America, and worth mention the globalisation creates uneven territories (Musterd and Kovacs, 2013), consequently whereas the development mention is not in the same stage and is unknown whether are placed in the same process, the ‘creativity class’ may never be the case for Latin American cities, for instance. Thus, the role of the public transportation needs to be reinforced, in Northern countries as a means to activate the community-based approach, and in South and Asia countries in favour of the engagement through a shared ‘sense of place’.

4.3. Public Transport through Tourism Activities

Globalization is marked by the decrease of borders for the flow of capital, goods and people, and while scholars discuss if this can represent positive or negative outcomes in the further future, the reality is that tourism is increasingly a relevant market. From the reports of 2017, this sector represented US$1,340 billion dollars, following an increase in 5% from the current year. Exhibiting relevant enhancement in the sector of cultural preservation, economic development, and jobs creation (UNWTO, 2018).

Therefore, the power and influence of the tourism sector are no longer questioned, making scholars focus on the effects and how to potentialize the benefits and minimize the negatives results, developing sustainable tourism (Hall and Page, 1999). Despite the literature effort in addressing the main concerns over the topic of tourism, it lacks in analysing the relation with public transportation and the target users of this model. Namely, the reasons for this absence of research relies on the complex nature in identifying and differentiating the users between the residents, the recreative users, and tourists. Conversely, the majority of tourists arrive in destinations through air transportation, making the mobility within the city, for the people that can’t afford to hire a private car, more reliant on public transportation (Albalate and Bel, 2010).

The transportation can be conceptualized in the planning process as a utility connecting rationally different parts of a city, in a level of importance working on the local demand for the use of such mode,
or can be used as tourism and recreational planning, assuming the overall benefit that comprises the connection by rail or coach buses of a specific location of heritage significance (Page & Ge, 2009). And the planning choice regarding these two frameworks can be seen in the everyday life of the residents, the level of satisfaction or the contrary. Since Page and Ge (2009) picture the public transportation with the low intrinsic value for tourism activities, a more holistic approach is needed to grasp the source of the conflicts between the residents and tourists through the public transportation (Figure 12).

![Figure 12 – The transport intrinsic value. Source: Page (2009)](image)

The complexity in addressing tourism sector with regards to public transport is not only in the unfeasibility of differentiation but also with the shortage of efforts in discussing and tackling the competition between the inside users and the ones from outside (Albalate et al., 2010; Hall, 1999). And this conflict for the shared space can be clear in the holidays and whenever an event is not given the proper attention from the authorities to plan for the demand generated.

Additionally, the social problems that comprise the depletion of mobility and inequalities are even more symbolic to address and analyse in terms of the different patterns of transportation. There is a problem in each scenario for the illustrative conflicts because, in the localities where lacks in public transportation for the main population, the profile of tourist can reinforce the inequalities and deprivation of this public service; nevertheless, in developed transportation network localities, the use for the same mode of transportation can reinforce the conflicts of the quality of the service provided, as stated by Hall (1999, p. 183).

“The transport employed as an instrument of such policy may be a source of pride for the local population or may be both a source of envy and object of hatred in its symbolism of host-guest inequalities and of the suppressive and hypocritical nature of the host country’s political regime”

Whereas the public transport is a structural element in promoting tourism (Page and Ge, 2009), these connections from the residents must be addressed and managed, once there is evidence to cross the subsidize from the public transport through tourists, and most importantly from the tourism industry (Albalate et al., 2010). Furthermore, public transport can be used as an asset for the placemaking strategies as suggested previously. This conflict is not healthy when assessing a source of investment and the service for end-users, and further research on this issue is needed to provide a background and readable data for policymakers.

While further research is needed, here is important to address the problems and conflicts from the perspective of the residents, and additionally the policymakers. The burden of externalities in the demand side lies in the residents, and most importantly, the ones that choose the public transport,
counteracting the efforts in promoting the modal shift and the sustainable influence of choosing mass transportation (Lumsdon, Downward, and Rhoden, 2006), consequently is critical to put into perspective the policymakers, because the use of the public transport for leisure and recreative reasons, is a central element in the budgetary balance. And there is the declining trend from the use of transportation modes such as rail and bus (the ones that are more connected to regional or local authorities) since the options offer much speed, comfort, and cost-effective modal choice. Therefore, reinforces the use of public transportation for tourist and residents using the connections for recreative purposes as financial balance measure. With evidence of planners using the seasonal users to subsidize the local commuters (Albalate et al., 2010), the negative externalities rely first on the locals and later on the planners, in legitimacy terms, whereas deemed necessarily tackle a problem of supply in a conflicted scenario.

Simultaneously, the literature for tourism development and planning focus on understanding the impact of the activity in the urban environment, and provided an extensive system to evaluate the capacity towards the tourism activities, this system is called Limits of Acceptable Change (LAC) and promote the conditions for the recreational activity to happen in the first place, the system comprises nine stage process labelled: (1) identification of area issues and concerns, (2) definition and description of opportunity classes, (3) selection of indicators for conditions, (4) inventory of resource and social conditions, (5) specification of standards for indicators, (6) identification of alternative opportunity allocations, (7) identification of management actions for each alternative, (8) evaluation and selection of the preferred option, (9) implementation of actions and monitoring conditions (Hall and Page, 2006 p.150-151).

Although the system represents a mechanism for the planning structure within the tourism activities, the lack of engagement from the stakeholders, show the gap between the literature and the practice, and is important to grasp this problem as only a source of the conflicts within the urban space, the holistic view suggests an approach that covers the promotional measures, along with the placemaking strategies, for a balanced integration supporting the public transport system.

Therefore, the rivalry environment perpetuated by the policies towards addressing the local needs can perform as a negative outcome in the city image, trickling through the improvements attempts in the city branding, which targets great budgetary efforts from the authorities involved (Pareja-Eastaway et al., 2013). Everything that takes place in a city involves perceptions and contributes to the collective image of the place (Kavaratzis, 2004). And this is an important framework to address the public transportation and the conflicts within the users, once for this work, is closely related to the image created by newcomers and the collective capacity in building the personal networks, deemed crucial for the community engagement (Kovács and Musterd, 2013).

Grasping the effect of this competitive environment represents managing the perceptions and images fashion from a place, and regarding the increasing relevance of tourism sector in the public financial balance can represent important numbers in the budget for the public transport. Thus, despite portrayed in a conflicted form in the urban space, the relationship between hosts and guests within public transportation is a mutual interest matter and need to be treated that way. Meaning that public authority’s scarcity in using the influence of promotional and informational elements to inform about the tourism activities within a city enhances the idea that tourism is there to take something from the residents. Additionally, this problem goes both ways in undermining the public governance, once create animosity environment for visitors, coupled with hinder the development of the ‘sense of place’ through inhabitants.
4.4. Public transport through residents activities

Expanding the connection between the major actors of urban life and public transport represents a branch in several literature developments. The most important branch is structured in the topic 3.2 through the placemaking, and despite closely connected this topic is more focus on the extensive ways that people can improve through the link with public transportation.

The concept of establishing linkages and social bonds through the urban spaces is widely recognizable in the literature, and despite this bonds struggle to be measured and outlined, there is a consensus of the relevance of the urban convivence performance that places seek to flourish. The development of the equity, safety, security, economic growth and sustainable environment is intrinsically related to the authorities to build the surroundings that support the connection human-space, to institute the civic duties from human to their space, ensuring the task to improve the quality of life in our cities. For this reason, transportation choices play a crucial role in the collective duty towards collective well-being (OECD, 2017).

The urbanisation process is attached to economic development. Therefore, the economic perspective is elucidative on grasping the social connection enabled through public transport. The traditional elements of land, labour, and physical capital shaped the path towards the urbanisation, but the revision of these factors evolve into seeing the labour and the physical capital as one inseparable string, progressing into the human capital concept. And unlike the physical capital, the human capital is embedded in individuals through the use and experience, that occur inside and outside the workplace, shaping the individual growth. Further concepts development, lead to the scope of the social capital, defined as the collective and integrated perspective of the human capital. The social capital is relational to the heritage culture and in inferred as a public good, through shared history and behaviour (OECD, 2001b).

Along with the definition from OECD (2001b), social capital can be defined as the advantage an individual can rely on social interaction through mutual trust and social networks (Currie and Stanley, 2008); and finally, for the comprehensive extension of the social capital Lin (2001, p.7) stated that:

“Being assured of one’s worthiness as an individual and a member of a social group sharing similar interests and resources not only provides emotional support but also public acknowledgment of one’s claim to certain resources. These reinforcements are essential for the maintenance of mental health and the entitlement to resources. These four elements: information, influence, social credentials, and reinforcement – may explain why social capital works in instrumental and expressive actions not accounted for by forms of personal capital such as economic capital or human capital”

Appropriating the concepts of social capital to grasp the role of public transportation in the structure of urban society, that shares emergent goals of decarbonizing and reverting the dependence on fuel fossils, provide a tool for structuring the civic and collective behaviours to address, and the construction of this chapter leads to acknowledging the accountable governance that represents leadership towards directing the urban society, that can easily rely on sustainable choices of transportation, into a balance between a more sustainable future.

The links between the social capital and the transportation, despite not broadly addressed by the literature, can input paths towards the structure of policies and incentives, to bring awareness to the needed issue and account on responsive behaviours. Connecting the public transport to mobility, from the perspective of the social capital, represents a chance to the social connection with your neighbourhood and/or community; secondly, the concept of ‘liveable cities’ and the creation of a less car-dependent society is relational to the social capital because incentive more encounters that influence the well-being and the perpetuation of the social networks; finally, connects to the idea of travelling...
with others as social interaction, and enhance the cognition of sharing a public good, and the feeling of belonging (Currie and Stanley, 2008).

The work of Currie and Stanley (2008) focus on investigating the link with public transport and social capital as a mean to disentangle the inequalities and exclusion, reinforcing the symbolic role that public transport play in the drive of even more socially fair societies. The attempts in quantifying and generating indicators to measure social capital failed in address the multidimensional nature of the concept, but the OECD (2001b) reports that social capital is likely to have positive economic outcomes. Especially when crossing the contributions from the Kovács and Musterd (2013) about the competitive advantage of creating a balanced and sustainable environment, attracting people that will likely follow the civic accountability towards preserving the image of the place.

Furthermore, when Florida (2005) address the creative class, he argues that human capital is the motor of the economic and regional growth in urban areas. And this approach parallels with the social capital when he defines three conditions for the 3T’s progress, stated in topic 3.2., pitching tolerance as “openness, inclusiveness, and diversity to all ethnicities, races, and walks of life” (Florida, 2005, p.37), it can comprehensively concern to the social capital idea of the emotional support and public acknowledgement (Lin, 2001). Comprising the social capital with regards to public transportation can contribute to the development of the place branding strategies and the attempts in devoting the efforts in engage the civic residents within the integrated approach of structuring and collaborating for the perceptions of the city.

Cities thrive for planning advancements focusing on competitive identity and targeting the elements that are central to the ‘sense of place’ developed by the social capital, this can imprint a different bottom-up approach in designing the place branding. The public diplomacy can also be an argument for this proposition, once it refers to the messenger and the receiver, meaning an energized and satisfactory pride in announcing and promote the community and place, transforming in a collective and shared state of mind of the inhabitants (Anholt, 2007).

Likewise, the enhancement of the leisure facilities as long with the promotional projects to invite residents to the shared space in the cities, can provide a creative means to the problem mention in the previous topic, of the complex nature of differentiating the users of the public transport between residents and tourists. Therefore, public governance should frame the tourist and residents in leisure activities and use this strategy in planning for the improvement of the use of public transport. Research identifies key factors in promoting the use of public transport for leisure time, adding to the factors the negative connotation for the public transport as a mode choice, highlights the attitudes to tackle this image, as shown in Figure 13.

Additionality and a guiding idea of this work is the concept of place branding within the scope of the public transportation, therefore is mandatory to address the relational association, and from the built propositions so far, the link with the public transportation and the identity depends clearly on the governance choices concerning the informational power that can impact the change of behaviour and the integration with the placemaking in the planning process for strengthening the personal networks and enhance the social capital (Gronau and Kagermeier, 2007).
This can often be abstract and subjective, however, the public transport can provide a strong tool in addressing the problems of bad branding, relating to the top-down approach that misses in represent the collective and shared feeling for most of the inhabitants, the ones that will be in charge of delivering the message through actions, behaviours and responsive development for the common goal of a certain place (Anholt, 2007). Ultimately, it is suggested the relevance and the size of the tourism sector in the global economy, and together with the increased need for competitive positioning, conceive the idea that these two forces play in the opposite side than residents and taxpayers, whereas in reality these forces and trends need to be aligned to achieve the positive and sustainable outcome of creating the desired city.

Thus, the escalation and collaborative nature of these problems are weakly discussed in the form of policies and directive reaction from the local authorities. Nevertheless, the negative results for the undesired social capital are shown in the arrangement of co-operation for anti-social purposes, such as making tourists and outsiders feel uncomfortable, for instance. Therefore, measures can be taken to reverse these outcomes or even to potentialize the positive ones where they exist. These actions reflect the influence of public authorities in the role of facilitator in bridging the target population and providing the surroundings for the development of tools and social mechanisms to structure a positive social capital environment (OECD, 2001b).

Expanding upon these references, the proposition to use the public transportation as a tool for building the desire social capital through human-to-space-to-human relation, can provide a light with a symbolic city asset in deconstructing the abstract factor that leads to a neglected attitude towards more robust and active steps to approach the placemaking issues, the public transport access, and ultimately the public diplomacy in the process of place branding. All by targeting the inhabitants, making them feel their relevance in the policymaking, having the conclusion of a sustainable city environment while addressing the concerns that regards the city placement in the global economy nowadays.
5 CASE STUDIES - SYDNEY

5.1. SYDNEY FRAMEWORK

Sydney is a leading global city in Australia. The country is divided into Western Australia, Northern Territory, South Australia, Queensland, New South Wales, Victoria, and Tasmania. And the city of Sydney is part of the New South Wales Territory and has become the fastest-growing region, being responsible for almost a quarter of the economy of the state. Additionally, the city of Sydney holds more than 200 of the top 500 Australian corporations, accounting for more 7% of Australia’s GDP, and growth in the number of jobs created by 13% in five years (City of Sydney, 2020a).

The city of Sydney is also the core of the Great Sydney Metropolitan area. (Figure 14) And whereas the city has 208,334 resident population, and 117,253 jobs, the greater Sydney metropolitan area is home for 4,823,991 people, creating the labour force necessary to provide the economic attractiveness and flexibility to spatial planning for a forecast of 6.4 million people in 2036. Accordingly, the main planning goals of the local council is under the scope of the plan Sustainable Sydney 2030, and the Global City Sydney projects, that will be discussed below (City of Sydney, 2020b).

![Figure 14 – Greater Sydney and the city of Sydney. Source: Hu (2015)](image-url)

Furthermore, Sydney is easily recognized globally for hosting the Olympic Games in 2000, connecting to the theories mentioned in the previous chapter about the weight of hosting international events accounting for the place reputation. Therefore, this is tested in terms of the analysis run in terms of the
place branding legacy and the efforts needed in the brand management of the city. The geographical position of the city is also advantage once is the gateway from Australia to the Asian markets, accounting in large parts for the city’s economy that concentrates Australian companies from finances, information, and technology, as well as an increasing creative business company. With regards to tourism activities, the city offers iconic destinations like the Sydney Opera House, Sydney Harbour and Sydney Harbour Bridge, and reinforce the attractions through events of international recognition, markedly the New Year’s Eve Fireworks, Sydney to Hobart Yacht Race, the Gay and Lesbian Mardi Gras are the most famous.

5.2. SUSTAINABLE SYDNEY 2030

Draft from an effort started in 2008, the plan Sustainable Sydney 2030 sets the agenda for a “Green, Global and Connected” Sydney. The city recognizes with this plan the need to act and address its leadership in dealing with the target needs for the future. The plan represents the highest level in strategy and is updated every four years, with the participation of the city community, the vision is setting the commitment with projects, policies and services delivered to achieve the agenda (City of Sydney, 2020c).

Therefore, the planning system for the city is framed with the idea of a “Green” city, that concerns with the environmental attention that the further policies need to tackle to achieve the liveable desired city, the “Global” is considered in the perspective of economic competitiveness, setting the economic orientation of the plan and “Connected” is with regards to the infrastructure demand to achieve these goals, and in the plan, the perspective is towards a more walkable and less motorized city.

Concerning the integrative exercise to achieve the 2030 agenda the plan sets ten targets and ten strategic directions. (Figure 15) Correspondingly, the NSW enforce an Integrated Planning and Reporting legislation to monitor the strategic target implementation, along with the Community Strategic Plan (2017), which is supported by the Corporate Plan and detailed in the Operational Plan, to sets the holistic and unifying message and subjected to review every four years (Hu, 2015).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ten Targets</th>
<th>Ten Strategic Directions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Reduce 1990 green house gas emissions by 50 per cent</td>
<td>1. A globally competitive and innovative city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Capacity to meet local electricity and water demand</td>
<td>2. A leading environmental performer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. 48,000 additional dwellings</td>
<td>3. Integrated transport for a connected city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. 7.5 per cent of all housing social housing—7.5 per cent affordable housing</td>
<td>4. A city for pedestrians and cyclists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. 97,000 additional jobs in the City</td>
<td>5. A lively, engaging city centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. 80 per cent  of City workers commuting on public transport—80 per cent of work trips by City residents in non private vehicles</td>
<td>6. Vibrant local communities and economies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. 10 per cent of trips made in the City by cycling—50 per cent of trips made by walking</td>
<td>7. A cultural and creative city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Every resident within a 10 min (800 m) walk to a main street</td>
<td>8. Housing for a diverse population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Every resident within a 3 min (280 m) walk of continuous green link</td>
<td>9. Sustainable development, renewal and design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. 45 per cent of people believing most people can be trusted</td>
<td>10. Implementation through effective partnerships</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: [12].

Figure 15 – Plan for Sustainable Sydney 2030. Source: Hu (2015)
5.3. PLACE BRANDING THROUGH PUBLIC TRANSPORT ANALYSIS

5.3.1. BRAND AS IMAGE AND REPUTATION

Through this element, the focus goes towards understanding the efforts for imprinting and promoting the brand design. Additionally, the analysis investigates the responsibility of the brand design and the level of integration faced in the modes of public transport and latter in the city brand resolutions. Regarding the representation of levels of governance, the city of Sydney is under two different entities, the NSW governance, and the City of Sydney (see Figure 16).

Tackling the public transport brand were discovered a recent attempt of the Transport for NSW (TfNSW) and the public transports modes within the city of Sydney to be under the same umbrella of brands, pointing the coordination and the endeavour for integration with regards to the city image. This change occurred in 2013 and the transport minister stated being the sign of the new era under a shift in the culture of employees and the staff to better assist and support the commuters. Additionally, is worth mention that was coordination to pair the colours with the service provided, as shown in Figure 17 (Saulwick, 2013).

![City of Sydney image representation](image1)

Figure 16 – City of Sydney image representation. Source: City of Sydney.

![Transport for NSW representation image](image2)

Figure 17 – Transport for NSW representation image. Source: Transport for NSW

Therefore, would be reasonable to assume that deciding to couple the public transport brands, in an intention that includes inside and outside of Sydney, would generate by outcome an organisation responsible for managing these brands altogether. However, the public transportation in the city of Sydney is provided by private operators and managed by the NSW state authority, including the infrastructure projects, the state control the majority of the signage and roads, even in the local scale. Accounting the local authority to partner with the NSW for delivering an integrated vision for the city of Sydney (City of Sydney, 2017). Despite the missing aggregation of the public transport public agency and the local authority, the levels of satisfaction of the service are relatively high, as shown in Figure 18.

Although is not found any organisation or agency directly responsible for the development of the place brand management, since 2015 was declared and launched the Greater Sydney Commission, with the purpose of “(a) to lead metropolitan planning for the Greater Sydney Region; (b) to promote orderly development in the Greater Sydney Region, integrating social, economic and environmental
considerations with regard to the principles of ecologically sustainable development (…); (c) to promote the alignment of Government infrastructure decision-making with land use planning; (d) to promote the supply of housing, including affordable housing; (e) to encourage development that is resilient and takes into account natural hazards; (f) to support ongoing improvement in productivity, liveability and environmental quality; (g) to provide increased opportunity for public involvement and participation in environmental planning and assessment in the Greater Sydney Region” (TfNSW, 2019). Enhancing the level of integration between the public transport brand, and also the city of Sydney brand.

From this perspective, the analysis now focuses into the city brand, considering the level of integration between the public transport and the city through the commission, under the authority of the NSW governance, strengthen the assimilation among the public transport modes. Therefore, for a further outlook of the city brand, shown in Figure 16, is important to position the reputation of the brand towards the major rankings this work will be using, namely the Saffron Brand Barometer and the Global Power City Index, both dated 2019. In the first index, the city brand is in the 11th position, and the former in the 18th (Saffron, 2019; GPCI, 2019).

With regards to the reputation of the city management inside the community of Sydney, a report of community wellbeing is explored to find the best indicator in terms of engagement with the city assets. This report is divided in (a) Health, safe and inclusive communities; (b) culturally rich and vibrant communities; (c) democratic and engaged communities; (d) dynamic and resilient local economies. And while the culturally rich regard the creative industry growth and satisfaction, the best indicator to elucidate the level of reputation of the city management was the democratic and engaged communities. As stated by the report that “Of the nine measures for which there are targets or desired trends, four are progressing as desired. Three of the four measures not yet progressing as desired can be seen relating to disillusionment with political processes: low satisfaction with democracy (generally, not specify any level of government); low perceived opportunity to be heard on important matters; and less than full voter turnout at elections” (City of Sydney, 2019a, p.75). Additionally, the authority keeps the monitor of the public satisfaction of the public transport service, that can be seen in Figure 18.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Nov-12</th>
<th>Nov-16</th>
<th>May-17</th>
<th>Nov-17</th>
<th>May-18</th>
<th>Nov-18</th>
<th>May-19</th>
<th>Nov-19</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall train network</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall bus regions</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall ferry routes</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall light rail</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Metro</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 18 – Overall customer satisfaction over time. Source: City of Sydney.
5.3.2. BRAND AS AN ASSET

The perspective of the brand as an asset requires the analysis through numerical and financial values attributed to the agency management, from the authorities planning process, and the values attributed to the brand value from the outside, that can also enhance a more compelling analysis. Once started in the previous topic, for the city brand, it was not found a delineated commission responsible for the development and management of the city brand. Therefore, the system of assigning the values and expenditure designated to the brand management is not defined by a clear and linear path, rather the analysis of the report and linking the visions to exercise towards the brand and promotion.

Since the city of Sydney carries a good positioning brand, the endeavour discovered in the reports from the planning process, as well as the policies strategies for the city, direct towards the management of the place, while targeting the global competitiveness. Validating the idea from Anholt (2005) through the connection that an established brand, almost do the competitive work itself, attracting naturally the attention that the place seek. An therefore in terms of the brand as an asset, the financial value of the city of Sydney is explored in a report from the Global City Lab with data from 2019, comprising the analysis of six dimensions: economy, culture, governance, environment, talent and reputation. The report assigns the value of the Sydney city brand in 6th position with the value of 10455.5 in the unity of 100 Billion USD (Global City Lab, 2019).

According to the Saffron Barometer, that considers the city assets regarding the Jones Lang LaSalle Global300 Cities; World Bank Ease of Doing Business Index 2018 (Country Level); Mercer Quality of Living City Ranking Survey 2018 and finally Iese Cities in Motion Index 2018. Sydney performs in this index with the value of the assets of 5.8 while the first city, New York, assets is value 6.0, confirming a good and strong reputation for the city of Sydney, within the global evaluation.

Therefore, is important to consider the financial value of the brand with regards to the place brand management, as a spatial planning strategy. For this analysis is considered the operational plan provided from City of Sydney authority, and the topics most related to the place brand and the public transport brand management is the strategic objective of “A globally competitive and innovative city” and “Integrated transport for a connected city”. And the globally competitive city requires the second smaller amount invested, within this vision. While concerning the public transport expenditure, there is no mention of the vision in the scope of promotional and branding efforts. This budget is shown in Appendix 1.

5.3.3. BRAND AS A COMMUNICATION SYSTEM

According to Kavaratzis (2004), in exploring this framework, is relevant to separate the active intention to improve the built environment to the promotional creation, and later, if the perception is following the identity created. In the case of the city of Sydney, the integration proposed by The Greater Sydney Commission, the achievement from the city brand and the public transport is under the centralized authority of the NSW.

Therefore, supporting this primary communication analysis there is the Corporate Plan 2011-2014 (City of Sydney, 2020b); the Plan for Growing Sydney (Greater Sydney Commission, 2017); and the Environmental Action Plan (City of Sydney, 2017), where through this documents is possible to envision the planning system incorporate the branding and promotional policies into the directions and guidelines. Later, to analyse the tertiary communication there is the Community Wellbeing Indicators (City of Sydney, 2019).
Following the Plan for Growing Sydney from 2017, there are four goals to guide the decision making. These goals are: (1) a competitive economy with world-class services and transport; (2) a city of housing choice with homes that meet our needs and lifestyles; (3) a great place to live with communities that are strong, healthy and well connected; (4) a sustainable and resilient city that protects the natural environment and has a balanced approach to the use of land and resources. With regards to public transport, the first goal sets 11 directions and 33 actions towards achieving the desired effects. However, these directions address improvements in the infrastructure and the service delivery to the residents, and no mention of the promotion of public transport (Greater Sydney Commission, 2017, p. 15). The only direction that touches points of advocacy and management of the city’s image is scoped in goal 3 and refers to Promote Sydney’s heritage, arts, and culture.

Regarding the Corporate Plan 2011-2014, the mentions of the strategic actions that concern the public transport are all comprised in the improvements of the actual service and infrastructure delivery, following the ideal in the Plan for Growing Sydney (City of Sydney, 2011), and the mentions of a brand in the report targets the major and famous events that take place in the city, and are the responsibility of the city engagement as shown in Figure 19 and 20. An investigation into the documents of the Environmental Action Plan there is the mention of the promotion in several strategies, but more in the perspective of the social marketing, regarding the promotion of the sustainable and green visions for the city, like stated in the regards of the public transport strategies “The City is committed to promoting the most sustainable modes of transport for residents, workers and visitors.” (City of Sydney, 2017, p. 47).

![Figure 19 – Plan of actions in the Plan for Growing Sydney. Source: City of Sydney](image1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Projects</th>
<th>Actions / milestones</th>
<th>Start date</th>
<th>Completion date</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>2030 actions linkages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sydney Signage Code</td>
<td>Complete public domain Signage Code to facilitate pedestrian movement across the local government area.</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>City Strategy &amp; Design</td>
<td>1.6.3, 4.2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydney New Years Eve</td>
<td>Deliver Sydney New Year’s Eve celebrations as part of maintaining awareness of Sydney as a tourist destination.</td>
<td>July Annually</td>
<td>January</td>
<td>City Engagement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christmas in the City</td>
<td>Deliver Christmas in the City as a celebration of a Sydney Christmas for residents and visitors.</td>
<td>July Annually</td>
<td>December Annually</td>
<td>City Engagement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese New Year</td>
<td>Deliver Chinese New Year events to celebrate the cultural and economic contributions of the Chinese community to Sydney.</td>
<td>October Annually</td>
<td>February Annually</td>
<td>City Engagement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 20 – Performance indicator in the Plan of actions. Source: City of Sydney.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Performance Indicator</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>07/08 result</th>
<th>08/09 result</th>
<th>10/11 target</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global competitiveness*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>City Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydney is a safe and competitive location for globally connected economic sectors</td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>31/8</td>
<td>28/1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand Sydney</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>City Engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estimated numbers attending City of Sydney events</td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>1.5m</td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- New Year’s Eve celebrations in the City</td>
<td></td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Christmas Concert in Meriton Place</td>
<td></td>
<td>70,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Chinese New Year Parade (police estimates)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.5m</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Performance measures of a globally, innovative city will be developed in the year in line with the Economic Development Strategy.
Finally, for the tertiary communication, it is analysed the Community indicator of wellbeing, that provides an overview of the community perception of the policies and achievements from the local and state authorities. According to the official report, the majority of the residents felt satisfied or very satisfied with being part of the community (Figure 21). Additionally, with regards to the active engagement, resident’s seems satisfied with the number of activities promoted by the city, but there’s not enough active engagement in participating in these activities, as shown in Figure 22. Following the indicators of the engagement in the decision making, the levels show the attendance among the population is relatively high and stable, as shown in Figure 23.

![Residents agreeing that most people can be trusted](image)

![How residents respond when asked: Thinking about your personal wellbeing, how satisfied are you with feeling part of your community?](image)

Figure 21 – Wellbeing indicators over satisfaction. Source: City of Sydney.

![Disagree or Strongly disagree](image)

![Neutral](image)

![Agree or Strongly agree](image)

![No engagement in any activity](image)

![1 type](image)

![2 types](image)

![3+ types](image)

![How residents respond when asked: Agree or disagree…](image)

![Active engagement (as a hobby, organisier or in a paid capacity). In listed types of cultural activities, events, performances and venues, in the past year.](image)

Figure 22 – Wellbeing indicator over participation. Source: City of Sydney.
5.3.4. BRAND AS IDENTITY

Through the exploration into the officer’s reports and planning documents, the 2030 agenda is clear, and the pursuit shows the path towards a more sustainable environmental city. Even in the mobility domain, there is the active intention in promoting the sustainable modes of walking and cycling through the city, along with these projects there is the framework of a creative city attempt, with the incentive of the stakeholders to engage and conceive this scenario for attracting creativity, following the ideas in Florida (2005).

The major concern encounter in the research regards the safeguarding of indigenous population and cultural heritage that still exists in the city. Therefore, in the encouragement for an appreciation of events and gatherings that values the indigenous culture and heritage. Figure 24 shows the major projects and actions towards that purpose (City of Sydney, 2011). The development of the social and cultural associations is clear and strong in the planning for the future Sydney, enhancing the city’s image from the inside-out perception. However, the social and cultural association with the public transport is not always clear.

Despite, being an intangible and flexible indicator, the analysis of the brand as identity is seen in the last topic because it concerns the general research and discoveries from the documents provided. And the city of Sydney highlights the commitment with the acknowledgement of the different cultures and diversity in the community wellbeing indicator, shown in Figure 25. However, there is little attention over the extent of the indigenous culture events and therefore can marginalize these people with formulated barriers for the continuity of these culture identity (see Figure 26). Recognizing that the city of Sydney is home for a variety of culture and identity, is expressed in the focus on developing and improving these context by the council creative city plan, in which are detailed measures and policies to be taken towards clear goals to reverse the under representative identity. There is the concern over the public participation once the plan is stated to be co-created by the agents of the city council and the community, accordingly the six priority lines of the plan are the following: precinct distinctiveness and creativity in the public domain; new avenues for creative participation; sector sustainability; improving access and creating market; sharing the knowledge with the community; and global engagement (City of Sydney, 2019a; 2019b).
**Place branding through public transport - Towards an integrative approach: case studies**

**Sustainable Sydney 2030 objective 7.1**
*Encourage the appreciation and development of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander cultural heritage and its contemporary expression*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Projects</th>
<th>Actions / milestones</th>
<th>Start date</th>
<th>Completion date</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>2030 actions linkages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eora Journey</td>
<td>Continue cultural centre studies and planning for an Aboriginal Cultural Centre and a Knowledge Centre. Work collaboratively with cultural stakeholders to ensure collection and display of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander culture.</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>City Culture &amp; Community</td>
<td>7.1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Work with the Indigenous community to determine key sites of significance.</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>City Culture &amp; Community</td>
<td>7.1.1, 7.1.4, 7.1.5, 7.2.3, 7.4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop an implementation plan to interpret and recognise key sites of cultural significance in the public domain.</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>City Strategy &amp; Design</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sustainable Sydney 2030 objective 7.2**
*Support cultural activity, participation and interaction*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program or service area</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>2030 actions linkages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Art and Performance</td>
<td>License and facilitate buskers, street theatre, and art displays in the City’s streets and public spaces. Ensure inclusion of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander culture in City of Sydney events. Support and promote Art &amp; About to strengthen and develop the City’s creative sector and provide opportunities to activate public spaces through the arts.</td>
<td>City Community &amp; Culture City Services City Engagement City Strategy &amp; Design City Projects</td>
<td>7.2.3, 7.2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Centres</td>
<td>Provide programs, classes and events at local community centres to develop community capacity and participation in cultural and creative activities.</td>
<td>Community Centres</td>
<td>7.2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Art</td>
<td>Implement the City’s Public Art Conservation Program to restore and maintain public artworks in the City.</td>
<td>City Projects</td>
<td>7.4.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 24 – Projects to encourage inclusiveness in Sustainable Sydney 2030. Source: City of Sydney

Figure 25 – Cultural diversity perception in the city. Source: City of Sydney

Figure 26 – Indicator of participation in cultural activities. Source: City of Sydney
5.4. Results

Through the analysis regarding the city of Sydney, this topic is dedicated to compiling the findings from the analysis concerning the methodology of gathering the information. The analysis conducted to evaluate the city of Sydney towards the assimilation achievements among the public transport brands and the spatial planning discover the presence of a strong public agenda that integrates all the efforts regarding the city planning into the scope of the plan Sustainable Sydney 2030.

Therefore, table 5 represents the identified indicators providing an evaluation over the integration towards the place branding. Once it was analysed the official reports the indicators are flexible and show the main findings in each dimension of the investigation. While in Table 6 is presented the perception on the dimensions analysed regarding the inside perception, considering the resident’s and the directed influenced by the measures and policies towards the spatial planning, contrasted with the outside perception, that considers not only visitors but potential investors in the city.

Table 6 is organised through the colours of green, meaning a positive perception, orange meaning a neutral perception and the colour red meaning a negative perception. The reason is divided between inside perception and outside perception, following the objectives of this research, is due to the place branding misconceptions often lead to a prevalence of one perception over the other, like the conflicts reflecting the lack of inclusion in the management of place branding (Kavaratzis, 2004).

Following what proposed Anholt (2005) the strong brand positioning refers to all the conditions working together in constructing this image and reputation of the place. And the Table 5 refers to the integration of different tools that work together facing the understanding of place as a geographical and spatial unity and cannot disregards the community and social implication in the measures and policies (Kavaratzis and Ashworth, 2004; Oliveira, 2016).

Since the analysis attempts always that data were available to propose the structure of the dimensions through the perceptions inside and out, and since the city of Sydney has a recognizable strong brand, the outside perception is positive in all the dimensions, whereas the inside perception shows a neutral perception on the involvement of the city with the identity of the city, namely, because the city of Sydney has a strong ability to attract people to live there, not always showing conformity with the natural culture of the place, once even with the city promoting and encouraging the Aboriginal events, there is low attendance to these events (see Figure 26).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sydney Dimension</th>
<th>Place Branding Indicators</th>
<th>Integration Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public transport</td>
<td>Spatial Planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as image and reputation</td>
<td>One public brand by the TfNSW.</td>
<td>Organisation The Greater Sydney.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as an asset</td>
<td>High budgetary force</td>
<td>Low budgetary force.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as a communication system</td>
<td>Public agenda.</td>
<td>Public agenda.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as Identity</td>
<td>Articulation through The Greater Sydney organisation</td>
<td>Promote of the indigenous and native population events.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The public transport is a brand treated in the same umbrella of logos represents the efforts towards integration. And it was found an organisation responsible for promoting the city of Sydney aligned with the public transportation ideas.

Integrated efforts to transform public transport through the attempt to creating the global view of the city. Little financial value is dedicated through public bodies once the global distinctiveness is noticeable.

The efforts focus on the improvements in the quality of life and development of events and leisure activities, while little is the target on the marketing and awareness, there is still a good perception of these services.

The conflict of the people attracted by the global positioning of the city and the native and indigenous population creates a barrier for the effectiveness of the measures.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place distinctiveness</th>
<th>Brand as an image</th>
<th>Brand as an asset</th>
<th>Brand as a communication system</th>
<th>Brand as an identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inside perception</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Orange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside perception</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Green</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.1. PORTO FRAMEWORK

Porto is the second largest city in Portugal, after the capital Lisbon. Located in the North of the country, comprises the Metropolitan Region of Porto, for its singularity and articulation with other nodes in the northern part of the country. Hence, the city of Porto is the economic centre for the region, connecting the tourism and leisure activities through architectural heritage. The municipality of Porto accounts for an area of 41.42 km² and according to the last census, in 2011, 237,591 inhabitants, while the metropolitan region 3,689,609 people, as shown in Figure 27 the location in Portugal, and Figure 28 the constitution of the metropolitan region of its 17 municipalities (Câmara Municipal do Porto, 2020).

The city has a strong history in the construction of the Portugal identity, being attributed to the name of the country in convergence with this historical background. Therefore, the exploration of the touristic and leisure industry is being institutionalized through associations such as Associação de Turismo do Porto (ATP) since 2015 and Associação de Turismo Porto e Norte, focused on the regional planning of the activity, acting as a regional agency, that provides publications and data orientation for the policies to be draft (AMP, 2020).
The city of Porto was declared as world heritage by UNESCO in the year of 1996, considering its urban built environment, and the architecture of the city centre, one of the major products of promotion into the cultural and leisure activities (Câmara Municipal do Porto, 2020). Additionally, the city was chosen as European Capital of Cultural in 2001, attracting not only attention but revitalisation productions to the city of Porto, coupled with this isolated event, that is the product with instant worldwide recognition from Porto, its gastronomy and the winery sector, encompassing the destination brand. These characteristics create the baseline for the global and competitive positioning of the city of Porto, along with the northern region.

6.2. Porto Municipal Agenda

The investigation into the official channels for the municipality of Porto led to discover the pursuit of the city as involved in a greater metropolitan area. The first concerns and challenges of the city occur towards the requalification of the built environment, once most of the houses and buildings are part of the heritage of Porto, the requalification is deemed cornerstone included even as one of the axes in the agenda for the circular economic life in place.

To embrace the challenge of the recovery in the city’s buildings, the public authorities created the Domus Social in 2012, to promote and manage the social housing conditions to achieve the goals at a multilevel stakeholder. The success of the policies and the buildings is not in question here, whether to analyse where and what are the exertions and challenges of the public agenda. The extent of the project already reached 19 housing complexes for a social function and 4 schools (Domus Social, 2020).

The second project to advocate the built heritage reconstruct is the program Porto Vivo, an urban rehabilitation association, with more interest in preserve the physical tradition of the city and attract the different investments to achieve this. More regardless of the social aspect, this project launch in 2012 confirms the endeavour for tackling this challenge in the city of Porto in the administration. Additionally, with this coordinated attempt and the environment of the touristic activities, the city of Porto positioned as the Portuguese city with more attracted investments in the year of 2017, with the most foreign investments attraction in 20 years, and a lot to this result is due to the institution of Invest Porto in 2015 (Invest Porto, 2020).

The joint actions of these projects comprise the placement of the city in the international scenario for the attraction of the investments towards reconverting the compromised and not preserved built environment. Furthermore, concerning a different agenda, there is the Porto Circular Economy 2030, an intention to promote the benefits from the circular economy in the region, that has a vision based in four-axis: (1) promote the sustainable production and consumption; (2) assure the availability of natural resources and the natural balance; (3) create and maintain shared infrastructures to close the rehabilitation with the circular directives of construction; and (4) engage innovative solutions to transform the waste in the resource (Câmara Municipal do Porto, 2017).

Despite all the social projects undertaken by the public authorities, these highlighted here shows the framework of the following analysis, and the attempt is not to explore exhaustively the public agenda of the planning system in the region, whether is to situate the city of Porto and its challenges in the need for the public agenda that understands the context of positioning through the global scenario. Over attracting and coordinating the investments with InvestPorto, and with the Porto Circular Economy there is the background the adjustment of the city in the global demands placed in chapter four.
6.3. PLACE BRANDING THROUGH PUBLIC TRANSPORT ANALYSIS

6.3.1. BRAND AS IMAGE AND REPUTATION

The city of Porto has a strong and awarded place visual identity, which was developed in 2014 as the first graphic logo design commissioned by the public authorities, with the aims of stimulating the activities in place. Accordingly, the strong and powerful logo is used throughout the city in all the awareness and social promotional attempts, that can be seen in Figure 29. Furthermore, the city is inserted in the Metropolitan regional association, with the visual communication shown in Figure 30.

![Figure 29](image1.png)  
Figure 29 – Logo of the city of Porto. Source: Câmara Municipal do Porto.

![Figure 30](image2.png)  
Figure 30 – Image representation of the AMP. Source: AMP

Additionally, in the process of understanding the brand of the city, it is important to grasp the branding of the different public transportation and service providers that connects the infrastructure through the city. Porto has the service more decentralized, and therefore there is a company from the bus service, another for the metro service and a different one from the Railway services. And there are nuances through the management of these services providers since the company Sociedade dos Transportes Coletivos do Porto (STCP) and the railway service Comboios de Portugal (CP) are public companies, while the Metro do Porto S.A. operates based on a Public-Private Partnership (PPP).

Figure 31 shows the logo from the STCP, followed by Figure 32 with the logo from the Metro do Porto, and ultimately, Figure 33 with the CP logo. There is a noticeable intent to associate the city of Porto with the blue colour, while the national provider is the only to disintegrate in the visual identity and therefore, represents that the public transportation fails to be under a single brand umbrella, even sharing management through its organisation assets.
Still relating to the metropolitan agency, the authorities gathered in the Transportes Intermunicipais do Porto (TIP) bid to stimulate the integration in the service delivered, and the product of this realization was the ICT system for purchase and use of the different services providers. The system is called Andante (Figure 34) and represents the organisational experiment to the common use of public transportation, following the model, there was a joint effort from Metro do Porto and STCP as companies, to sponsor the launch of the smart application called MOVE.ME (Figure 35) for the information and timetable of all the services delivered in the city (AMP, 2016).
Regarding the reputation of the public transport, the research from an organisation in defence of the consumer (DECO), shows that the satisfaction between the users is relatively low, and the metro is the model that better meets the demand of the users, mainly due to unification of the informational system and the service delivered, and the precision of the timetable, coupled with the comfort along the journey (DECO, 2020). Most of the commuters choose the private car, creating a strong dependency of this mode share, the commute that takes place in the public transport, considering the metropolitan region is 13%, which is a number considered very low with regards to the others modes available, as shown in Figure 36 (AMP, 2016).

Despite the city of Porto's intention to connects the visual elements to some extent, it fails to integrate into the branding achievements. The logos and visual identity of the service providers represent the city image, but considering the planning structure, no programs were found to deliver uniform goals and shared strategies. Then the effects are felt in the transport sector economy once there is a low level of acceptance and access for mass transportation modes.

![Image](image.png)

Figure 36 – Mode Share in commutes inside Metropolitan Area of Porto. Source: AMP (2016).

6.3.2. BRAND AS AN ASSET

To investigate the financial and assets flow of the city of Porto, with regards to the branding of the city and public transport, the exercise of connecting and crossing information was a key in drafting the analysis through this framework. Since the organisations that shape the identity of the city through the tourism sector and the public transport are diverse and disperse, the structure of a solid and robust asset to the place is hard to accomplish. Furthermore, the decentralised planning system, and in the absence of a clear and spread agenda for the future, outlines limitation to this analysis, that is deemed in investigation mainly in the official reports, to grasp the public institutions involved.
The attempt to organize and understand the structure of the entities which shape the public transport and the identity through the tourism, Table 7 shows the structure of groups and typologies used to understand the complex system in Porto, with entities that were central to the analysis of this dimension. Through this dimension is possible to assess the public agenda more decentralized and the struggle to create a joint program to instrumentalize the engagement with the planning system.

Table 7 – Structure of Public Entities in Place Branding and Public transport. Source: Author

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Entity</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Typology</th>
<th>Instrument</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Câmara Municipal do Porto</td>
<td>Área Metropolitana do Porto AMP</td>
<td>City Planning+Regional Planning</td>
<td>Plans and reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STCP</td>
<td>Metro do Porto</td>
<td>Transportes Intermodais do Porto</td>
<td>Transport Planning decentralized from the efforts of city planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CP</td>
<td>Metro do Porto</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro do Porto</td>
<td>Metro do Porto</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CP</td>
<td>Metro do Porto</td>
<td>Metro do Porto</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CP</td>
<td>Porto e Norte</td>
<td>Turismo Porto e Norte de Portugal</td>
<td>Destination Brand</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Therefore, to cross the financial value of the city and its brands a report is used from the tourism institution, and STCP, once is the most used mode of transportation after the private car (Figure 37 and 38). For this reason, the analysis will outlook the asset of the city as a brand, and later, the public transport. Showing a gap to connect between these two assets (Câmara Municipal do Porto, 2015).

Figure 37 – Modes Share in public transport by use in the intern, inside and outside flow. Source: REOT

Figure 38 – Mode Shares by inner, inside and outside flow. Source: REOT
The relevance of the tourism sector in the city of Porto is shown in the response of the economic sector in embracing this typology into the business, therefore, in terms of infrastructure, the city responds to the increasing demand of the leisure and hospitality activity. Likewise, the regional institution for tourism Turismo Porto e Norte de Portugal (TPNP) represents the forefront of the development of this identity and image of the city considering the destination brand tools. For the years of 2017, the institution had a positive balance of over 9 million euros with an increase of 10% from the former year, to be distributed in incentive programs and enhancements for the region. Through this outcome, there is a project that highlights the northern region of Portugal, as the NORTE2020 that already funded almost 5000 projects divided in 10 priority axis accounting 1.5 billion euros into the projects that could improve the second region of the country (Norte 2020, 2017).

Additionally, another important achievement of the TPNP was the attraction of the rally of Portugal and the articulation on the communicative system, to highlights the qualities and distinctiveness of the place. Being responsible to manage and monitor 2,700 news and publications for the region in the case between 2014-2016 (TPNP, 2019). Despite the power of the tourism sector in producing and managing the image of the city through the outside perception, this investigation could not find the associations where the goals are in the improvement of the city for the residents, incorporating them in this image creation, once they would be the ones to sell it.

Following the analysis with the role of public transport, not only in developing the image of the city but also in taking the planning in a more robust engagement with the residents. The commission board and shareholders of the STCP, for the first time in 2018 was transferred from the national authority and distributed through the six municipalities that the company operates (see Figure 39), but still missing some components of the metropolitan region, with areas that the service does not reach, see Figure 40 (STCP, 2018).

Figure 39 – Organisational structure of the company STCP. Source: STCP (2018)
The profile of the city of Porto shows a clear intent to shift from the private mode of transport into a more sustainable fashion. Once the levels of private vehicle trips into the city are relatively high, there must be a coherent and evident pursuit from the planning system to address these changes. While the number of kilometres travelled shows increases since 2016, along with the revenue per traveller (see Figure 41), the planning system fails to shift into a more robust approach to tackle this increasing trend to move towards more liveable cities (STCP, 2018).

According to this analysis, the asset of the city brand of Porto is the potential for the development of place branding into the planning system, using the initiated trend for a leadership fashion in the scenario of the touristic and global attention to this matters. Once the organisational structures of the entities already comprise a dynamic public-private partnership, then consists of the base for applying the necessary changes into the system towards more proactive governance.

6.3.3. BRAND AS COMMUNICATION SYSTEM

In the city of Porto, one of the instruments in the planning system is the Relatório Sobre o Estado do Ordenamento do Território (REOT), which consists in a framework over the mechanisms of the territorial management, along with the dynamics of changes in the city, and the territorial cohesion concerning the strategies that perform incidentally in the region. And this report will be used as a tool for this analysis, once contains the strategic goals that guide directly the city planning and management (Câmara Municipal do Porto, 2015).
Through five strategic objectives, the planning instrument outlines the directions concerning the policies and projects. Therefore, it is relevant to structure these five strategies once it shapes the primary communicative system of this theoretical framework. The first goal regards the appreciation of the urban identity, through the improvement of the urban tissue and the protection along with the support of the heritage; secondly, reinforce the exertion in the improvement of the public space over the environmental and the natural landscape of the build surroundings; thirdly, the goals are about the urban mobility, concentrating the attention in the enhancement of the internal urban mobility over the priority of mass transportation, soft and more sustainable modes of commute; the fourth goal concerns the territorial and social cohesion of public investments, to increase the equity among the service delivered to inhabitants; finally, the fifth goal draws attention to the city centre restoration through the activation of more dynamic activities and the built environment regeneration (Câmara Municipal do Porto, 2015).

Therefore, the assumption based on the strategic goals set through the planning instruments, is that there is strong attention being drawn into the built environment and its regeneration, along with the conversion of the modal share in the public transport. Regarding the secondary communication system, that refers to the advertising intention from the planning authorities, nothing was found within the plans, likewise in the process of the revision of the plan.

Regarding the tertiary communication system, it was used the reports from the participatory sessions for the development of the new plan, where people were asked about the major concerns over the urban environment and how they evaluated the quality of life in the city of Porto. Many residents respond that economy was the strongest points of the place, and knowledge was rated as the last in the scale, whereas the mobility was in the sixth position (Figure 42). This provides an important ground in grasping the level of participation through the city, once in the first phase of hearings through one month of meetings throughout the city, took the level of participation of 305 people joining. Therefore, consist of the picture draw from what residents feel of the living standards. Considering the quality of life, 51% feel that is reasonable, while 39% considered good and 7% really good, contrasting this, there is 3% feel that the quality of life is bad in the city (Figure 43).
These official records can show and portrait the disparities in the participatory system in the region, once the integration and the communications systems are missing in address the incentives that people need to feel like they belong. Therefore, the responsible public agencies are not using the “word of mouth” for the appreciation and spread of the positive points of the city. And another weak point was the disperse information through the numerous agencies and not having unify and common language.

6.3.4. BRAND AS IDENTITY

There are recognized effort, from the tourism sector of Porto, to identify and develop the city’s identity, whereas for the destination brand goals, it also has a strong impact on the way the residents perceive themselves in the city’s image.

Following the reports of the TPNP, the associations in the base of the structure of the collective imagery are related to the Porto heritage and historical features, like the gastronomy and the cultural heritage of the buildings. This reinforces relations through inhabitants with the historical past of the city, however, it fails to use the social capital, referred in chapter 3, in the development of the city once there are no instruments to engage the population in committing to the behavioural change for the collective wellbeing (TPNP, 2017).

The city of Porto experience since the 90 decades a retraction of residents in the city centre and a less extent in the metropolitan area. Accordingly, the city lost more than 40,000 residents through this decade, and despite the problem not been reversed, the decline in the population has increased lower than the average, and this can be a potential tool for policies that regards and considered the social capital in achieving the goal (see Figure 44).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Porto</td>
<td>327,368</td>
<td>302,472</td>
<td>263,131</td>
<td>237,591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grande Porto</td>
<td>1,117,820</td>
<td>1,167,800</td>
<td>1,260,880</td>
<td>1,287,262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continent</td>
<td>9,336,760</td>
<td>9,375,528</td>
<td>9,869,343</td>
<td>10,047,621</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 44 – Demographic rate of the city of Porto, the Metropolitan Area and the Continent. Source: INE 2011
Establishing an agenda for 2027 the tourism sector authorities aims at improving the education and technical skills for the hospitality professionals while attracting the creative investments to the country. Therefore, the scenario for the creation of the identity of the region, likewise the national context is ignoring the existence of the people that live in these places. Because while the touristic indicators use the metrics of the number of nights spent and the number of beds per territory, the policies are failing to attract residents that intent to live in the city of Porto and metropolitan area for a longer period (Turismo de Portugal, 2017).

However, according to the rules of the country in terms of electoral and representative matters, there is a local administrative unity called Junta de Freguesia, divided by the territory, and can be used as a tool for the creation of the environment to help people engage with the planning system in the city. Porto accounts for seven Freguesias, therefore seven Juntas de Freguesias (DRE, 2020). Additionally, the Domus Social which the main purpose is to stimulate the financial transfer in the interesting parties for the development of the social projects regarding housings programs. Therefore, these two entities establish the tools and space for community engagement (Domus Social, 2020).

6.3. RESULTS

The results of the analysis in the city of Porto shows mainly the obstacle in establishing public and strong agenda for the development of the city, in a more holistic approach. The multilevel governance often leads to different directions or overlaps the planning achievements. Therefore, the integration among the public transport and the spatial planning system to develop a comprehensive fashion towards place branding is shown in Table 8, while the indicators represent the main barrier this study finds to establish an integrative view on the city plans development.

Additionally, the notable intention drawn on the tourism sector represents a method that works for the destination brand management, often ignoring the community participatory. According to Anholt (2005), the benefits of promoting the destination brand can push benefits for the economy, even indirectly, with sectors outside the tourism, however, the findings suggest a lack of engagement with the public authorities in the development of plans and therefore, reducing the capacity of the city to deliver behavioural changes regarding the collective wellbeing. And Table 9 focuses on understanding and compiling the information from the analysis and provides the indicators to ratify the integration analysis.

Additionally, one relevant aspect that articulates to the unification efforts is the data that can grasp the perception of the dimensions analysed. Regarding the perception present in all the dimensions analysed, Table 9 represents an evaluation attempt followed as the same method of the previous chapter, through the display of colours evaluate if the dimension is rated in green, as positive perception, orange as neutral, and red as negative perception. These perceptions are also divided between inside, referring to the residents and the people who live through long periods, and outside perception that refers to the global view of the city.

Both Tables show complementary information to assess the aspects that portrait the city of Porto in the context analysed. These results are far from reaching an in-depth analysis, nevertheless, contribute to the overall and collective idea of the place. Through the investigation on official channels and reports were possible to grasp the delivered perception both inside and outside the city, being Porto the second city of Portugal in relevance, creates a barrier in scrutinizing the global view of the place beyond tourism.
Table 8 – Porto Dimensions Analysis. Source: Author

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Porto Dimension</th>
<th>Place Branding Indicators</th>
<th>Integration Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public transport</td>
<td>Spatial Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as image and reputation</td>
<td>Multi brands through an integrated brand organisation</td>
<td>Multi brands through the multilevel governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as an asset</td>
<td>Financial growth</td>
<td>Financial ability to attract inward investments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as a communication system</td>
<td>Low engagement with the measures</td>
<td>Low participation in community surveys and meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as Identity</td>
<td>Low engagement in the social behavioural change</td>
<td>Low engagement in the social behavioural change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 – Porto Perception Analysis. Source: Author

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place distinctiveness</th>
<th>Brand as an image</th>
<th>Brand as an asset</th>
<th>Brand as a communication system</th>
<th>Brand as an identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inside perception</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside perception</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7

CASE STUDIES - MEDELLÍN

7.1. MEDELLÍN FRAMEWORK

The city of Medellín is in the Valle de Aburrá in the Andes Mountains (see Figure 45), along with the capital Bogotá, constitute the two major cities of Colombia. The city has an estimated population of 2,508,452, according to the national census in 2018, and is surrounded by nine other cities in which structure the metropolitan area of Valle de Aburrá. The dynamic and robust economy of the city accounts for 7.9% in the country GDP through a strong economy in the national scenario, the city of Medellín has a distinctiveness representation in the textile industry, and is the only city with a science, technology and innovation plan (Florez, 2016).

The city of Medellín once knew as the most dangerous city (Borrell, 1988), turn around the bad reputation, and nowadays after 30 years, the global view of the city is changed. Through the consolidation of six priority clusters, the rural business; chemicals and life sciences; infrastructure and tourism; renewable energies and electric mobility; manufacturing, and creative industries (ACI Medellín, 2020). Coupled with a strategy towards innovative technologies, the city has a 2023 innovative agenda, once in 2013 it was awarded as the most innovative city by the Wall Street Journal, Citi, and the Urban Land Institute (Florez, 2016). The active mechanism towards developing the distinctiveness of the city, combined with the concerns over the future of the city made Medellín a
reference in smart city developments and applications that regards the improvement of the service delivered for the residents, one example in the Sistema Integrado de Movilidad de Medellín, or SIMM, an integrative mobility system, and the intention of creating the space for engagement of the residents through TV programs, social networks and plans to provide wireless connection in different communities. Furthermore, after the educational sector, mobility was the second with the most attracted investments, making the city a relevant case to be analysed through the lens of the place branding framework (Medellín Como vamos, 2019).

7.2. Medellín the innovative city

Medellín launched a series of strategies for the development and enhancement of the city life, hence it started to reshape the global reputation of its security problems to become a city known for the smart city innovations and inclusive growth. Through the plan “Medellín: un Hogar para la Vida” the city scope five major purposes that encompass the several programs developed during the governance period of 2012-2015. These objectives are “city that respects, appreciates and protects life”; “equity, a priority of society and governance”, “competitiveness for the economic development with equity”, “sustainable territory: planned, equitable and inclusive”, “legality, legitimacy and constitutionality for life and equity” (Alcaldía de Medellín, 2012).

Therefore, the commitment to inclusive and more equitable life for its citizens is clear in each goal, making the plan about improving the lives of the vulnerable population in the city. Simultaneously, the city launched an integrated traffic monitoring system, with the aims of reducing the roads accidents, and traffic congestion. This smart system opened the possibility to engage with different methods of monitoring, and later the city launched an environmental monitoring system, the Integrated Metropolitan Emergency and Security System (Sistema Integrado de Emergencia y Seguridad Metropolitana, or SIES-M) creating the unification among state security and emergency departments. Additionally, another system provided in this strategy was the early warning (SIATA), a project involving different public institutions with the aims of warning the citizens about the probability of a hydrometeorological event leading into a civic emergency (Florez, 2016).

This joint accomplishment and the positives outcomes for the residents of the city lead to the creation of the Ruta N Medellín (Route N), the innovation and business centre that articulates with different stakeholders the development of ICT for the renovation of the city life (Ruta N, 2020). The articulation of the Ruta N increases the robustness of thechanges erstwhile the governance in the city is based on short term project, therefore the organisation produce the autonomy to develop and implement the plan for the innovation in Medellín through a combined articulation with the academic and business sector to support the bridge that enables the innovation as the main purpose of all developments (Ruta N, 2011).

Following the inclusive growth and the innovations in ICT, the city launched the project MiMedellín, in which the citizens are encouraged to take part in the decision process of the municipality, the platform is encouraged through the program of delivering internet access to several communities, and therefore comprise the goal of inclusiveness in the residents while promoting the engagement in the political process through an open governance approach.

Furthermore, the commitment to the inclusive and equitable growth in the planning system is confirmed in the major infrastructure projects connecting challenging and vulnerable areas to public transport. The Metrocables, a public-private partnership delivering the service of aerial cable cars to respond to the vulnerable communities that live in the topographical challenging area, since 2004 with the first line, the partnership already provided four more lines. This project became the face of the new reputation
that Medellín was aiming to achieve, with the transformation of the insecure and vulnerable areas, as a consequence the global recognition of the city has been switching with the strengthening of the social performance indicators (Salehi, 2017).

7.3. PLACE BRANDING THROUGH PUBLIC TRANSPORT ANALYSIS

7.3.1. BRAND AS IMAGE AND REPUTATION

As mentioned above, the reputation of Medellín has been transformed since the years of 90’s decade. Therefore, this analysis is fundamental to investigate if the global view of the city is aligned with the policies and tangible outcomes for the residents. Once the strategies implemented and highlighted by international organisations is also important to see if the changes brought life improvements in the services delivered to residents.

While tackling the image of the city, the municipality logo represents the core image expressed through communication channels. The image that serves the city of Medellín is the armoury shield, a concession of the Spanish king Carlos II through the Madrid coin in 1678, with an upper figure of the patroness of the city Señora de la Candelaria (see Figure 46). The city adopts this symbol from the official reports to urban furniture and public projects, to protect and appreciate the history and the cultural heritage of Medellín (Alcadia de Medellín, 2020).

Contrary to the tradicionality of the city symbol, there is the image and symbols of the transport system in place, dating to a more recent history of the city. The company Metro Medellín (Figure 47), that provides the services of metro and the aerial car cables, was constituted in 1979 with the aims of a construct, manage and operate the services of mass transport in Medellín, and accounts as shareholders the Alcadia de Medellín and the Departamento de Antioquia, nowadays the companies are organised in a more dynamic public-private partnership (Metro de Medellín, 2020).

Additionally operating the transport in Medellín, there is the bus rapid transit (BRT) company, the Metroplús (Figure 48) created in 2004 for providing the infrastructure projects of a BRT system in the city, while has as the main shareholders the Alcaldía de Medellín and the Metro de Medellín, and to a smaller extent the municipalities from the Valle de Aburrá metropolitan area. The role of the Metroplús is to provide the infrastructure and operate the maintenance, being the response of Metro de Medellín to provide the transport to all modes of public transportation (MetroPlús, 2017).
This model of public-private partnership contributes to the uniformity in terms of the transports circulating through the city, and this consistency is managed by the system that integrates these different companies into the service supported to the residents. Despite the buses that circulate through the BRT system been provided by the Metro de Medellín (Figure 49), the services to areas more vulnerable in terms of mass transportation, the municipality accounts to the service of 40 companies effluent into the central connectivity of the system (Alcadia de Medellín, 2019).

With regards to the perception of the residential civic life in Medellín, is used the report about the quality of life by the private organisation Medellín, Cómo Vamos, through the purpose of evaluating the progression of the indicator toward the 2030 agenda. Among the most challenging indicators of Medellín to achieve a liveable city, was the security and safety issues. Therefore, according to the report, despite the investments in the public safety sector (see Figure 50) the number of robberies is still high in the public space, increasing since 2013 (see Figure 51), and increased in the last three years, the level of homicide in the city (Figure 52). Augmenting for the unify and robust response to those challenges.
Concerning the public transport and the use of the public space, indicators show the number of trips used by mass transport and soft modes in most zones of Medellín, according to data from the year 2017 (Figure 53). Additionally, there was an increase in satisfy perception of the public space in the city (Figure 54). These data show that despite the international position of the city image has increased, in terms of people considering all the innovation that took place in the city, the manifestation of these outcomes in the public life can take some time to occur and may need a constant progression of the public policies towards the goal of the innovative city of Latin America.
To structure the analysis from the perception of the brand as an asset, the levels of investments in the improvement of life and infrastructure will be assessed, along with the budgetary plan to the development of the programs from the public authorities of Medellín in the plans “Medellín un Hogar para Vida” with the administration from 2012-2015 and the plan “Medellín conta con vos” from 2016-2019. Considering the brand as an asset in the context of developing countries, such as Colombia, is far more complex than in other countries, mainly because of corruption issues, and to define into what extent the financial value is being taken from other basic investments, therefore, is also fundamental to assess that in countries like Colombia, the asset is built through the social and human capital, thus in the ability to convert investments in providing the basic amenities for the residents (OECD, 2015).

Considering the national context, along with the department of Antioquia, the region of Medellín has the GDP per capita above national levels, and a thriving industrial and textile industry, which coupled with the cities of Bogotá and Cali form the “the golden triangle” of the country (OECD, 2012). But this aspect alone does not provide enough dynamism and strength to respond to the employment and educational weakness, with that regards, the public service is set to invest or promote the private investment to balance the scenario. According to the public survey, the population of Medellín considered the three most important public focus to be the health, education, and employment to tackle the social advance (Medellín Como Vamos, 2018). And these three areas repeatedly appear in citizen agenda in the next year, with employment surpassing the education concerns.

Hence, the following of the public policies and investments in these matters represents a way to see if the public demand is being responded. Accordingly, the Medellín Como Vamos report shows that in ten years, the most public investments sectors are education, health, and transport, respectively (see Figure

7.3.2. BRAND AS AN ASSET

Figure 53 – Medellín transport mode shares in the municipalities. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019)

Figure 54 – Medellín percentage of people satisfied with the public space through 2009-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vamos (2019)
And through the period of 2008 till 2018, the investments in these sectors are increasing, showing the effort to acknowledge and react to the public demand (see Figure 56).

Assessing the inside and outside perception on the assets views, in the case of developing countries, necessarily is much more aligned once the investments and the financial commitment from the public authorities and stakeholders in the social growth are what drives the economic development. And for building the reputation towards a robust asset, the city of Medellín is applying the efforts not only in responsively promote public policies, but to proactively stimulate economic growth by the innovation agenda. Accordingly, the city is focusing on a multilevel governance fashion to engage mechanisms and institutional levels with this consideration (OECD, 2015).

The city of Medellin has pursued the innovation endeavour since 1970, with the creation of ProAntioquia Foundation, an institution focuses on the regional development, and later with the Centre for Science and Technology of Antioquia, always as a public and private combined. In 2009 the creation of Ruta N is another step in validating the efforts and progress concerning the innovation system. The public
agency brought together the universities stakeholders, in a market-driven scope to advocate for the sector growth comprising health, energy and ICT (OECD, 2015).

With regards to public transport assets building, one of the perspectives of the strategic plan of Metro de Medellín is the financial performance, that consists on the establishment of two strategic goals and three major initiatives that aim at increasing the safety net and legally financial protection and optimizing the cost of maintenance (Metro de Medellín, 2019). The consistency and endeavours to give continuity to the policies applied by other authorities is a relevant aspect of structuring a robust system that provides a clear message concerning the city goals and path towards following it.

The focus on becoming the innovative city of Latin America represents an important base level for converting the reputation of the armed conflicts in the country. And this sector can boost the building assets of the city towards an environment of branding also public transport. The relation with the systems developed in the scope of the innovative solutions can benefit the transport sector in terms of economic and energy resilience.

7.3.3. BRAND AS A COMMUNICATION SYSTEM

With regards to this dimension of analysis, the first communication system will be assessed by the public authorities plans from 2012 to 2019, that comprises two administrations. Following the secondary system will be assessed by the directed communication measures inside these plans, additionally is the strategic plan of Metro de Medellín, with the targets ICT measures, and later, the tertiary plan, there is the perception of these measures from the direct users.

As mentioned in the previous dimension, the public health, employment and education are recurrent concerns by the residents, and therefore targeting the issue is mandatory to improve the quality of life, since as shown in Figure 57, these are frequent demands since 2006, survey data shows (Medellín Como Vamos, 2018). Accordingly, the programs that the two administrations since 2012 target the challenge of improving these sectors of public life.

![Figure 57 – Priority topics for attention by municipal authorities 2006-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vámos (2019)](image)

The plan “Medellín un Hogar para la Vida” has five lines of strategic goals, and accordingly, the two firsts consists in focusing on the public safety, and public health and the second focuses on programs towards enhancing the education systems. The first goal is to ensure the human rights of security, liveability, health, culture, and leisure through the public participation, and become the city that respects, protect and appreciate the life as a supreme value. Following the second strategic line, that focus on building an equitable society through the fair generation and support of opportunities, along with the
conditions to enable the equitable use of the public services. Therefore, comprising the education and employment in most of the programs proposed in this line (Alcadia de Medellín, 2012).

Through the second administration plan, named “Medellín Cuenta con vos”, there are seven lines of means to the public policies. The first concerns the culture and citizenship; the second focus on public safety and liveability; whereas the third address the social equity as governance model; the fourth on education and employment; the fifth on mobility and infrastructure; the sixth focus on the interventions on the city centre and the cultural and built heritage; and finally, the seventh dimension of approach regards the environment and the sustainable green growth (Alcadia de Medellín, 2016).

Although the plans coverability of the public effective demands, the reports over the quality of life of Medellín, disclaim the investments levels over the years, and according to the data, there is an apparent increase in the investment in the first years of the management, with regards to the administration 2012-2015, and 2016-2019 and a clear inversion of these investments on the last years as shown in Figure 58. However, the city of Medellín in the national context still has a favourability position in terms of levels of public investment, as shown in Figure 59.

According to stated in the previous dimension, the major investments from the public authorities were regarded in the scope of education and public transportation, and the public health issues. Despite the levels of investments, the indicators of health and education have shown improvement, due to the application of the programs from the administrations. Along with a shy improvement on the levels of employment, being 2018 the worst years for the indicators of unemployment and employment participation (Medellín Como Vamos, 2018).

![Figure 58](image-url) – Medellín public investment rates through 2008-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vámos (2019)

![Figure 59](image-url) – Public investment per capita in the cities of Colombia through 2013-2018. Source: Medellín Como Vámos (2019)
Whereas the public transport perspective, there is the strategic plan for four years, and that comprises five perspectives for sustainable growth, and one perspective is dedicated to elaborate and detailed the method regarding the territory and its residents. The projects to improve the totality of the lines kilometres and expand to 1.3 million daily users, at the same time balancing the quality of the service to be always above 4.5/5. Therefore, the public transport as a brand can be seen in the scope and dimension of the brand as a communication system, while in one of the perspectives for growth there are initiatives like an integrative plan for communication; intern communication; preserve the institutional memory of the company, among other initiatives regarding the physical improvements (Metro de Medellín, 2019).

Tackling the secondary communication system, there is the endeavour since the plan “Medellín Cuenta Con Vos” for a participatory platform for co-creation of a solution by the public and private stakeholders, and since the platform is based online, the city council offer the “Orejas Andantes”, a mobile stand for providing the wireless connection to a certain community ratio (Alcaldía de Medellín, 2016). Additionally, following the same path the Metro de Medellín, establish the attempt to develop and stimulate culture as a tool for territorial transformation, with initiatives like promoting a competition for the urban art in the stations (Figure 60), the project bibliometro, to equip the stations with the books for borough along the journey, and the publication of books to this purpose as well, along with events for readings and sharing of stories (Metro de Medellín, 2018).

Figure 60 – Cultural projects of Metro de Medellín. Source: Metro de Medellín.

Regarding the tertiary communication system, there is the public perception of these services. And the organisation Medellín Como Vamos prepared a report just focusing on the perception of public management and governance. Figure 61 shows the data regarding the level of satisfaction of the people on the public investments since 2008 going until 2018, being 2014 the highest level of people declared to be satisfied with the destiny of public investments. Whereas evaluating the perception of the public entities, the Metro has achieved the highest levels of satisfaction among the respondents along the year of 2016-2017-2018 (Figure 62). Therefore, showing tertiary communication is being effective in spreading the action of “word of mouth” already mentioned, enabling the people to promote the service and the city (Medellín Como Vamos, 2018b).
7.3.4. BRAND AS IDENTITY

To structure this dimension is important to look into the efforts put by the city authorities and the public transport authorities, to contribute positively to the outcomes along the process. Over the last 30 years, the city of Medellín, and the metropolitan region has overcome the reputation based on the criminality of the city, as mentioned above. And now the process is undergoing in understanding what makes the city of Medellín, and what the residents expect.

Public transport plays an essential position in the rest significance of the city’s image. Through the connection between vulnerable and segregated communities, public transport facilitates the attendance of these citizens in the city centre life. With the opportunities enabled by the measures and efforts mentioned in the previous dimensions, the city contributes to increasing opportunities while reduces the vulnerability of these residents. The programs of the Metro de Medellín, with the agenda of the event, advocate an imperative aspect and allow the community engagement in the public spaces (Metro de Medellín, 2020).

The Metro has cultural programs, educational programs and the community committee that focus on the social management and the contact to community agents. And occur that the most vulnerable communities from Medellín are increasingly expressing their art in a form that assists in shaping their environment. Considering the public transport as the centre of the social transformations in Medellín, with the connection of the several communities, there are remarkable transformations taking place in the social environment of the city, the public provision in the scenarios of extreme poverty and vulnerability, empower the slow build of the social capital, further after the population can contribute in a more positive context to the public life (Ghione, 2014).
7.4. RESULTS

The outlook of the place branding through public transport in the city of Medellín provides interesting results. Once the main reputation of the city was converted through the public commitment in improving the citizen's life, the role of the public transport in connecting the vulnerable communities articulates with the investments to power the innovative city agenda. Over Table 10 is represented the dimensions working towards the integration of public transport to spatial planning.

Therefore, a fundamental finding of the analysis was the engagement of the public transport committed to delivering not only the transportation service but the improvement of the communities with the events. Acknowledging the potentiality, and the presence, mentioned in the work of Anholt (2005). Along with reinforcement the capacity place branding plays in the strategic approaches like the Metro de Medellín (Oliveira, 2016).

Additionally, Table 11 demonstrate a complementary view of the perception devised in the dimensions analysed, and by dividing into inside perception and outside perception display that often people that live in the city is affected differently through the place branding measures, when compared with the outside perception, namely, the international view of the city. Over this division, is rated the perception as positive, represented in the green colour; the neutral perception, in orange; and finally, the negative perception, in red colour.

Accordingly, worth mention the outside perception of Medellín is still negative, due to the violence and low levels of development, but the performance in the brand as an asset is positive in both perceptions, once the city’s efforts go into creating a smart and innovative reputation by attracted investments. And regarding the two remaining dimensions, the outside perception was neutral due to lack of data concerning this analysis.
Table 10 – Medellín Dimensions Analysis. Source: Author

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medellín Dimension</th>
<th>Place Branding Indicators</th>
<th>Integration Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public transport</td>
<td>Spatial planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as image and reputation</td>
<td>High awareness and brand engagement</td>
<td>Traditional logo and administration dependency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as an asset</td>
<td>Financial application in the community</td>
<td>Financial agenda towards the innovative city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as a communication system</td>
<td>Community commitment</td>
<td>Life amenities improvement and satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brand as Identity</td>
<td>Community vulnerability commitment</td>
<td>Public transport investment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The integration of the city public transport is made by one company that represents most public transport logos, however, despite the recent renovation with more proactive administrations, the city plans create more awareness than the city brand.

Integrated efforts to transform public transport through the attempt to invert the bad reputation of the city, working towards creating an innovative environment reputation for the city. Thus, comprise the public transport system.

The primary, secondary and tertiary communications are aligned with the project of development and increasing the quality of life in the city. Although there is still a lot to be done, the people recognize the efforts and the outcomes.

The public transport is inserted and share the responsibilities in promoting the spaces to be occupied through the expression of the building identity of the city. Therefore, represents the most integrated system focus.

Table 11 – Medellín Perception Analysis. Source: Author

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place distinctiveness</th>
<th>Brand as an image</th>
<th>Brand as an asset</th>
<th>Brand as a communication system</th>
<th>Brand as an identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inside perception</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Green</td>
<td>Yellow</td>
<td>Yellow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside perception</td>
<td>Red</td>
<td>Yellow</td>
<td>Yellow</td>
<td>Yellow</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

83
8

DISCUSSION

8.1. RE-VISITING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Through the questions that guided this work since the first chapter, it was assessed the theme of the place branding through the lens of the social and spatial implications, mainly over the assumption that place, in place branding, represents a unity that can’t be regardless of the geographical, spatial and social scales, as proposed by Oliveira (2016) and Kavaratzis and Ashworth (2010).

Therefore, this chapter is dedicated to re-visit the questions framed in the first chapter through the lights of the results presented by the case studies. For this reason, the topics are frame again, attempting to follow the discussion focusing on each examination clearly and concisely. The questions are: (a) how the place branding is translated into spatial planning? (b) what is the level of collaboration between place brands and public transport brands? (c) how to segment the theory of place branding in a tangible method?

Accordingly, the first question refers to the gap in the research whereas the focus in the place branding goes towards the brand part. Therefore, is important to note that branding as a concept is worth a broad debate, and the idea of branding refers to concepts that are often abstract and subjective, for instance, the definition that a strong brand requires the alignment among culture, vision, and image, through all the parts involved. Hence the culture refers to the employee, vision to managers, and the image attributed to stakeholders (Hatz and Schultz, 2001). Therefore, the gap is due to continue if the bridges among the conceptual barriers (e.g. the abstractness and subjectivity) and the practice is not overcome.

From the intention of commitment to filling this gap, this research focuses on the analysis of the case studies from the perspective of the public authorities, therefore attempting to understand what is known by place branding and what the practice regards. Hence, the conceptual appropriations are developed along with this work, nevertheless is imperative to discuss the first section to highlights some definitions already presented. In this sense, the concept of social marketing (Kotler et al, 2008) combined with placemaking (Musterd and Kóvacs, 2013) provides an appealing framework in discussing the ways that place branding is rendered to the spatial planning.

From the main topic being the place branding, the question goes towards the direction and assuming that the place branding is imprinted in the spatial planning, and more important the development of the case studies and the literature that supported this work comes to this discussion that the spatial planning, along with the placemaking is imprinted in the place branding instead. Therefore, when Musterd and Kóvacs (2013) defines the placemaking as the development of the ‘sense of place’ through activating
the individuality and distinctiveness on a community-based approach, there is a contribution to the distinctiveness and competitive image that should be inscribed in the place branding. Therefore, this discussion defends that place branding is more balanced and healthy, regarding the conflicts interplayed when a stakeholder of a place is taken in favour of another, whereas understood as an end, and the spatial and characteristics of the place is a grasp as a means.

This is equivalent of expanding an awareness where the place branding is not translated in the spatial planning, once is imprinted in all the measures and choices concerning the spatial development. Closely to the argument defended by Kavaratzis (2004) in defining the place branding as a communication system and exploit as a dimension in each analysis, which argues three systems operating to develop the place branding, being the primary systems concerns the infrastructure and the spatial physical developments, and the second being the promotion and awareness created for the place and the third, the word of mouth, or all the advantages that place can get by having the satisfaction of all the parts involved.

Through the case study of Sydney, is worth mention that no financial value was added to the promotional measures itself, like advertisement and traditional marketing techniques, whereas in Porto this financial value was visible and distributed in more than one institution, creating the idea of overlapping these advertising exertions. Consistently, Sydney presents a stronger place brand, and Porto focuses on the development of a destination brand and its benefits.

Along with the completion of the analysis in this work, the place branding is not only translated by all means in the spatial planning, as it can be grasped as fragments in multidisciplinary literature to appropriate the practices of place-making while employing the marketing tools and instruments to boost the spread of this channel. In this process, is worth mention the consequences of the opportunistic allocation in the creative city’s theory structure, considering the gentrified ripple effect conceive through the limited concept-based experience from public authorities. Following this, became a mandatory issue to allocate the literature building and practice of place branding in the scope of spatial planners as well.

Regarding the second question, the collaboration of place branding and public transport brands was strong in the city of Medellín. However, public transport represents in all cases a strong connection to the identity of the place, the case of Porto where all the public transport logos present the blue colour, in an attempt to establish the relation with relevant features of the city. Therefore, is inevitable the public transport represents the history of the city, whereas being established long before, or playing a central role in the improvement of the present, such as in Medellín.

Furthermore, an issue worth the discussion is the scenario of development of MaaS, presented in chapter 4, once the three case studies confirmed the strong association among the public transport and the identity of the place, with more extent in Medellin and less extent in Sydney, it seems important that like proposed by Hensher (2017;2018), that progress of innovations scenarios that favour the MaaS, remains public transport centric, and as proposed by the analysis conducted here, it respects and takes into account the identity of the place, to promote a holistic engagement with the users, and avoid what Hollands (2015) calls a corporate smart city.

Once more important than answering questions, the debate raised by this dissertation regarding the second question is that the public transport brand/brands provide and contribute to the construction of the placemaking and the place identity. Hence, the open market scenario whether for development of MaaS or the deregulation for the provision by different private actors should take this into account to stimulate the sustainable environment for this joint effort. To understand these shifts and new environments, the work of Healey (1998), although dated, still brings lights to the conflicts generated through different actors involved in the construction of place. The author calls for new forms of
institutional change through integrative placemaking, and the use of local knowledge. Perhaps the branding efforts represents nowadays the new forms of approach towards the institutional limitations.

The chapter discusses the driver of change adjoin for the increasing importance of tackling the digital transformation and the social structure that position the image and visual representations in a much broader form. Advocating for the advancement of social marketing that regards these features, whether for focusing on the behavioural change towards the car-centric society, whether for a better application of the MaaS into our cities.

Finally, the re-visit of the last question is mainly represented in the previous discussion. As stated before, the major conceptual barrier for the understanding of the place branding bares in the abstraction and intangibility of the definition. Conversely, the theoretical contributions aim at understanding the practices that focus on the place branding as a means, and like stated in the discussion of the first question, the place branding can be best understood with the spatial planning as means in achieving the distinctiveness purposes.

Following this interpretation, a broad range of elements enters to consideration when treating the place branding more tangibly. Whether the development of events focusing on encouraging the cultural life and at the same time aiming at international attention, like the city of Sydney with the Sydney New Year’s Eve, and Christmas in the city (City of Sydney, 2017). Whether with the recognizable metro cables in Medellín, that is a recognized symbol of distinctiveness in the city.

Theoretical support of this idea is the definition of place branding where the focus on place branding management. Through the place branding management, the argument is that place branding concerns the place reputation, therefore, every place reminds a reputation in the user’s mind and development of place branding need to move into the management of this reputation, nonetheless considers the physical and objective approach towards changing this collective opinion (Anholt, 2005).

8.2. TOWARDS THE INTEGRATION AMONG PLACE BRANDING AND PUBLIC TRANSPORT

The development of attempts to integrate the place branding with more tangible elements has been grasped by different authors (Hakala et al., 2010; Lucarelli, 2018; Zenker and Braun, 2015) arguing the confusion created in the layers of the concept theory, whereas approach by social or political scientists (Anholt, 2005), or through business scholars (Kavaratzis and Ashworth, 2015; Lucarelli, 2001). Therefore is relevant to point the direction of this integration, whereas occurring in the development of a dissertation in the field of spatial planning, strongly regards the elements that shape the place, as the core elements to hold the integration.

The scale of the country is considered as an umbrella of brands working towards shaping the reputation of that place, as an example of that we have France for French perfume, Italy for Italian sports cars or the fashion brands, and so forth (Hakala et al, 2010). Additionally, there is the idea of the place branding acting in the process of co-creation and co-branding with elements that shape the social life, like the political context, the meaning context and the spatial context, and used as examples of the co-creation of the branding the institutions, the events and the physical landmarks in the place (Lucarelli, 2018).

Regarding these concepts, there is the argument that place branding integration should work towards developing and improving the quality of life, supporting a long-term life change. Whereas co-creation and co-branding expansion in the literature goes towards limited, occasional, and particular changes, the presented work develops an idea of the place branding that endeavour place improvement using the place management as a means to the purpose. Among scholars, the debates around the sports events and flagship projects are extremely rich in contributions, both advocating in favour of or against these
measures. However, is clear that although amplified in different sector and proven to stimulate growth, like the approach of destination brand, these measures contribute very little in the long-term changes in the quality of life, additionally are very economic dependent.

Through the process of this work, there is the concept of place branding that enables the enhancement of resident’s life while promoting a positive reputation for the place. The case of Medellín, for example, despite not representing signs of a strong brand, shows a powerful approach that is endorsed by the population recognition of the work developed directly to improve civic life. Regarding this example, is worth pointing the limitations in the financial dimension, and the extremely bad reputation that the country carried for years. Although not completely reversed, the place branding applied in these cases does not benefit from focusing only on shaping the reputation, more than the focus on the social vulnerability’s enhancement.

Furthermore, as chapter 4 shows, there is a movement from progress based on capital growth towards a development that is socially sensitive and aims at increasing the sustainable life in some places, and the provision of basic qualities amenities, with the case of countries in development. Therefore, shows an absence of context to understand the place branding based on improving competitiveness and the need for distinctiveness alone, without considering the community-based approach, once the environmental concerns that guide the economic growth cannot be disregards of the social inclusion.

Re-visiting the chapter 4, in face of the discussion above, suggests a framework for the place branding as an instrument to target the most vulnerable markets, not only in benevolence brought by social inclusion but mostly because these vulnerable markets increasingly represents business opportunities that go in both ways, whereas supporting social and financial growth (BSDC, 2017). Consequently, the public transport is presented as an open gate towards the tangible elements to measure and manage the place branding, additionally targeting the vulnerabilities of the economic growth in developing countries, and the promotion of social behavioural change in developed countries that already face the consequences of the air pollution delivered by the increased use of private cars.

The brands of the public transportation companies, showed more feasible analysis and therefore the results are more accurate and reliable, nevertheless, the comparison when analyzing how the public transport and the place branding collaborate, enlighten the debate argument of co-creation process among these two, once the users of the public transport ultimately are the users of the city in the most variable extent.

8.3. LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH

The bases of the conceptual framework that supports this research come from a multidisciplinary field, accounting with the marketing literature, to the social sciences, with little contribution of the spatial planning literature. For instance, one consistent name displayed along the work is Mihalis Kavaratzis, that has a background in business schools, and the same happens with Lucarelli cited here. Therefore, this represents the major limitation to this research, while represents its purpose to fill this gap.

The scope the dissertation follows is inevitably flawed with regards to concept limitations, and while the literature review focus on understanding the place branding, the chapters that follow bear the filling of this complex theoretical framework. Often the attempt in creating a methodology of analysis that aims in measuring concrete assets, still lead to intangible dimensions such as the identity, mainly due to lack of consensus in the literature and the abstract feature that comprises terms such as identity and image perceptions and representations.
With these regards, understanding the phenomenon of the place branding while overlook what can be understood as a brand in the first place from the business and corporate perspective, can be structured as the main limitation. Conversely, in attempts to conceptualize the branding framework concerns an isolated and dedicated work once the literature endures the same weight of intangibility and multidisciplinary.

Additionally, the analysis focusing on the official reports from the public authorities represents a limitation of the research, once this approach disregards other sources of information and data, eventually bias-free. The analysis conducted through official channels of communication represents a more distant approach to the case study, and while gives more confirmation through different examples, choose the quantity in favour of the in-depth analysis in this matter.

Considering the multilevel governance and how to understand the planning system is often a restraint to the research and the findings once the analysis whether presents the tendency to overlap or neglect the regional scope of the dimensions. While tackling important cities, inevitably, considers that the subject is included in a metropolitan area in the surroundings, and regarding the public reports, these considerations lie in the geographical scale, disregarded of the regulation and policy systems in place.

Afterwards the work lies in the reflection towards the comprehensive service of adjoining the spatial complexities into the place branding literature, it misses in conceptualize some terms that are broadly defined in the spatial field such as liveable spaces, and the broad spectrum of place-making in the practice. Therefore, the work can expand in depth accommodating the space for the literature expansion.
CONCLUSION

The rethinking of place branding represents an ongoing process among scholars, mainly due to the constant change and new assessments in case studies from the multidisciplinary field that undertakes this challenge. Through the face of new events to the grasping of the fast-paced advance of a specific place, the concept of place branding appeals to the complexities and nuances of the neoliberal agenda and the scope that public parties embody this approach.

As the progress of this work shows, the framework of place branding fails to regard the spatial and geographical scale (Kavaratzis and Ashworth, 2015; Oliveira, 2016), that is intrinsic with the meaning of place referred to in the concept. Therefore, this dissertation considers this approach when tackling the place branding, through the extension of using public transport as a tangible element to grasp the theoretical and subjective debate concerning the structure of social improvement. Correspondingly, there is a distinct contribution to the understanding and increasing relevance of public transport to urban society.

Through the former argument of the research gap, this work was aiming at fill, the literature review encompasses and focuses on the mechanism to implement the place branding, the case studies, and the social and political aspect of our society that structures this concept application. Since this gap is filled with mixed literature appropriations, the research revel, rather than a deterministic approach of a single path towards an understanding, a holistic view through a possible and feasible rethink of the hypothesis that considers an urban centrality the literature fails to address. Additionally, describing the social embeddedness that bringing the features of public transportation into the concept debate can strengthen.

Therefore, the research debate is not explored to depletion but rather expanded to possible ways of seeing the topic of matter. The literature constantly points to the relevance of place branding in shaping the globalized world, and past 20 or 10 years ago, the concept of place branding is more relevant as it is urgent in foreseeing the future of our cities, constantly being constructed through the digital innovations that regard the future and the access of services along with the action of the image perceptions in the baseline of the digital platforms.

As pointed by Hollands (2015) about the emergence of the corporate smart city, the debate of place branding is side blinded if developed regardless of the social implications in the structure of the city's identity. Through the analysis of the city of Sydney, the clear resistance in establishing an idea of a global city and protecting the cultural identity heritage, once new incomers are attracted to the place the more the place develops regardless of the inherent identity, lies in the process the literature refers as creative cities (Florida, 2004) and the inevitable gentrification process (Musterd and Kóvacs, 2010).
This relation shows the importance of a place branding practice that regards the placemaking and the provision of better infrastructure, deemed central to address the challenges the urban governance faces.

Regarding the urban governance, these works commit to shifting the context of the entrepreneurial administration, from neglecting the welfare distribution and focusing on the capital growth towards circumstances in which institutions have warned about the market inequalities in providing the welfare creation in countries that face great vulnerabilities. Considering that the environmental agenda needs to face in supranational dimensions, once the environmental problems disregard borders (BDSC, 2017). Therefore, is mandatory to shift the method from the sophisticated approach towards place branding, into an expanded debate that contributes to shaping the reputation and structure of the identity of people that use the spaces that are being branded.

There is a strong disparity in the capability in expansion the knowledge in the place branding literature, whereas focusing on the implementation of more sophisticated mechanism in northern Europe and North America, deepen the spread of uneven territories (Musterd and Kóvacs, 2013). However, this works to broaden the scope of the theory and the place reputation through the analysis of Medellín. Arguing that we must seek more in the place branding than the literal policies aiming to achieve the branding to produce mainstream and powerful logos and advertising campaigns.

Furthermore, there is more in the literature than creating logos and catchy slogans like “I love place x” or “discover place y”, the noticeable benefits in strategic place branding that considers the spatial aspect of the place and the social implications (Oliveira, 2016). And this works shows these benefits in the case studies, where a broad range of practices are encompassed, extending the conceptualization and the debate towards a more equitable place branding and more geospatial concerned (Kavaratzis and Ashworth, 2015).

Through the concept of creative cities and authorities that tried to implement these ideas, communities faced the conflict of newcomers combined with people who have already settle their life in that place, and even with the benefits in implementing the creative cities theory, there are significant considerations to bear, namely, the bottom-up approaches to avoid the gentrification undermining the existence and protection of the cultural identity. Therefore, this work confirms the amplification of the place branding concept through the development of bottom-up approaches considering the population inclusion, to stimulate socially responsible growth.

While shaping the framework of public transport inside the theoretical understanding, the research considers the feasibility and the potential in promoting public transport as an asset to the branding of places practices. Additionally, pointing the place branding aimed at long-term changes represents a shift from the practice-based almost on the anxiety of producing distinguishable assets and features, from the entrepreneurial feeling of innovating at all costs. Thus, the research presented in this work develops an assimilative attitude considering the surroundings as an element to grasp and strategically plan the branding approach for places.

9.1. SUGGESTION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

The considerations for future research demonstrate the contextual assimilation of the challenge face by the place of branding equity development. The presented research aimed at understanding the level of collaboration among place branding and public transport while rethink the scope of implementation, whereas strongly regarding the spatial effects of any attitude towards the concept.

The limitations of this research frame potentialities and opportunities for future development. Therefore, tackling the restraint of the literature review reveals the most critical point in engaging with the
suggestion for the future of the theory discussion, which is the definition of terms even if considering the different fields of built knowledge. Whenever the literature limits in to discuss the case studies analysis and enrich the uncertainties surrounded by the semantic and meanings, neglecting to provide elucidative information to the practice of the field.

Accordingly, the suggestions for future research encompass three different paths while expanding the discussion. The first regards the cover of definitions into the place branding, whether different rationales according to the field of study. While the second path respects the extension of the debate in articulation with the dynamics of the spatial environment, and ultimately the third path refers to the position that image and visual perceptions produce in the engagement with behavioural changes.

The first direction address the definition of the place branding based on the diverse perspectives, and disregarding the multifaceted conceptual bases, once the theory of place branding is being approached by different scientific journal dedicated to the subject, the suggestion is that the place branding should be incorporated in the urban journals in a manner to engage and expand the different possibilities to define the concept according to spatial planers, that will unavoidably differ in the perception and literature background of the theory for the business-focused journals. This process already happens in economic and political areas, that struggle towards definition, thus each appropriation takes the care of defining based on the perspective.

The second direction suggests the articulation with features of the place dynamics, considering the place as a geographical unity, therefore with the concept discussed in the previous chapter over the co-branding conceiving the capacity to expand the research in fields such as public spaces as a co-brand for the place branding, or the variety of features that help to shape places. The target industry of a nation acts in co-creation to the branding of the country and so forth.

Finally, the third path consists of taking the image and visual perception of the brand to grasps the interplay among the branding process and the progress of the smart cities. As digital platforms expand and evolves, the more the image perceptions keep taking space in the cities, therefore the suggestion goes to interpreting the relation of different image brands and how the public participate in the process of delivered image and the receive perception.

Additionally, the grasp of social media, like is already being the focus on the spectre of the research into the place branding, can contribute to the dependency of the image and values, originally from the concepts of corporate branding, into shaping the collective perception of people towards a city.

While considering the urban complexities comprised in the place branding, the research needs to expand towards these entanglements in the place branding implementation and theory. Once one of the limitations of this research was the lack of urban and spatial centrality in the debate. Whereas the investigation on the scope of MaaS, and the establishing of the corporate smart city needs to appropriate these scenarios of progress.
References


Alcadia de Medellín (2012) Proyecto de Acuerdo – Plan de Desarrollo “Medellín un hogar para la vida”.


Transport Reviews, 28(4), 529–547. https://doi.org/10.1080/01441640701817197


Metro de Medellín (2014) Plan Maestro 2006-2030 “Confianza em el futuro”. Publicación 7-2014. METRO. Available at: https://www.metrodemedellin.gov.co/qui%C3%A9n somos/informescorporativos


Pineda, L. Scheel, C. (2011) Plan de Ciencia, Tecnología e Innovación de Medellín – 2010. Ruta N. Available at:


